

## Reversibility of hydrolysis inhibition at high hydrogen partial pressure in dry anaerobic digestion processes fed with wheat straw and inoculated with anaerobic granular sludge

Elisabeth A. Cazier, Eric Trably, Jean-Philippe Steyer, Renaud Escudié

### ▶ To cite this version:

Elisabeth A. Cazier, Eric Trably, Jean-Philippe Steyer, Renaud Escudié. Reversibility of hydrolysis inhibition at high hydrogen partial pressure in dry anaerobic digestion processes fed with wheat straw and inoculated with anaerobic granular sludge. Waste Management, 2019, 85, pp.498-505. 10.1016/j.wasman.2019.01.019 . hal-02625415

## HAL Id: hal-02625415 https://hal.inrae.fr/hal-02625415v1

Submitted on 21 Oct 2021

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License

# Reversibility of hydrolysis inhibition at high hydrogen partial pressure in dry anaerobic digestion processes fed with wheat straw and inoculated with anaerobic

#### 3 granular sludge

4 Elisabeth A. Cazier, Eric Trably<sup>\*</sup>, Jean-Philippe Steyer, Renaud Escudie

5 LBE, Univ Montpellier, INRA, 102 avenue des Etangs, 11100, Narbonne, France

6 \*corresponding author: eric.trably@inra.fr; Phone: (+33)(0) 468 425 172

#### 7 Abstract

8 In dry anaerobic digestion (AD), methanogenic performances are lowered by high solid 9 contents. Low performances are often caused by a decrease of the gas-liquid transfer 10 kinetics leading to local accumulation of inhibitory by-products. Hydrogen was 11 previously identified as an inhibitor of hydrolytic and acetogenic microbial activities in 12 dry AD.  $CO_2$  is also generated but its impact on the microbial activity remains 13 unknown. In this study, the reversibility of dry AD inhibition by high H<sub>2</sub> partial 14 pressure ( $P_{H2}$  of 1 bar) was investigated by adding CO<sub>2</sub> (400 mbars) after 11 and 18 15 days of methanogenesis inhibition, in an AD process operated at 25% TS, using wheat 16 straw as substrate and inoculated with anaerobic granular sludge. As soon as  $CO_2$  was 17 added, the methanogenic activity rapidly recovered within 3 days, from  $0.41\pm0.1$  to 18  $3.77\pm0.8$  and then  $2.25\pm0.3$ , likely through the hydrogenotrophic pathway followed by 19 the acetoclastic pathway, respectively. This result was confirmed by the high abundance 20 of *Methanomicrobiales* (83%) and the emergence of *Methanosarcinales* sp (up to 17%) 21 within the methanogens. Furthermore, the recovery kinetics were impacted by the duration of the inhibition period suggesting a different impact of the high  $P_{H2}$  on hydrogenotrophic and acetoclastic methanogens.

24

#### 25 Keywords

Acidogenesis; Carbon dioxide; Gas transfer; Hydrogen; Solid-State Anaerobic
Digestion

#### 28 1 Introduction

29 In anaerobic digestion, the organic matter is converted by microorganisms into (1) a 30 biogas composed of  $CH_4$  and  $CO_2$ , and (2) a residual digestate that may be further used 31 as fertilizer if sanitary and environmental requirements are met. Three types of 32 anaerobic digestion (AD) processes are distinguished according to the operational 33 conditions: (1) the wet AD operated at a total solid content (TS) lower than 10%, (2) the 34 semi-dry AD at a TS content between 10 and 20 % and (3) the dry AD, also called 35 solid-state AD, at a TS content above 20% (Abbassi-Guendouz et al., 2012). Since less 36 water is required in dry AD, the digester size as well as the energy demand are both 37 minimized. Dry AD has gained lot of interest for industrial purposes and is now being 38 widely implemented for the treatment of agricultural and ligno-cellulosic residues.

In counterpart, dry AD technologies present several disadvantages due to their high TS content, such as a decrease of the AD performances with lower methane yields and some handling difficulties due to the high heterogeneity and viscosity of the substrate (Abbassi-Guendouz et al., 2012; Motte et al., 2013). When the TS content exceeds 30 %, the anaerobic digestion process can be rapidly blocked or even strongly inhibited

44 (Abbassi-Guendouz et al., 2012). Such inhibition phenomenon is characterized by a 45 decrease of the biogas production and an increase of the Volatile Fatty Acids (VFAs) 46 concentration (Abbassi-Guendouz et al., 2012; Motte et al., 2013). Indeed, the decrease 47 of the free available water at high TS content results in the reduction of mass transfer 48 kinetics of soluble molecules such as VFAs, or dissolved gases (Bollon et al., 2013). 49 Since dissolved gas diffusion and gas-liquid transfers become rapidly limiting, local 50 accumulation of these by-products can occur and lead to microbial local inhibition in 51 the bulk phase where microorganisms are active (Abbassi-Guendouz et al., 2012).

52 In particular, dissolved hydrogen accumulation rapidly makes the acetogenic reactions 53 thermodynamically unfavourable causing higher VFAs accumulation, a subsequent 54 decrease of the pH and finally methanogenesis inhibition (Guo et al., 2010). Under 55 anaerobic conditions, H<sub>2</sub> is produced by acidogenic bacteria and is immediately 56 consumed in combination with CO<sub>2</sub> by either homoacetogenic bacteria to produce 57 acetate, or hydrogenotrophs to produce methane (Amani et al., 2010). This latter 58 pathway represents about 30% of the CH<sub>4</sub> produced in anaerobic digestion (Amani et 59 al., 2010). All these reactions are reversible in the AD process where acetate oxidation 60 plays also a key role between methanogenic pathways (Karakashev et al., 2006). The 61 local H<sub>2</sub> partial pressure can transitorily increase but must remain low enough to avoid 62 inhibition of syntrophic acetogenic bacteria. When the hydrogen partial pressure  $(P_{H2})$  is 63 high, VFAs production increases, causing a decrease of the pH to lower value than 6 64 (Guo et al., 2010). Such variation in pH can impact biomass hydrolysis as well as the 65 following steps of acidogenesis and methanogenesis (Siegert and Banks, 2005; Veeken 66 et al., 2000). Indeed, the growth of methanogenic and acidogenic bacteria are strongly 67 affected by the pH (Luo and Angelidaki, 2013).

68 In addition, Cazier et al. (2015) reported that a high initial partial pressure of  $H_2$  in the 69 headspace was the main inhibitory factor affecting wheat straw hydrolysis in dry AD. It 70 was suggested that  $CO_2$  played a key role since  $H_2$  inhibition occurred only in absence 71 of remaining CO<sub>2</sub>. Indeed, hydrolysis inhibition did not occur when CO<sub>2</sub> was initially 72 present with H<sub>2</sub> in the reactor headspace. In that case, H<sub>2</sub> was rapidly consumed by 73 homoacetogenic bacteria and methanogens. When anaerobic digestion is efficiently 74 working, it can be assumed that  $CO_2$  and  $H_2$  are both biologically produced during 75 acidogenesis and acetogenesis and are continuously consumed by homoacetogenic 76 bacteria and methanogenic archaea. More CO<sub>2</sub> than H<sub>2</sub> is produced, the overall CO<sub>2</sub> 77 content ranging from 30 to 50% of the biogas.

78 However, the exact role of  $CO_2$  on the bacterial activity in AD remains unclear. On the 79 one hand, CO<sub>2</sub> has been reported as inhibitor of the production and degradation of 80 VFAs, as previously shown by Hansson and Molin (1979) and Arslan et al. (2012) who 81 worked on acetate and propionate accumulation at pH 7 and pH 4.5 and under 1 bar of 82  $CO_2$ , respectively. Consistently, it was elsewhere reported that an inhibitory impact of 83 CO<sub>2</sub> on acetogenic and lactic acid bacteria at pH 5.3 (Kim et al., 2006) and on 84 acetoclastic methanogens at pH 7 (Hansson and Molin, 1981). On the other hand, 85 acidogenesis and more particularly  $H_2$  production was shown to be improved by 86 sparging CO<sub>2</sub> before fermentation (at 30 to 300 ml<sub>CO2</sub>.min<sup>-1</sup>) (Bru et al., 2012; Kim et 87 al., 2006). Nonetheless, an inhibitory effect was observed when  $CO_2$  was sparged at higher rate (500 ml<sub>CO2</sub>.min<sup>-1</sup>) (Bru et al., 2012). In contrast, Park et al. (2005) reported 88 89 that fermentative  $H_2$  production was improved by removing the CO<sub>2</sub>. Since all 90 experiments were carried out under different operating conditions and different

91 microbial communities, concluding on the exact impact of CO<sub>2</sub> on the different AD
92 microbial activities remains unclear.

The aim of this study was to evaluate the impact of adding  $CO_2$  in mesophilic dry AD when methanogenesis was artificially inhibited by high initial H<sub>2</sub> partial pressure in headspace. Two inhibition durations (11 and 18 days) prior to  $CO_2$  injection were investigated to evaluate the persistence of the inhibitory effect on acidogenic and methanogenic populations.

#### 98 2 Materials and methods

#### 99 2.1 Substrate

Wheat straw (*Triticum aestivum*) was used as substrate. After harvest and collection, wheat straw was fractionated using a cutting miller through a 1 mm grid, and then sieved to collect particles having a size between 400 µm and 1 mm. The TS content of the wheat straw particles was 95%.

#### 104 2.2 Operating conditions of the batch tests

105 Industrial UASB anaerobic granules were used to inoculate the batch reactors. The 106 granules were manually broken and mixed during 24 h at 35°C, and were then centrifuged (7 841 g, 20 min, and 4°C) to obtain a homogeneous anaerobic inoculum. 107 108 The TS content of the inoculum ranged between 10 and 15 %. The substrate/inoculum 109 ratio was fixed at 3 (on basis of the volatile solid contents) (Liew et al., 2012). A buffer solution of sodium bicarbonate (0.0026 g of NaHCO<sub>3.g</sub><sup>-1</sup> of substrate) was used to keep 110 111 the pH at 8 all along the experiment (data not shown). A solution of trace elements (FeCl<sub>2</sub> 2 g·L<sup>-1</sup>, CoCl<sub>2</sub> 0.5 g·L<sup>-1</sup>, MnCl<sub>2</sub> 0.1 g·L<sup>-1</sup>, NiCl<sub>2</sub> 0.1 g·L<sup>-1</sup>, ZnCl<sub>2</sub> 0.05 g·L<sup>-1</sup>, 112

H<sub>3</sub>BO<sub>3</sub> 0.05 g·L<sup>-1</sup>, Na<sub>2</sub>SeO<sub>3</sub> 0.05 g·L<sup>-1</sup>, CuCl<sub>2</sub> 0.04 g·L<sup>-1</sup>, Na<sub>2</sub>MoO<sub>4</sub> 0.01 g·L<sup>-1</sup>) was added (0.2 mL by flask) at start of the experiment, using the same protocol than Cazier et al. (2015). Initial TS content of the mixture (inoculum, wheat straw, sodium bicarbonate solution and trace elements) was fixed at 25% corresponding to the maximal TS value where no inhibitory effect was observed in dry AD (Abbassi-Guendouz et al., 2012; Motte et al., 2013)and to only investigate the reversibility of the inhibition only caused by high hydrogen partial pressure (Cazier et al. (2015)).

120 First, the mixture was introduced into a reactor with a working volume of 3 L operated 121 during 10 days at  $35^{\circ}$ C under N<sub>2</sub> atmosphere to reach an active phase of 122 methanogenesis and homogenize the substrate/inoculum medium. Then, 20 g of this 123 pre-culture was put into the bottom of a 600 ml flask, which corresponded to a thin 124 layer of less than 1 cm of substrate to limit the influence of the gas diffusion in the 125 medium. The flasks were initially flushed with N2 gas. Hydrogen was then added to 126 reach an initial H<sub>2</sub> partial pressure of 996  $\pm$  27 mbars, under a total pressure of 1 500 127 mbars. A control, with only  $N_2$  in headspace, was also carried out. All the flasks were 128 then incubated at 35°C for 32 days. In some of the flasks filled with hydrogen,  $396 \pm 44$ 129 mbars of CO<sub>2</sub> were added after 11 and 18 days of operation. Batch tests were carried out 130 in triplicates for each condition. Flasks were sampled at day 0, 11, 18, 25 and 32 for 131 further analysis of fermentative metabolite concentrations.

132 2.3 Analytical methods

Biogas production volume was periodically estimated by measuring the total pressure and the biogas composition. The gas composition was determined using a gas chromatograph Perkin Clarus 580 composed of an injector heated at 250°C and two capillary columns heated at 60°C. The first column corresponded to an RtUbond for the 137 CO<sub>2</sub> and the second column an RtMolsieve used for the detection of the O<sub>2</sub>, H<sub>2</sub>, N<sub>2</sub> and 138 CH<sub>4</sub>. The carrier gas was argon at 350 kPa and under a flowrate of 31.8 ml.min<sup>-1</sup>. The 139 detection was ensured by a thermal conductivity detector kept at  $150^{\circ}$ C.

140 Metabolites were quantified by diluting 5 g of digestate in 20 g of deionized water for 141 30 minutes. The mixture was then centrifuged during 20 min at 39 121 g and 4°C and 142 filtrated at 0.2 µm with a nylon membrane using the same protocol than Cazier et al. 143 (2015). VFAs were measured with a gas chromatograph Perkin Clarus 580 equipped 144 with an Elite-FFAP crossbond® carbowax® 15 m column connected to a flame 145 ionization detector at 280°C. Nitrogen was used as carrier gas under a flow rate of 6 146 mL.min<sup>-1</sup> (Motte et al., 2013). Other metabolites than VFAs were quantified using high 147 performance liquid chromatograph, e.g. lactic acid and ethanol. The chromatograph was 148 composed of an automatic sampler (Water 717), a pre-column to filter residues (Micro 149 guard cation H refill cartridges, Bio-Rad) and an Aminex HPX-87H column (300 mm 150 on 7.8 mm, Bio-Rad). The carrier eluent was a sulfuric acid solution at 0.005 M under a fixed flowrate of 0.4 ml.min<sup>-1</sup>. 151

The microbial communities of *Archaea* and *Bacteria* were characterized after DNA extraction and amplification of the V3 region of the 16S rRNA according to the protocols of Braun et al. (2011) and Bru et al. (2012).

The PCR products were purified and sequenced, using the Illumina MiSeq System with 2x300 bp paired-end chemistry used at the GenoToul sequencing centre (www.genotoul.fr). An average of 46 021 high quality sequences per sample for *Archaea* and for *Bacteria* were retained after assembly, de-multiplexing and cleaning with Mothur software version 1.33.2, as described by Schloss et al. (2009). SILVA

release 102 was used for alignment and taxonomic affiliation. Sequences are registered
on NCBI database under the accession numbers KY229870 to KY229893 for archaea,
and KY234504 – KY235143 for bacteria.

163 2.4 Data analysis

R software (version 2.15.2) coupled with the package Rcmdr (version 1.8-4) was used
for statistical analysis of the experimental data, using variance analysis (ANOVA).
Non-significant p-values were fixed > 0.05 and significant p-values were fixed when <</li>
0.05.

Total Substrate Degradation (TSD) was estimated from a theoretical Chemical Oxygen Demand (COD) mass balance between the start-up and the end of each experiment, as described elsewhere (Cazier et al., 2015). All calculation was expressed according to the initial TS content of wheat straw (TSi expressed in grams of dry solids), as follows:

172 TSD = Final State – Initial State = 
$$\frac{A_{H_2,f} + A_{CH_4,f} + A_{met,f} + A_{GC}}{TSi} - \frac{A_{H_2,i} + A_{met,i}}{TSi}$$
 (Eq.1)

173 where,  $A_{H_2,f}$  is the amount of  $H_2$  remaining at the end in the headspace,  $A_{CH_4,f}$  the final 174 amount of accumulated CH<sub>4</sub>,  $A_{met,f}$  the final amount of metabolic products,  $A_{GC}$  the 175 total amount of gas (H<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub>) sampled for analyses,  $A_{H_2,i}$  the initial amount of H<sub>2</sub> 176 added and  $A_{met,i}$  the initial amount of metabolites in the medium. Since all these 177 parameters are expressed in grams of COD, TSD corresponded to gram of COD per 178 gram of initial TS of wheat straw.

#### 179 **3** Results and discussion

#### 180 3.1 Recovery of the methanogenic activity after CO<sub>2</sub> addition

Figure 1.a shows the cumulated production of  $CH_4$  along reactor operation time. For the reactors carried out at high initial  $P_{H_2}$  and, thus, operated under inhibitory conditions, CO<sub>2</sub> was added after 11 and 18 days of operation. The control corresponds to a reactor without initial addition of  $H_2$  in headspace.

185 In the control reactor, a maximal and constant CH<sub>4</sub> production rate was observed after a lag phase of 5 days and reached a value of  $2.7 \pm 0.32 \text{ ml}_{\text{CH4}} \cdot \text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1} \cdot \text{day}^{-1}$ , equivalent to 186 2.98 ml<sub>CH4</sub>·gys<sup>-1</sup>·day<sup>-1</sup>. This result is significantly lower than previous reported values 187 of 12 ml<sub>CH4</sub>.gvs<sup>-1</sup>·day<sup>-1</sup> for wheat straw at 22% TS (Liew et al., 2012). Such difference 188 189 resulted either from different microbial inoculum origins or from a TS content slightly 190 higher in the present experiment (25% TS), considering that 28-30 % TS was previously 191 reported as a threshold value prior inhibition of the methanogenic and acidogenic 192 microbial activities (Abbassi-Guendouz et al. 2012; Motte et al. 2013).

193 In the reactors where  $H_2$  was initially added, a small quantity of  $CH_4$  accumulated the 194 first day of experiment at low production rates of  $0.96 \pm 0.52$  and  $0.96 \pm 0.42$  ml<sub>CH4</sub>·grs<sup>-</sup> 195  $^{1}$ ·day<sup>-1</sup> (Table 1): this production rates correspond to the mean values of the triplicates 196 used to evaluate the addition of CO<sub>2</sub> after 11 and 18 days of inhibition, respectively. 197 Thereafter, CH<sub>4</sub> production was strongly inhibited due to the presence of high partial 198 pressure of H<sub>2</sub> in the headspace, with average production rates of only 0.45  $\pm$  0.1 and  $0.38 \pm 0.1 \text{ ml}_{CH4} \cdot g_{TS}^{-1} \cdot day^{-1}$ . In comparison, the control (only N<sub>2</sub>) showed a methane 199 production rate ten times higher at  $2.7 \pm 0.3 \text{ ml}_{\text{CH4}} \cdot \text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1} \cdot \text{day}^{-1}$  for the same experimental 200 201 time. Consequently, the amounts of cumulated methane after 11 and 18 days reached only  $4 \pm 0.5$  and  $6 \pm 1 \text{ ml}_{\text{CH4}} \cdot \text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1}$  in the inhibited reactors against  $20 \pm 4$  and  $39 \pm 4$ ml<sub>CH4</sub> · g<sub>TS</sub><sup>-1</sup> in the controls, respectively. It was concluded that methanogenesis was clearly inhibited in presence of high initial H<sub>2</sub> partial pressure in headspace (996 ± 27 mbars). The corresponding concentration of dissolved H<sub>2</sub> in the medium at 35°C was estimated at  $0.58 \pm 5 \times 10^{-2} \text{ mg}_{\text{H2}} \cdot \text{L}^{-1}$ . Consistently, a similar value was reported as a threshold H<sub>2</sub> concentration prior to wheat straw hydrolysis inhibition in AD by Cazier et al. (2015).

209 When  $CO_2$  was added in reactor headspace, the methane rapidly accumulated within the first 3 days to reach values of  $12 \pm 1$  and  $10 \pm 2 \text{ ml}_{CH4} \cdot \text{g}_{TS}^{-1}$  in the reactors where CO<sub>2</sub> 210 211 was added at day 11 and 18, respectively. This first phase of CH<sub>4</sub> production was called 212 "phase 1", as shown in Figure 1.b. During phase 1, H<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> were both rapidly 213 consumed until total exhaustion of  $H_2$  in headspace (data not shown). No significant 214 acetate accumulation was observed during the first 7 days after CO<sub>2</sub> addition (Figure 2). 215 It was therefore concluded that  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$  were most likely consumed by 216 hydrogenotrophic methanogens to produce CH<sub>4</sub>. Consistently, methane production rates in phase 1 were higher than in the controls, with 4  $\pm$  0.75  $ml_{CH4} \cdot g_{TS}{}^{-1} \cdot day^{-1}$  and 3.55  $\pm$ 217  $0.87 \text{ ml}_{\text{CH4}} \cdot \text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1}$ .day<sup>-1</sup> for CO<sub>2</sub> added at day 11 and 18, respectively, versus an average 218 value of  $2.7 \pm 0.3 \text{ ml}_{\text{CH4.g}_{\text{TS}}}^{-1}$ .day<sup>-1</sup> in the controls (Table 1). Such observation strongly 219 220 supports the fact that efficient hydrogenotrophic methanogenesis was the main 221 methanogenic pathway during phase 1. Moreover, the methanogenic activity recovered 222 immediately after CO<sub>2</sub> addition, suggesting that hydrogenotrophic methanogens were not inhibited at high  $P_{H2}$ , at least during the first 18 days. This is consistent with 223 224 previous observations where the production of  $CH_4$  by hydrogenotrophic methanogens

was previously shown to be favoured at high  $P_{H2}$  (> 5 mbars) in anaerobic digestion systems (Demirel and Scherer, 2008; Schink, 1997).

227 After phase 1, a phase of 4 days, called 'plateau', was observed with only a small 228 amount of  $CH_4$  that accumulated whatever the time of  $CO_2$  addition (Figure 1.b). The 229 CH<sub>4</sub> production rate during the plateau phase was very low, *i.e.*  $0.82 \pm 0.26$  and  $0.41 \pm$ 0.27 ml<sub>CH4</sub>· $g_{TS}^{-1}$ ·day<sup>-1</sup> when the CO<sub>2</sub> was added at 11 and 18 days respectively (Table 230 231 1). Since no H<sub>2</sub> was present in headspace, this plateau phase corresponded probably to 232 the time for the microbial community to readapt to favourable conditions for substrate 233 degradation, as initially observed in the control, i.e. a lag phase of 4 days at the start of 234 the experiment.

235 Afterwards, methane production increased to reach a cumulated methane yield of  $16 \pm 1$  $ml_{CH4} \cdot g_{TS}^{-1}$  and  $11 \pm 3 ml_{CH4} \cdot g_{TS}^{-1}$  in 7 days, when CO<sub>2</sub> was added at day 11 and 18, 236 237 respectively. This second production phase was denominated 'phase 2' (Figure 1.b). In 238 phase 2, the methane production rates decreased by half when compared to phase 1 (Table 1), with 2.74  $\pm$  0.45 and 1.61  $\pm$  0.23 ml<sub>CH4</sub>·g<sub>TS</sub><sup>-1</sup>.day<sup>-1</sup> when the CO<sub>2</sub> was added 239 240 at 11 and 18 days respectively. Since the CH<sub>4</sub> production rates were substantially 241 different during for the first and second phase, two different methanogenic pathways 242 were likely involved. Indeed, it is well established that hydrogenotrophic 243 methanogenesis is faster than the acetoclastic methane producing pathway (Pan et al., 244 2016). While  $CH_4$  production in phase 1 seemed to be mainly due to hydrogenotrophic 245 methanogens, methanogenesis was most probably resulting from the degradation of 246 acetate by acetoclastic methanogens in phase 2 (Demirel and Scherer, 2008).

Interestingly, CH<sub>4</sub> production rates were slightly higher when CO<sub>2</sub> was added after 11 days of inhibition ( $4 \pm 0.75$  and  $2.74 \pm 0.45 \text{ ml}_{CH4} \cdot \text{g}_{TS}^{-1} \cdot \text{day}^{-1}$  for phases 1 and 2, respectively) than 18 days ( $3.55 \pm 0.87$  and  $1.77 \pm 0.23 \text{ ml}_{CH4} \cdot \text{g}_{TS}^{-1} \cdot \text{day}^{-1}$  for phases 1 and 2, respectively). Such a difference suggests a cumulative inhibitory effect of the time of exposure to H<sub>2</sub> on both hydrogenotrophic and acetoclastic methanogens.

#### 252 3.2 Impact of the $P_{H2}$ on other metabolic by-products dynamics

Figure 2 presents the accumulation of metabolic by-products (VFAs and methane), the remaining hydrogen in the controls and in the reactors carried out with high initial  $P_{H2}$ . In the controls, microbial metabolites, *i.e.* all VFAs, formate, succinate, and ethanol, transitorily accumulated after 11 and 18 days of operation ( $35 \pm 2$  and  $39 \pm 5$ mg<sub>COD</sub>.g<sub>TS</sub><sup>-1</sup> at day 11 and 18, respectively) likely because of the high TS content, and then decreased to  $7 \pm 2$  mg<sub>COD</sub>.g<sub>TS</sub><sup>-1</sup> at day 32, confirming the efficient methanogenic activity even at 25% TS.

In comparison, the amount of metabolites was higher in the reactors where H<sub>2</sub> was 260 initially added. The concentrations of metabolites reached  $58 \pm 5 \text{ mg}_{\text{COD}}.\text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1}$  at day 11 261 and  $82 \pm 17 \text{ mg}_{\text{COD}} \cdot \text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1}$  at day 18 prior to CO<sub>2</sub> addition (Figure 2). These values 262 corresponded to a total concentration in metabolites of about  $20 \pm 2$  g·L<sup>-1</sup> at day 11, and 263  $28 \pm 6 \text{ g} \cdot \text{L}^{-1}$  at day 18, respectively. Such value is above the inhibitory limit of 20 g  $\cdot \text{L}^{-1}$ 264 as previously reported in wet AD processes (Siegert and Banks, 2005). Interestingly, 265 most of the hydrogen consumed at day 11 and at day 18 (69  $\pm$  2 mg<sub>COD</sub>.g<sub>TS</sub><sup>-1</sup> and 72  $\pm$  2 266  $mg_{COD}.g_{TS}^{-1}$ ) corresponds to the concentration of produced metabolites (51 ± 2 267  $mg_{COD}$ . $g_{TS}^{-1}$  and 75 ± 17  $mg_{COD}$ . $g_{TS}^{-1}$  at day 11 and 18 prior to CO<sub>2</sub> addition, 268 269 respectively=. The small difference at day 11 between the hydrogen recoveries into metabolites (18  $mg_{COD}$ . $g_{TS}^{-1}$ ) could correspond to the methane produced during this time 270

271  $(17.5 \pm 4 \text{ mg}_{\text{COD}}.\text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1})$ . Such high concentration of metabolites might have been the 272 cause of the strong inhibition of methanogenic activity at high  $P_{H2}$ , prior to CO<sub>2</sub> 273 addition. Since VFAs did not accumulate during this period, it can also be concluded 274 that hydrolysis and/or acidogenesis may also have been inhibited under these 275 conditions, prior to CO<sub>2</sub> addition, as previously reported by Cazier et al. (2015).

276 Furthermore, the increase in the total amount of metabolites at high initial  $P_{H2}$  was 277 mostly due to an increase of acetate, and, at a lower extent, butyrate and isobutyrate. The acetate concentration increased from  $2 \pm 0 \text{ mg}_{\text{COD}} \cdot \text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1}$  to  $35 \pm 4 \text{ mg}_{\text{COD}} \cdot \text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1}$  at 278 day 11 and 43  $\pm$  11 mg<sub>COD</sub>·g<sub>TS</sub><sup>-1</sup> at day 18, prior to CO<sub>2</sub> addition. Meanwhile, the 279 butyrate and isobutyrate concentration increased from  $1.7 \pm 0 \text{ mg}_{\text{COD}} \cdot \text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1}$  at start to  $9 \pm$ 280  $0.2 \text{ mg}_{\text{COD}} \cdot \text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1}$  and  $18 \pm 4 \text{ mg}_{\text{COD}} \cdot \text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1}$  at day 11 and 18, respectively. Such increase of 281 282 acetate and butyrate concentrations under an atmosphere rich in H<sub>2</sub> was previously 283 observed during the anaerobic conversion of carbohydrates-rich wastes (Arslan et al., 284 2012). These authors reported an increase of 31% and 51% of acetate and butyrate 285 production, respectively, under a  $P_{H2}$  of 2 bars in comparison to only N<sub>2</sub>.

When  $CO_2$  was added after 11 days of inhibition, no metabolite degradation was observed during the first 7 days after  $CO_2$  addition (phase 1), confirming the assumption of a dominant hydrogenotrophic pathway producing methane (Figure 2). The decrease of the total COD concentration between the day of addition of  $CO_2$  (day 11) and 7 days after, was probably due to the fact that the analysis of metabolites and acetate was only done in one sacrificed replicate and not all replicates. Therefore, ANOVA was used to statistically compare the results for each. 293 7 days after CO<sub>2</sub> addition, a decrease of the total metabolites concentration was 294 observed, and was mostly due to acetate consumption. This observation is consistent 295 with the recovery of the methanogenic activity. The acetate content decreased from  $33 \pm$ 2.4 mg<sub>COD</sub>.g<sub>TS</sub><sup>-1</sup> to 8  $\pm$  6 mg<sub>COD</sub>·g<sub>TS</sub><sup>-1</sup> between day 7 and 14, respectively. Such 296 297 difference between the acetate concentration at day 0 and 14 after  $CO_2$  addition was 298 statistically significant (ANOVA, p-value <0.05). The decrease of acetate concentration 299 was likely due to the conversion of acetate into CH<sub>4</sub> by acetoclastic methanogens 300 (Pavlostathis and Giraldo-Gomez, 1991) or to the oxidation of acetate by acetate-301 oxidizing bacteria into  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$  that are then converted to  $CH_4$  by hydrogenotrophic 302 methanogens (Karakashev et al., 2006). A similar trend was observed when  $CO_2$  was 303 added after 18 days with an acetate content that decreased from  $30 \pm 10 \text{ mg}_{\text{COD}} \cdot \text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1}$  at 304 day 7 to  $18 \pm 3 \text{ mg}_{\text{COD}} \cdot \text{g}_{\text{TS}}^{-1}$  at day 14 (Figure 2). Interestingly, acetate degradation from 305 day 7 to 14 (phase 2) was slower when CO<sub>2</sub> was added after 18 days of inhibition. This 306 result was likely due to the time of exposure of acetate-degrading methanogens at high 307  $H_2$  partial pressure. In other studies, a specific inhibitory effect was observed on the 308 growth of *Methanosarcina* sp. when  $H_2$  partial pressure was increased from 2.5 to 20 309 mbars and a specific effect on acetate degradation was observed (Ahring et al., 1991). 310 Such observation is also supporting the fact that hydrogenotrophic methanogens were 311 most probably the most efficient  $CH_4$  producers in phase 1 since no significant 312 difference between the two times of exposure.

#### 313 3.3 Impact of the $P_{H2}$ on the overall substrate degradation

To estimate the impact of the  $P_{H2}$  on the global microbial activity, the overall substrate degradation was calculated in mg<sub>COD</sub>·g<sub>TS</sub><sup>-1</sup> using Equation 1, which takes in consideration the amount of H<sub>2</sub> initially added (Figure 3). 317 In the reactors where  $CO_2$  was added at day 11 or day 18, the substrate degradation was very similar 14 days after CO\_2 addition, with 55  $\pm$  9  $mg_{COD} \cdot g_{TS} ^{-1}$  and 54  $\pm$  17 318  $mg_{COD} \cdot g_{TS}^{-1}$ , respectively. Therefore, the impact of the time exposure on the methane 319 320 production rate in phase 2, was probably not due to a persistent effect on the global 321 microbial activity since the overall substrate degradation was the same after 14 days, but 322 more likely to a transitory accumulation of metabolites due to a slower methanogenic 323 activity, as shown in Figure 2. Nevertheless, when comparing these values to the 324 control, the global substrate degradation was lower in the reactors operated at high initial  $P_{H2}$  for a close duration of operation. About 80 ± 5 mg<sub>COD</sub>·g<sub>TS</sub><sup>-1</sup> were reached at 325 day 11 in the control that is substantially higher than in inhibited reactors. All these 326 observations suggest that the high initial  $P_{H2}$  had very likely a persistent inhibitory 327 328 effect on the hydrolytic activity of the consortium.

329

330 The exact mechanisms behind microbial hydrolysis are still uncertain and probably 331 highly diverse when considering complex substrates. Two main mechanisms have been 332 proposed in the AD model (ADM1): (1) the enzymes are directly secreted into the 333 liquid phase by hydrolytic microorganisms with a direct effect on substrate hydrolysis 334 that releases free sugars on the bulk phase or (2) the microorganisms attach on the substrate surface with the formation of a biofilm and produce enzymatic complexes to 335 336 disrupt the organic material (Batstone et al., 2002). Recently, Cazier et al. (2015) 337 reported an initial a strong inhibitory effect of high  $P_{H2}$  on the hydrolytic activity in dry 338 AD. High  $P_{H2}$  could have either influenced the production or secretion of extracellular 339 enzymes by retro-inhibition, or reduced the physiological activity of the 340 microorganisms. Similarly to the present study, these experiments were carried out with

341 thin layer of substrate to reduce gas transfer limitation and investigate the local effect of 342 H<sub>2</sub> partial pressure. In dry AD reactors, the effect of gas transfer limitation must also to 343 be considered. Since diffusion coefficients decrease when TS contents increase (Bollon 344 et al., 2013), dissolved gas diffusion and gas-liquid transfer may become a limiting 345 factor (Abbassi-Guendouz et al., 2012), with a local accumulation of  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$  in the 346 medium. With a substrate rich in carbohydrates and at high TS content, hydrolysis and 347 acidogenesis is highly favoured with a rapid production of VFAs,  $CO_2$  and  $H_2$ . That 348 could lead to a local accumulation of  $H_2$  since  $CO_2$  could be dissolved in carbonates at 349 high pH. Therefore, if the local  $P_{H2}$  is high enough, hydrolysis may therefore be 350 inhibited, especially if the local  $P_{H2}$  is low. The results of the present study suggest that 351 the addition of CO<sub>2</sub> in dry AD digester may improve the methanogenic performances 352 not only by increasing the gas-transfer kinetics, but also by reducing the local  $P_{H2}$ 353 through  $H_2$  consumption. Adding  $CO_2$  may also present inhibitory effects on AD 354 performances if the medium is not properly buffered since CO<sub>2</sub> could decrease the pH 355 down to 6 that has a strong inhibitory effect on methanogens (Ward et al., 2008). 356 However, this is unlikely to occur since tests operated under similar conditions with 357 only  $CO_2$  added in headspace (no  $H_2$ ) were carried out and no impact on dry AD 358 performances was observed (data not shown).

#### 359 3.4 Impact of the $P_{H2}$ on microbial community dynamics

360 The compositions in *Archaea* and *Bacteria* of the microbial communities were 361 determined in the control reactor, and in the reactors containing a high  $P_{H2}$  before CO<sub>2</sub> 362 addition, and 7 days (end of 'plateau' phase) and 14 days (end of phase 2) after CO<sub>2</sub> 363 addition (Table 2). 364 First, the composition in Archaea in the inoculum (day 0) was mainly dominated by 365 hydrogenotrophic methanogens (Methanobacteriales: 91.6%) followed by mostly acetoclastic methanogens (Methanosarcinales: 5.8%), as already described by Amani et 366 367 al. (2010). Interestingly, in the control, the relative proportion of acetoclastic methanogens increased over the experimental time to reach 17 % after 18 days. Such 368 369 variation in the type of methanogens was already reported in dry AD (31% TS) during 370 the start-up period followed by a stabilization period, for a semi-continuous 371 thermophilic reactor treating the organic fraction of municipal solid waste (Montero et 372 al. 2008). A higher proportion in *Methanosarcinales* sp. might indicate that an efficient 373 microbial process occurred in the controls, as previously suggested in dry AD by 374 Abbassi-Guendouz (2013).

In the reactor where  $CO_2$  was added at day 11, the overall composition of the archaeal 375 376 community did not significantly change. Indeed, the microbial community was 377 composed of 90-91% Methanobacteriales and only 6-8% Methanosarcinales all along 378 the experiment. Since hydrogenotrophic methanogens (Methanobacteria sp. and several 379 Methanosarcina sp.) were present in much higher concentration that acetoclastic 380 methanogens (Methanosarcina sp. only), hydrogenotrophic CH<sub>4</sub> production from H<sub>2</sub> 381 and  $CO_2$  was likely more efficient than from acetate. Such microbial community 382 structure is in accordance with an absence of acetate accumulation during the first 7 383 days after  $CO_2$  addition. After a time between 7 and 14 days necessary to reactivate 384 acetotrophic pathways by *Methanosarcinales*, a subsequent decrease of acetate 385 concentration was observed.

386 In comparison, the composition of the archaeal community was significantly different 387 when  $CO_2$  was added at day 18 (Table 2). In that case, the percentage of 388 Methanosarcinales amongst Archaea was not only initially higher but also increased 389 from 12% to 17% at the end of the experiment. This result suggests that  $CH_4$  production 390 from acetate was most probably higher when  $CO_2$  was added after 18 days than after 11 391 days. As reported elsewhere, acetate metabolism in Methanosarcinales starts to be 392 inhibited with only 2.5 mbars of  $H_2$  (Ahring et al., 1991). Therefore, a higher 393 composition in *Methanosarcinales* supports a higher persistence of the inhibitory effect 394 of the initial high  $P_{H2}$ . Nonetheless the final increase in *Methanosarcinales* relative 395 abundance might indicate a recovery of efficient methanogenesis in these conditions.

396 Characterization of the bacterial community showed clear differences between control 397 reactors and inhibited reactors (either 11 or 18 days). Although all other clusters of 398 bacteria remained in similar proportion, the relative abundance of *Clostridiales* 399 increased in inhibited reactors at a similar extent from 30-31% to 40-42% during the 400 first 7 days after  $CO_2$  addition. Meanwhile, the proportion of *Bacteroidales* decreased 401 from 24-32% to 19-21% in inhibited reactors even though their relative abundance 402 reached up to 47% after 18 days in the control. Since many members of *Clostridiales* are involved in hydrolytic and acidogenic activities in AD, a reactivation of the 403 404 hydrolytic activity after  $H_2$  inhibition seemed have to be carried out by members of the 405 Clostridiales order. The imbalance between Bacteroidales and Clostridiales orders 406 might have resulted from a differential sensitivity to inhibitor exposure. Consistently, 407 Abbassi-Guendouz et al. (2013) reported a *Clostridium* sp. enrichment when dry AD of 408 cardboard was inhibited by metabolite accumulation suggesting a higher resistance of 409 these microorganisms to detrimental conditions of growth (low pH, high  $P_{H2}$ ).

#### 410 **4** Conclusion

411 In this study, inhibition of dry AD at high initial  $H_2$  partial pressure was found to be 412 reversible by adding  $CO_2$  whatever the time of exposition to  $H_2$ . The reversibility 413 occurred in two steps, with a very probable first consumption of H<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> by 414 hydrogenotrophic methanogens followed by acetoclastic methanogen. Methanogenic 415 performances depended then on the time of exposure to high  $P_{H2}$  with a persistent 416 impact on AD kinetics. These results suggest that injecting CO<sub>2</sub> may represent a 417 solution to improve solid-state AD at high TS content by avoiding local inhibition of 418  $H_2$ .

419

#### 420 Acknowledgements

We thank Gaëlle Gevaudan for the technical assistance with the microbial analysis ofthe experiments.

This work was supported by the French Environment and Energy Management Agency
(ADEME) and the French Institute for Agricultural and Food Research (INRA), by
funding EA Cazier's PhD.

#### 426 **5 References**

- 427 Abbassi-Guendouz, A., Brockmann, D., Trably, E., Dumas, C., Delgénes, J.-P., Steyer,
- 428 J.-P., Escudié, R., 2012. Total solids content drives high solid anaerobic digestion
- 429 via mass transfer limitation. *Bioresour. Technol.* 111, 55–61.

430	Ahring, B.K., Westermann, P., Mah, R.A., 1991. Hydrogen inhibition of ace	tate
431	metabolism and kinetics of hydrogen consumption by Methanosard	cina
432	thermophila TM-1. Arch. Microbiol. 157, 38–42.	

- Amani, T., Nosrati, M., Sreekrishnan, T., 2010. Anaerobic digestion from the viewpoint
  of microbiological, chemical, and operational aspects a review. *Environ. Rev.*18, 255–278.
- 436 Arslan, D., Steinbusch, K.J.J., Diels, L., De Wever, H., Buisman, C.J.N., Hamelers,
- H.V.M., 2012. Effect of hydrogen and carbon dioxide on carboxylic acids patterns
  in mixed culture fermentation. *Bioresour. Technol.* 118, 227–34.
- 439 Batstone, D.J., Keller, J., Angelidaki, I., Kalyuzhnyi, S. V, Pavlostathis, S.G., Rozzi, A.,
- 440 Sanders, W.T.M., Siegrist, H., Vavilin, V. a, 2002. The IWA Anaerobic Digestion

441 Model No 1 (ADM1). Water Sci. Technol. 45, 65–73.

- Bollon, J., Benbelkacem, H., Gourdon, R., Buffière, P., 2013. Measurement of diffusion
  coefficients in dry anaerobic digestion media. *Chem. Eng. Sci.* 89, 115–119.
- Braun, F., Hamelin, J., Gévaudan, G., Patureau, D., 2011. Development and application
  of an enzymatic and cell flotation treatment for the recovery of viable microbial
  cells from environmental matrices such as anaerobic sludge. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 77, 8487–93.
- 448 Bru, K., Blazy, V., Joulian, C., Trably, E., Latrille, E., Quéméneur, M., Dictor, M.-C.,
- 449 2012. Innovative CO2 pretreatment for enhancing biohydrogen production from

- the organic fraction of municipal solid waste (OFMSW). *Int. J. Hydrogen Energy*37, 14062–14071.
- 452 Cazier, E.A., Trably, E., Steyer, J.P., Escudié, R., 2015. Biomass hydrolysis inhibition
  453 at high hydrogen partial pressure in solid-state anaerobic digestion. *Bioresour*.
  454 *Technol.* 190, 106–113.
- 455 Demirel, B., Scherer, P., 2008. The roles of acetotrophic and hydrogenotrophic
  456 methanogens during anaerobic conversion of biomass to methane: A review. *Rev.*457 *Environ. Sci. Biotechnol.* 7, 173–190.
- Guo, X.M., Trably, E., Latrille, E., Carrère, H., Steyer, J.-P., 2010. Hydrogen
  production from agricultural waste by dark fermentation: A review. *Int. J. Hydrogen Energy* 35, 10660–10673.
- 461 Hansson, G., Molin, N., 1981. End product inhibition in methane fermentations: effects
  462 of carbon dioxide on fermentative and acetogenic bacteria. *Eur. J. Appl. Microbiol.*463 *Biotechnol* 13, 242–247.
- Karakashev, D., Batstone, D.J., Trably, E., Angelidaki, I., 2006. Acetate oxidation is the
  dominant methanogenic pathway from acetate in the absence of *Methanosaetaceae*. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 72, 5138–41.
- Kim, D., Han, S., Kim, S., Shin, H., 2006. Effect of gas sparging on continuous
  fermentative hydrogen production. *Int. J. Hydrogen Energy* 31, 2158–2169.
- Liew, L.N., Shi, J., Li, Y., 2012. Methane production from solid-state anaerobic
  digestion of lignocellulosic biomass. *Biomass and Bioenergy* 46, 125-132.

471	Luo, G., Angelidaki, I., 2013. Co-digestion of manure and whey for in situ biogas
472	upgrading by the addition of H2: process performance and microbial insights.
473	Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 97, 1373–81.

- 474 Motte, J.-C., Escudié, R., Bernet, N., Delgénes, J.-P., Steyer, J.-P.P., Dumas, C.,
- 475 Delgenes, J.-P.P., Steyer, J.-P.P., Dumas, C., 2013. Dynamic effect of total solid
- 476 content, low substrate/inoculum ratio and particle size on solid-state anaerobic
  477 digestion. *Bioresour. Technol.* 144, 141–148.
- 478 Pan, X., Angelidaki, I., Alvarado-Morales, M., Liu, H., Liu, Y., Huang, X., Zhu, G.,
- 479 2016. Methane production from formate, acetate and H2/CO2; focusing on kinetics
  480 and microbial characterization. *Bioresour. Technol.* 218, 796–806.
- Park, W., Hyun, S.H., Oh, S.-E., Logan, B.E., Kim, I.S., 2005. Removal of Headspace
  CO 2 Increases Biological Hydrogen Production. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 39, 4416–
  483 4420.
- 484 Pavlostathis, S.G., Giraldo-Gomez, G., 1991. Kinetics of anaerobic treatment. *Water*485 *Sci. Technol.* 24, 35–59.
- 486 Schink, B., 1997. Energetics of syntrophic cooperation in methanogenic degradation.
  487 *Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev.* 61, 262–280.
- 488 Schloss, P.D., Westcott, S.L., Ryabin, T., Hall, J.R., Hartmann, M., Hollister, E.B.,
- 489 Lesniewski, R. a., Oakley, B.B., Parks, D.H., Robinson, C.J., Sahl, J.W., Stres, B.,
- 490 Thallinger, G.G., Van Horn, D.J., Weber, C.F., 2009. Introducing mothur: Open-

491	source, platform-independent, community-supported software for describing and
492	comparing microbial communities. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 75, 7537–7541.

- Siegert, I., Banks, C.J., 2005. The effect of volatile fatty acid additions on the anaerobic
  digestion of cellulose and glucose in batch reactors. *Process Biochem.* 40, 3412–
  3418.
- Veeken, A., Kalyunzhnyi, S., Scharff, H., Hamelers, B., Kalyuzhnyi, S., 2000. Effect of
  pH and VFA on hydrolysis of organic solid waste. *J. Environ. Eng.* 6, 1076–1081.
- Ward, A.J., Hobbs, P.J., Holliman, P.J., Jones, D.L., 2008. Optimisation of the
  anaerobic digestion of agricultural resources. *Bioresour. Technol.* 99, 7928–40.

#### 501 6 Tables captions

502 **Table 1:** Methanogenic activity performances (cumulated  $CH_4$  production,  $CH_4$ 503 production rate) for the different phases, in the control (with no  $H_2$  initially added) and 504 for reactors with initial  $H_2$  in headspace at a partial pressure of 996 ± 27 mbars and 505 where  $CO_2$  was added at day 11 and 18.

506 **Table 2 :** Phylum and class of *Archaea* and *Bacteria* presents in the control (without 507 gas added) and when the  $CO_2$  was added at 11 and 18 days in % (results of the

sequencing) at 0, 11, 18, 25 and 32 days after the beginning of the experiment.

509

## 510 **7** Figures captions511

Figure 1: Cumulative methane production (in  $mL_{CH4}.g_{TS}^{-1}$ ), for reactors with  $H_2$ 512 513 initially present in headspace and where CO<sub>2</sub> was added after 11 and 18 days of 514 operation; according to (A) the time of reactor operation or (B) the normalized time 515 after CO<sub>2</sub> addition . Tests were operated at pH 8, 25% TS and at 35°C. The grey and 516 black arrows show the time when CO<sub>2</sub> was added at 11 and 18 days, respectively. **Figure 2:** Metabolites production (in  $mg_{COD}.g_{TS}^{-1}$ ) according to the time of operation in 517 the control (only N<sub>2</sub> initially in headspace), and according to the time after CO<sub>2</sub> addition 518 after 11 and 18 days of operation of the reactors running at high  $P_{H2}$ . All tests were 519 carried out at pH 8, 25% TS and 35°C. 520 **Figure 3:** Substrate degradation in  $mg_{COD}.g_{TS}^{-1}$ , according to the time after adding CO<sub>2</sub> 521

522 ( $CO_2$  added at 11 and 18 days) and since the beginning (control)







Days after CO<sub>2</sub> addition



		Phases	Time (days of operation)	Time since CO <sub>2</sub> addition (days)	Cumulated CH <sub>4</sub> produced per phase (Nml.g <sub>TS</sub> <sup>-1</sup> )	Average CH <sub>4</sub> production rate (Nml.g <sub>TS</sub> <sup>-1</sup> .day <sup>-1</sup> )	
		Lag phase	0 to 5		2 ± 0.6	$0.45 \pm 0.13$	
Control		Exponential phase	5 to 32		72 ± 3	$2.7 \pm 0.32$	
	Before CO <sub>2</sub> addition	Start phase	start phase 0 to 1		$0.8 \pm 0.4$	0.96± 0.52	
		Inhibition phase	1 to 11		4 ± 0.5	$0.45 \pm 0.14$	
CO <sub>2</sub> added at 11 days		CH <sub>4</sub> production phase 1	11 to 14	0-3	12 ± 1	$4 \pm 0.75$	
	After CO <sub>2</sub> addition	Lag phase	14 to 18	3 – 7	4 ± 2.4	$0.82 \pm 0.27$	
		CH <sub>4</sub> production phase 2	18 to 25	7 - 14	16 ± 1	$2.74 \pm 0.45$	
	Before CO <sub>2</sub>	Start phase	0 to 1		0.8 ± 3	$0.96 \pm 0.42$	
	addition	Inhibition phase	1 to 18		6 ± 1	$0.38 \pm 0.1$	
CO <sub>2</sub> added at	After CO <sub>2</sub> addition	CH <sub>4</sub> production phase 1	18 to 21	0-3	10 ± 2	3.55 ± 0.87	
10 uays		Lag phase	21 to 25	3-7	3 ± 2.1	0.41± 0.27	
		CH <sub>4</sub> production phase 2	25 to 32	7-14	11 ± 3	1.77 ± 0.23	

		Control		CO <sub>2</sub> added at day 11			CO <sub>2</sub> added at day 18			
Total operation time (days)		0	11	18	11	18	25	18	25	32
Time after CO <sub>2</sub> addition (days)					0	7	14	0	7	14
Class	Order									
	Archaea									
Methanobacteria	Methanobacteriales	91.6%	81.7%	78.1%	90.8%	89.6%	89.8%	83.4%	83.0%	79.8%
Methanomicrobia		5.8%	15.6%	17.0%	6.2%	6.9%	7.8%	13.4%	13.0%	17.3%
	Methanomicrobiales	0%	1%	1%	0.2%	0.3%	0.2%	0%	1%	1%
	Methanosarcinales	6%	15%	16%	6%	7%	8%	13%	12%	17%
Thermoplasmata		0.5%	0.1%	0.4%	0.5%	0.7%	0.6%	0.3%	0.5%	0.5%
Bacteria										
Clostridia	Clostridiales	26.4%	29.5%	19.7%	31.0%	39.8%	46.8%	30.3%	41.9%	39.9%
Bacteroidia	Bacteroidales	29.2%	41.5%	46.9%	24.4%	20.5%	18.5%	31.9%	25.2%	20.9%
Spirochaetes	Spirochaetales	10.3%	15.0%	17.6%	10.5%	7.7%	15.5%	10.6%	6.1%	20.5%
Synergistia	Synergistales	5.6%	1.7%	2.1%	4.1%	3.9%	2.6%	5.3%	4.5%	3.0%
Anaerolineae	Anaerolineales	5.1%	1.3%	1.4%	7.7%	7.4%	3.3%	5.3%	5.2%	2.2%
Deltaproteobacteria	Syntrophobacterales	3.8%	1.4%	1.3%	2.4%	2.7%	1.2%	2.8%	4.3%	1.8%