

High-density SNP assay development for genetic analysis in maritime pine (Pinus pinaster)

Christophe Plomion, Jérôme Bartholomé, Isabelle Lesur Kupin Lesur, Christophe C. Boury, Isabel Rodríguez-Quilón, Hélène Lagraulet, François Ehrenmann, Laurent Bouffier, Jean-Marc J.-M. Gion, D. Grivet, et al.

To cite this version:

Christophe Plomion, Jérôme Bartholomé, Isabelle Lesur Kupin Lesur, Christophe C. Boury, Isabel Rodríguez-Quilón, et al.. High-density SNP assay development for genetic analysis in maritime pine (Pinus pinaster). Molecular Ecology Resources, 2016, 16 (2), pp.574-587. 10.1111/1755-0998.12464. hal-02640393 $v2$

HAL Id: hal-02640393 <https://hal.inrae.fr/hal-02640393v2>

Submitted on 30 Sep 2024

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

[Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

Molecular Ecology Resources

MOLECULAR ECOLOGY

High-density SNP assay development for genetic analysis in maritime pine (Pinus pinaster)

SCHOLARONE™ Manuscripts

- **Running title**: SNP discovery and validation in maritime pine
-
-

29 **Abstract**

30

P) genotyping arrays are increasingly used to study g
nd for practical applications in plant and animal brown.
We developed a 9k Illumina Infinium SNP are
if from i) a three-generation inbred (F2) pedigree, ii) th
natural 31 Maritime pine provides essential ecosystem services in the south-western Mediterranean 32 basin, where it covers around 4 million ha. Its scattered distribution over a range of 33 environmental conditions makes it an ideal forest tree species for studies of local adaptation 34 and adaptive responses to climatic change. Highly-multiplexed single-nucleotide 35 polymorphism (SNP) genotyping arrays are increasingly used to study genetic variation in 36 living organisms and for practical applications in plant and animal breeding and genetic 37 resource conservation. We developed a 9k Illumina Infinium SNP array and genotyped 38 maritime pine trees from i) a three-generation inbred (F2) pedigree, ii) the French breeding 39 population, and iii) natural populations from Portugal and the French Atlantic coast. A large 40 proportion of the exploitable SNPs (2,052 / 8,410, i.e. 24.4%) segregated in the mapping 41 population and could be mapped, providing the densest ever gene-based linkage map for this 42 species. Population genetics and structure analyses based on 3,981 SNP markers common to 43 the Portuguese and French gene pools revealed high levels of differentiation, leading to the 44 identification of a set of highly differentiated SNPs that could be used for seed provenance 45 certification. Finally, we discuss how the validated SNPs could facilitate the identification of 46 ecologically and economically relevant genetic factors in this species, improving our 47 understanding of the demography and selective forces shaping its natural genetic diversity, 48 and providing support for new breeding strategies.

49

51 **Introduction**

52

terised by heavy annual rainfall in a maritime climate t

innean climate, and from calcareous to acidic soils (Alia

bution has resulted in local adaptations and high

adaptive traits across its natural distribution range 53 Maritime pine (*Pinus pinaster* Aiton, Pinaceae) is a long-lived wind-pollinated forest tree 54 species native to the western part of the Mediterranean Basin. Its natural range extends from 55 northern Morocco in the south to French Brittany in the north, and from Portugal in the west 56 to Italy in the east (http://www.euforgen.org/distribution-maps/). It is found in various 57 ecological situations, from sea level to an altitude of 2,100 m in the High Atlas (Morocco), 58 from regions characterised by heavy annual rainfall in a maritime climate to dry regions in the 59 semi-arid Mediterranean climate, and from calcareous to acidic soils (Alía and Martín, 2003). 60 Its scattered distribution has resulted in local adaptations and high levels of genetic 61 differentiation for adaptive traits across its natural distribution range (González-Martínez *et* 62 *al*. 2002, Santos-del-Blanco *et al.* 2012, Lamy *et al.* 2011, 2014). Considerable genetic 63 differentiation between ecotypes has been reported for various neutral molecular markers, 64 providing clear evidence for a geographic structure of genetic diversity (Bucci *et al*. 2007, 65 Santos-del-Blanco *et al*. 2012, Jaramillo-Correa *et al*. 2010, 2015).

66

67 This fast-growing tree has been widely planted in systematic reforestation programs since the $19th$ century, to secure coastal (along the Atlantic) and inland (Castilian plateau) sand dune 69 areas, to drain marshes and to create new forests for resin production. Over the last 50 years, 70 this species has been commercially exploited as a timber resource for the forestry industry 71 (sawmills, wood panels, pulp and paper). In recent years, it has also been used as a source of 72 chemicals for the bio-industry (Rohdewald 2002, Touriño *et al*. 2005, Jorge *et al*. 2002), as 73 bioactive phenolic compounds can be extracted from its bark. There are now 4.2 million ha 74 under maritime pine within its natural range and 200,000 ha outside this range (mostly in 75 Australia) (Bouffier *et al*. 2013). The breeding of maritime pine began in the 1960s in

Page 5 of 53 Molecular Ecology Resources

76 southwestern France, after several species and provenance trials had shown that the local 77 ecotype was the best adapted and fastest growing tree in the Aquitaine soil and climatic 78 conditions (Illy 1966, Harfouche 1995). This programme has now reached its third generation, 79 and is one of the most advanced conifer breeding programmes in the world (Mullin *et al.* 80 2011).

81

for investigations of the genetic variation or linked m
itty, particularly those selected by the environment and
ed by González-Martínez *et al.* 2011). It is now hoped the
sing changes in gene expression and/or amino-aci 82 The maritime pine has also been adopted by the forest tree genetics research community as a 83 key model species for investigations of the genetic variation or linked mutations underlying 84 phenotypic variability, particularly those selected by the environment and involved in local 85 adaptation (reviewed by González-Martínez *et al.* 2011). It is now hoped that the discovery of 86 polymorphisms causing changes in gene expression and/or amino-acid sequences will lead to 87 innovations in genetic resource management, for both breeding (Isik 2014) and conservation 88 strategies (Ouborg *et al.* 2010). Such discoveries should also lead to changes in silviculture 89 practices to take into account the evolutionary processes inferred from neutral and selected 90 markers (Lefèvre *et al*. 2014). Major efforts have been devoted to the sequencing and 91 assembly of the maritime pine transcriptome (Canales *et al*. 2014), for studies of the 92 molecular basis of the phenotypic response to biotic and abiotic constraints (e.g. Le Provost *et* 93 *al*. 2013). Moreover, since the pioneering work of Lepoittevin *et al*. (2010), describing the 94 design of the first multiplex single-nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) genotyping assay in 95 maritime pine, medium-scale SNP-arrays have been developed (Supplemental Table 1). These 96 assays have made it possible to characterise hundreds of trees, at hundreds of loci, for various 97 applications: nucleotide diversity analysis (Plomion *et al*. 2014), QTL detection (de Miguel *et* 98 *al*. 2014), association mapping (Lepoittevin *et al.* 2012, Budde *et al.* 2014), analyses of the 99 correlations between genotype frequencies and environmental gradients (Jaramillo-Correa *et* 100 *al.* 2015) and linkage map construction (Chancerel *et al.* 2013).

Intiation analysis between two gene pools (Portugal a
 For Review Solution to phenotypic variation, genetic inference

Ins. the past action of natural selection and adaptive

novel tree breeding strategies.
 For Review 102 Given the high throughput and reliability of the Infinium platform from Illumina (e.g. 103 Bartholomé *et al*. 2015a for eucalyptus, Pavy *et al.* 2013 for spruce), we used this platform to 104 design a customised genotyping array for maritime pine, including about 5,000 SNPs from 105 the studies cited above and about 4,000 SNPs newly identified from RNA-seq data and new 106 amplicon resequencing. The resulting 9k SNP array is the largest genotyping chip ever 107 produced for this species. We assessed the suitability of this array for genetic linkage mapping 108 and genetic differentiation analysis between two gene pools (Portugal and French Atlantic 109 coast). Finally, we discuss the potential utility of this SNP array for exploring genetic 110 diversity and its contribution to phenotypic variation, genetic inferences about historical 111 demographic events, the past action of natural selection and adaptive evolution, and the 112 implementation of novel tree breeding strategies. 113 114 **Materials and methods** 115 116 *Design of an Illumina Infinium array for maritime pine* 117 118 We designed a 9k Illumina Infinium SNP array for maritime pine, including the two subsets 119 of SNPs described below. 120 *Previously available SNPs* 121 Over the past five years, several studies have reported the development of SNP markers in 122 maritime pine (see Supplemental Table 1). We selected a total of 4,997 SNPs from assays 123 based on VeraCode, GoldenGate or Infinium Illumina technologies (Illumina, San Diego, CA, 124 USA) and incorporated them into the same Infinium genotyping array. Some SNPs had been 125 used on a number of occasions (270 SNPs were common to at least two studies), whereas

Page 7 of 53 Molecular Ecology Resources

150 Titanium technology). Sequences (available under accession numbers SRX031589,

Formark), with the default parameters. SNPs were the
lity standard algorithm (NQS) and the following par
imum central base quality = 20, minimum neighbourh
1 nucleotides = 15, maximum gap and mismatch coun
20%.
By develo 151 SRX208012 and SRX031592 from the NCBI short-read archive) were cleaned with the 152 Pyrocleaner tool (Mariette *et al*. 2011), which removes particularly short (<150 bp) and long 153 reads (>600 bp), reads with a percentage of Ns (ambiguous base calls) greater than 2%, low-154 complexity regions, and duplicated reads. For each library, the SNPs were identified by 155 aligning each set of sequences against the 198,425 contigs of the second maritime pine 156 UniGene established by Chancerel *et al*. (2013). Alignments were performed with the CLC 157 Genomics Workbench Reference Mapping function of CLC Genomics Workbench V6.0 158 (CLC Bio, Aarhus, Denmark), with the default parameters. SNPs were then detected with the 159 neighbourhood quality standard algorithm (NQS) and the following parameters: minimum 160 coverage = 6, minimum central base quality = 20, minimum neighbourhood quality over a 161 window length of 11 nucleotides $= 15$, maximum gap and mismatch count $= 2$ and minimum 162 allele frequency = 20% .

163

164 Newly developed SNPs from candidate genes

165 Grivet *et al*. (2015) obtained 105 *in vitro* SNPs from two full-length candidate genes with 166 functions relating to phenology (*col1* and *gia*) and 64 amplicons sequenced as part of the 167 CRIEC (Comparative Re-sequencing in European Conifers) project, an EvolTree 168 (http://www.evoltree.eu) initiative. An additional set of *in silico* SNPs was then obtained from 169 281 candidate genes with functions relating to abiotic and biotic (plant defence) stress 170 responses in forest trees selected from the following sources: i) 66 genes from published 171 (Perdiguero *et al.* 2013) and unpublished maritime pine sequences available from GenBank, 172 ii) 149 genes from sequencing studies in other conifers (Wachowiak *et al*. 2009, Kujala and 173 Savolainen 2012), iii) 53 transcripts displaying differential expression in the presence and 174 absence of pine wood nematode infection (Santos *et al.* 2013), iv) 10 genes associated with 175 adventitious shoot induction and plant development in pines (Alonso *et al*. 2007, Ordás *et al*.

176 unpublished for *knox* genes), and v) 3 genes potentially involved in cavitation resistance in 177 beech (Lalagüe *et al.* 2014). These sequences were blasted (BlastN, e-value = 10^{-5}) against the 178 maritime pine UniGene to retrieve the best matching contig and the sequences surrounding 179 the SNP from a catalogue of 55,607 available SNPs (Figure 3). Redundant SNPs were 180 removed. 181

182 *Annotation of synonymous and non-synonymous substitutions*

183

itions of SNPs were defined in the contigs of the mari
 Formal. (2014). Within the coding sequences (when cl
 Formalynous SNPs were annotated by comparing the am

codon to the codon containing the SNP. The functio

stu 184 The respective positions of SNPs were defined in the contigs of the maritime pine UniGene 185 from Canales *et al.* (2014). Within the coding sequences (when characterised), non-186 synonymous and synonymous SNPs were annotated by comparing the amino acids translated 187 from the reference codon to the codon containing the SNP. The functional annotation was 188 retrieved from the study by Canales *et al*. (2014). All these items of information are available 189 in Supplemental Table 3.

- 190
- 191 *The populations studied and genetic analysis*
- 192

193 The SNP assays were tested and validated on the basis of Mendelian segregation in mapping 194 pedigrees and genetic diversity analysis in an elite breeding population from France and 195 natural populations of different origins (French Atlantic coast and Portugal).

- 196
- 197 *Mapping population and linkage analysis*

- 199 The mapping population consisted of a three-generation inbred pedigree (F2) obtained by the
- 200 self-pollination of an inter-provenance "Landes x Corsica" hybrid (accession H12 resulting

201 from the control cross between L146 and C10 genotypes). In total, 638 F2 seeds were planted 202 in a nursery in June 1998 and 626 saplings were transplanted into the field in March 1999 (4 203 m \times 2 m, 0.51 ha, Lacanau de Mios, France). After 15 years, 565 F2 plants were still available 204 for genetic analysis. We used 92 F2 plants to test the Mendelian segregation of the SNP 205 markers and to associate them with a particular genetic position. The F2 plants with the most 206 recombinant genotypes were selected with MapPop software 207 (http://www.bio.unc.edu/faculty/vision/lab/mappop/, Vision et al. 2000) and a linkage map 208 was established by Lavigne *et al*. (manuscript in preparation), by genotyping 477 F2 plants 209 for 248 SNPs distributed over 12 linkage groups (LG), the haploid chromosome number in 210 pines.

211

Lavigne *et al.* (manuscript in preparation), by genoty
ibuted over 12 linkage groups (LG), the haploid chron
Propy v2.0-3 (Margarido *et al.* 2007, Mollinari *et al.* 2
Only SNPs and individuals for which there was less 212 The *R* package *onemap* v2.0-3 (Margarido *et al.* 2007, Mollinari *et al*. 2009) was used for 213 linkage mapping. Only SNPs and individuals for which there was less than 5% and 1% 214 missing data, respectively, were considered in the analysis. SNPs were clustered into LGs on 215 the basis of a LOD score greater than 10. The LG names were defined on the basis of 216 previously mapped loci (Chancerel *et al.* 2013). The RECORD algorithm (Os *et al*. 2005) was 217 used to order markers within LGs, with the following parameters: LOD=3 and max.rf=0.4. 218 Recombination rates were converted into genetic distances (cM) with the Kosambi mapping 219 function (Kosambi 1943). The goodness-of-fit of SNP segregations to the expected Mendelian 220 segregation ratio (i.e. 1:2:1 for an F2 population) was assessed in chi-squared tests, with 221 adjustment of the significance threshold for simultaneous multiple tests (Benjamini and 222 Yekutieli 2001) within each LG. The same procedure was also applied to a previous SNP 223 dataset genotyped in the same F2 family, but with different genotypes and mapping software 224 (Chancerel *et al*. 2013). The two genetic maps were then combined into a composite linkage 225 map with the *R* package *LPmerge* (Endelman and Plomion, 2014).

227 *Populations of unrelated individuals and genetic diversity estimation*

For Fig. 21248 mm and mean annual temperature of 12-13^oC); and for about 600 genotypes mass-selected in natural forestight of 1960s to constitute the first generation of the marities.

For 1960s to constitute the first g 228 The French Atlantic coast gene pool was represented by two subsets of individuals: i) 50 trees 229 from two natural populations, Hourtin and Petrocq, sampled from a clonal collection 230 (CLONAPIN) established directly from the source populations (as described by Rodríguez-231 Quilón *et al.* 2015). Hourtin (45°11'N, 1°09'E) and Petrocq (44°04'N, 1°18'E) are coastal 232 populations growing at low altitude (<30 m a.s.l.) and under typical maritime climate (annual 233 precipitation of 980-1248 mm and mean annual temperature of 12-13°C); and ii) 50 elite trees 234 from a larger set of about 600 genotypes mass-selected in natural forests of the Aquitaine 235 region in the early 1960s to constitute the first generation of the maritime pine breeding 236 program (Illy 1966). These 50 genotypes constitute the founders of a three-generation 237 pedigreed population used to develop proof-of-concept for genomic selection in maritime 238 pine.

239

240 The Portuguese population was also represented by two subsets of genotypes: i) 19 trees 241 sampled from two provenances in a provenance trial carried out at Mimizan (France: 242 $44^{\circ}20'$ N, $1^{\circ}28'$ W). These provenances were described by Illy (1966): 6 trees were from seeds 243 collected at "Pinhal de Leiria" (an 11 ha coastal forest located at 39°79'N, 8°98'W; 0-50 m 244 a.s.l.; annual precipitation of 700-900 mm) and 13 trees were from seeds collected at "Trás-245 os-Montes" (a mountain forest located at 41°57'N, 7°50'W; 1150 m a.s.l., annual 246 precipitation of 1200-1400 mm); and ii) 23 additional trees from "Pinhal de Leiria" collected 247 from the CLONAPIN maritime pine collection.

248

249 We first tested departure from Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium, in standard chi-squared tests 250 with a nominal significance threshold of 1.05 -1.15 \times 10⁻⁵, corresponding to an experiment-

251 wise type I error of 5 % (Bonferroni correction to account for multiple testing). We then 252 estimated three genetic diversity parameters for each SNP: minor allele frequency (MAF), 253 observed (Ho) and expected heterozygosity (He, Nei's index of genetic diversity corrected for 254 sample size, Nei 1987). These three parameters were highly correlated (>0.95). We therefore 255 present data for MAF and *He* only. Genetic differentiation (*Fst*) was assessed for pairs of 256 populations, with a set of 3,981 polymorphic SNPs common to both populations, with GDA 257 software (Lewis and Zaykin 2001). Finally, Bayesian clustering analysis (Structure software, 258 Pritchard *et al*. 2000, Falush *et al*. 2003) was performed to identify different gene pools in 259 maritime pine, as described by Jaramillo-Correa *et al*. (2015). 260

261 *Folded site frequency spectrum (SFS) for the French and Portuguese groups*

262

For Review Only 263 Sites with missing data were excluded from the samples, to ensure general consistency across 264 loci in terms of the number of sequences analysed for each site. Furthermore, we retained the 265 same SNPs for the French and Portuguese groups, 3,513 SNPs in total, corresponding to 88% 266 of the original dataset (3,981 SNPs). Finally, two individuals were discarded from the French 267 group as they presented 19% (INIA_PET11) and 10% (INIA_PET12) missing data across the 268 3,981 SNPs. The estimate of folded SFS was therefore based on 3,513 common SNPs with no 269 missing data, genotyped in 94 French and 42 Portuguese individuals.

270

271 SNPs were analysed as unpolarized (i.e. no ancestral state inferred), with the least frequent 272 nucleotide at a given SNP site considered to correspond to the minor allele and thus used for 273 the calculation of minor allele frequency (MAF). MAF was calculated for the French and 274 Portuguese groups separately. The folded SFS was then plotted from the observed MAF and 275 from the expected SFS. We used equation 6 from the paper by Ganapathy and Uyenoyama

- 276 (2009) to determine the expected SFS. This equation is widely used to describe the expected 277 SFS for a genomic sample of SNPs, each of which is assumed to correspond to a mutation on 278 an independent gene genealogy.
- 279

280 *DNA extraction and genotyping*

281

ms. They were stored at -80°C or dried with silica

0 - 40 mg of frozen/dried needles were crushed with a

Formany). Genomic DNA was isolated with the Invisorb

H, Berlin, Germany), according to the manufacture

Free deter 282 Developing needles were collected after bud burst for each genotype of the F2, natural and 283 breeding populations. They were stored at -80°C or dried with silica gel before DNA 284 extraction. About 30 - 40 mg of frozen/dried needles were crushed with a mixer mill (Retsch 285 MM300, Haan, Germany). Genomic DNA was isolated with the Invisorb DNA plants 96 kit 286 from Invitek (GmbH, Berlin, Germany), according to the manufacturer's instructions. All 287 concentrations were determined with a NanoDrop spectrophotometer (NanoDrop 288 Technologies, Wilmington, DE, USA) and a fluorescence assay (Quant-IT kit, Invitrogen, 289 Carlsbad, CA, USA). Samples with DNA concentrations greater than 50 ng/µl (based on 290 fluorescence measurements) were used for the Infinium assay. Genotyping was carried out at 291 the Genes Diffusion Facility (Douai, France). 292

- 293 **Results**
- 294

296

297 The SNP genotyping array included 8,949 SNPs, 4,712 of which (i.e 52.65%) were already 298 available (166 from Lepoittevin *et al*. 2010, 835 SNPs from Chancerel *et al*. 2011, 3,378 299 SNPs from Chancerel *et al.* 2013, 434 SNPs from de Miguel *et al.* 2014, and 184 SNPs from

²⁹⁵ *SNP detection*

300 Lavigne *et al.* (manuscript in preparation) (Figure 1). The other 4,237 (i.e 47.35%) 301 corresponded to newly developed SNPs.

302

303 *Newly developed SNPs*

304

305 *In silico* SNPs from 454 sequence reads (Figure 2)

82 reads, respectively. After cleaning, we retained 10[']

F., L and M, respectively. We identified 2,039 SNPs in t

and 4,752 in the M dataset. We then selected SN

segregation), i.e. heterozygous in one parent and homoz 306 Pyrosequencing of the C (Corsica), M (Morocco) and L (Landes) libraries provided 188,494, 307 611,673 and 458,882 reads, respectively. After cleaning, we retained 107,089, 484,348 and 308 225,842 reads for C, L and M, respectively. We identified 2,039 SNPs in the C dataset, 4,937 309 in the L dataset and 4,752 in the M dataset. We then selected SNPs in a test-cross 310 configuration (1:1 segregation), i.e. heterozygous in one parent and homozygous in the other, 311 because, in a full-sib family with biallelic codominant markers, pairs of markers presenting 312 this configuration provide the best estimate of recombination rates, particularly if compared 313 with pairs having a test-cross and intercross (1:2:1) configuration (Plomion *et al*. 1997). Thus, 314 we selected 2,830, 1,695 and 2,957 SNPs for the $C \times M$, $L \times C$ and $L \times M$ crosses, 315 respectively. In total 784, 2,046 and 911 SNPs were informative for the C, M and L parents, 316 respectively. This procedure resulted in the retention of 3,741 unique SNPs as particularly 317 suitable for linkage mapping.

318

319 *In vitro* and *in silico* SNPs from candidate genes (Figure 3)

320 Of the 281 candidate genes, 166 were associated with at least one contig of the maritime pine 321 UniGene. We retrieved 888 SNPs from these 166 contigs. Finally, after removing duplicated 322 sequences and SNPs located less than 100 bp apart, we retained 391 SNPs for SNP array 323 development. In addition, 105 *in vitro* SNPs from 66 resequenced candidate genes were 324 identified and incorporated into the SNP array.

Page 15 of 53 Molecular Ecology Resources

325

326 *Annotation of synonymous and non-synonymous substitutions*

327

Formular Solution 35.0 We identified 567 (21%) synonymous SNPs, and the third position in the codon in 87.5% of cases. There NPs with the mutation affecting the first codon positio ion in 70.6%. For NS mutations, the ch 328 In total, 4,257 (47.6%) SNPs were found in contigs for which a full-length protein was 329 predicted, with 1,557 (36.6%) of these SNPs located in non-coding regions. SNPs in coding 330 sequences (2,700 *i.e*. 63.4%) were characterised in terms of their synonymous (S) or non-331 synonymous (NS) nature and codon responsible for the NS change (Figure 4A and 332 Supplemental Table 3). We identified 567 (21%) synonymous SNPs, and found that the point 333 mutation affected the third position in the codon in 87.5% of cases. There were 2,133 (79%) 334 non-synonymous SNPs with the mutation affecting the first codon position in 21.5% and the 335 second codon position in 70.6%. For NS mutations, the change in the protein is indicated in 336 Supplemental Table 3. Most of the SNPs were transitions (59.3%). The most common 337 transition was C \leftrightarrow T. The most frequent transversion was G \leftrightarrow T (Figure 4B).

338

339 *Linkage mapping*

340

341 Of the 8,410 SNPs used to genotype the 92 trees of the F2 mapping population, 4,634 (55.1%) 342 were monomorphic, 2,052 (from 1,672 different contigs) were polymorphic (24.4%) and the 343 remaining 1,724 (20.5%) corresponding to failed assays. All polymorphic SNPs passed the 344 quality threshold and were therefore used in linkage analysis. The total map length was 1,993 345 cM, spread over 12 LGs corresponding to the haploid number of chromosomes for the 346 maritime pine genome. LG length ranged from 129.2 (LG11) to 198.2 cM (LG5) and the 347 mean number of SNPs per LG was 171 cM (F2_N in Table 1). The mean SNP density was 348 0.98, but more than half of the markers were grouped into clusters (i.e. groups of markers 349 displaying no recombination). This resulted in 901 unique positions, separated by a mean

structed with the dataset of Chancerel *et al.* (2013) me progeny (F2_O in Table 1). Only 56 of the 1,180 r ps differed in order between the two maps (Figure 5). T red between tightly linked markers (\leq 5 cM), mostly on 350 distance of 2.25 cM. Two factors could account for the clustering of SNPs: i) the small size of 351 the mapping population (92 genotypes) and ii) the presence of more than one SNP in 260 of 352 the 1,672 mapped contigs. Distorted SNPs were retained in the linkage analysis and accounted 353 for 3.6% of the mapped markers. They were grouped together in five regions located on three 354 LGs (segregation distortion regions, SDRs): two linked SDRs on LG#3 with 10 and 5 355 markers, one SDR on LG#6 (26 markers) and three SDRs on LG#10 (14, 12 and 2 markers) 356 (Figure 5). The order of SNPs was similar (Spearman $p=0.98$) to that obtained from the 357 linkage map reconstructed with the dataset of Chancerel *et al*. (2013) based on different 358 genotypes of the same progeny (F2_O in Table 1). Only 56 of the 1,180 markers common to 359 the two genetic maps differed in order between the two maps (Figure 5). These differences in 360 marker order occurred between tightly linked markers (<5 cM), mostly on LG#1 and LG#10, 361 for which 10 and 15 markers were involved, respectively. Finally, based on the highly 362 conserved marker order between the two maps, a composite map was established (F2_C in 363 Table 1) with LPmerge software. It contained 2,353 SNPs (including 1,121 SNPs in the same 364 contigs). This composite map included 1,661 different loci, and is therefore the densest yet 365 gene-based linkage map for this species. The total map length was 1,711.7 cM. There were 955 unique positions, separated by a mean distance of 1.82 cM.

367

368 *Genetic diversity and population structure analysis*

369

370 Only a few markers displayed significant departure from Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium in each 371 population: 6 (0.10%) for the French Atlantic-based breeding population, 16 (0.26%) for the 372 natural French Atlantic population and 18 (0.35%) for the Portuguese population. These 373 markers, together with those for which >10% of the data were missing in any of the three 374 populations, were removed from further analyses, resulting in a set of 5,016 loci (including

Page 17 of 53 Molecular Ecology Resources

Genetic diversity was slightly lower for the Portuguese
th the breeding and natural populations in France. Hige
observed between the French Atlantic and Portuguese
08087, 0.08864), with 263 SNPs having F_{st} values abov
 375 24% monomorphic loci) successfully scored in all populations. We found no differences in 376 genetic diversity, assessed with this common SNP set, between the natural and breeding 377 populations in the French Atlantic region (*He* of 0.336 vs. 0.332, based on polymorphic loci 378 only; Table 2), suggesting that the mass selection in natural forests for constitution of the base 379 breeding population for this species was broad enough to collect most of the standing genetic 380 variation of this ecotype. This is further supported by the absence of significant genetic 381 differentiation between the natural and mass-selected populations (F_{st} = 0.0005, 95% CI: -382 0.00002, 0.00107). Genetic diversity was slightly lower for the Portuguese population (*He* of 383 0.319) than for both the breeding and natural populations in France. High levels of genetic 384 differentiation were observed between the French Atlantic and Portuguese populations (F_{st} = 385 0.0847, 95% CI: 0.08087, 0.08864), with 263 SNPs having F_{st} values above 0.25. These SNP 386 markers are good candidates to replace the biochemical assay (based on terpene content 387 analysis, Baradat and Marpeau-Bezard, 1988) currently used to determine the putative origin 388 of adult forest stands in Aquitaine before the collection of seeds and their distribution for 389 commercial purposes in France. Indeed, seed-lots from Portugal were introduced into 390 Aquitaine in the 1950s and the stands they formed suffered frost damage after the 391 exceptionally cold winter of 1985 (Ribeiro *et al.* 2002). Therefore, from 1986 onwards, 392 candidate stands for seed collection in Aquitaine had to be certified as of French origin. The 393 Bayesian clustering pattern observed, with the identification of only two gene pools (*K*=2), 394 with the French natural and breeding populations grouped together into a single gene pool 395 significantly separated from the Portuguese population (Figure 6), is an strong asset in this 396 respect. This result will guide the development of highly informative genotyping multiplexes 397 based on the Sequenom MassARRAY technology that has already been developed for this 398 species (Chancerel *et al.* 2013).

399

400 As expected, the SFS of both the French and Portuguese groups showed a deficit of the 401 observed low-frequency variants (Supplemental Figure 1). This deficit is probably due to a 402 combined effect of the approach developed to select most of the SNPs (i.e. *in silico* analysis 403 of ESTs obtained from small numbers of genotypes, precluding the capture of rare variants of 404 the SFS), and the sampling scheme (a small sample size for each group), hindering the 405 detection of rare variants even if present on the SNP array.

- 406
- 407 **Discussion**
- 408

Example a discuss how the substantial number of polymorph

udy will help researchers working on maritime pine to

tion genomics and quantitative genetics with large san

edigreed populations that can now be surveyed for ge 409 In this section, we discuss how the substantial number of polymorphisms detected and 410 validated in this study will help researchers working on maritime pine to address scientific 411 questions in population genomics and quantitative genetics with large samples of individuals 412 from natural and pedigreed populations that can now be surveyed for genetic variation at a 413 few thousand expressed genes across the genome.

414

415 *Linkage and QTL mapping*

416

417 High-throughput SNP genotyping has been successfully implemented in several conifers 418 (Pavy *et al*. 2008; Eckert *et al*. 2009a; Chancerel *et al.* 2011, 2013). This approach has 419 generated thousands of markers for genetic mapping, significantly improving our 420 understanding of large, complex conifer genomes (Jermstad *et al.* 2011, Pavy *et al*. 2012, 421 Martínez-García *et al*. 2013, Neves *et al.* 2014). We show here that a combination of highly 422 multiplexed SNP genotyping and a selective mapping strategy is useful for the mapping of 423 hundreds of genes at low cost. The genetic map obtained with this strategy was highly reliable 424 and accurate, as revealed by comparison with a previously developed map based on different

Page 19 of 53 Molecular Ecology Resources

Formation between species. SNP-based genetic maps
are scaffolds to support conifer sequencing projects (Ma
2014). In addition, high-density gene-based maps are
nes controlling targeted traits through their colocal
2, de Mi 425 genotypes from the same progeny (Chancerel *et al.* 2013). The use of markers common to the 426 two sets of offspring made it possible to construct a composite genetic linkage map 427 confirming the positions of most of the previously mapped markers. Highly saturated gene-428 based maps are very useful for the identification of orthologous genes, facilitating the study of 429 genome structure and evolution in conifers (Mackay *et al*. 2012, Ritland *et al*. 2011). Conifers 430 display a high degree of genome macrostructure conservation (Chagné *et al.* 2003, Pavy *et al*. 431 2012, Krutovsky *et al*. 2004, Jermstad *et al.* 2011). Comparative mapping is therefore a useful 432 tool to transfer information between species. SNP-based genetic maps have been used to 433 anchor large genome scaffolds to support conifer sequencing projects (Martínez-García *et al.* 434 2013, Neale *et al.* 2014). In addition, high-density gene-based maps are essential for the 435 identification of genes controlling targeted traits through their colocalization with QTLs 436 (Monclus *et al*. 2012, de Miguel *et al.* 2014, Lind *et al*. 2014, Li *et al.* 2014, Bartholomé *et al*. 437 2015b). Thus, the development and application of high-throughput genotyping technologies to 438 non-model species without a reference genome sequence, such as maritime pine, represents a 439 major advance towards the identification of genes controlling traits of interests.

440

441 *Association mapping*

442

443 In long-lived outbreeding organisms, such as forest trees, association mapping is an attractive 444 alternative to QTL mapping, as it can be used to identify molecular variation underlying 445 phenotypes from multiple genetic backgrounds without the need to produce segregating 446 progenies (Neale and Savolainen 2004). Under certain circumstances (e.g. moderate-high 447 heritability), association mapping can also be applied to natural populations. This approach is 448 useful for studies of adaptive traits in the precise environments in which they evolved (see 449 Parchman *et al*. 2012; Budde *et al*. 2014 for forest trees). Recent years have seen an explosion

Example 1 at the first genetic association studies in maritime pi

For Revietive 1 at al. (2012) found two polymorpl

wth (in a HD-Zip III transcription factor) and wood cel

nogalactan protein), respectively. Cabezas *et* 450 in the number of association mapping studies in model organisms, such as humans and 451 *Arabidopsis* (see reviews in Stranger *et al.* 2011; Weigel 2012). However, only a few studies, 452 mostly focusing on technological characters associated with wood quality, have been carried 453 out on forest trees (e.g. González-Martínez *et al*. 2011 and references therein; Cappa *et al*. 454 2013; Guerra *et al.* 2013). Progress has been particularly slow in maritime pine, partly due to 455 the lack of a reliable and cost-efficient genotyping platform capable of dealing with the large 456 sample sizes required to detect small- and medium-sized allelic effects. However, promising 457 results were obtained in the first genetic association studies in maritime pine, based on only a 458 few hundred markers. Lepoittevin *et al*. (2012) found two polymorphisms significantly 459 associated with growth (in a HD-Zip III transcription factor) and wood cellulose content (in a 460 fasciclin-like arabinogalactan protein), respectively. Cabezas *et al.* (2015) discovered a strong 461 association between several (linked) polymorphisms in *korrigan,* a gene encoding a 462 membrane-bound endo-1,4-β-d-glucanase involved in cellulose biosynthesis, and various 463 growth traits, including height and polycyclism. Our SNP array includes all SNPs reported to 464 display significant genotype:phenotype associations in previous studies. It is also enriched in 465 SNPs from candidate genes, based on all the available information (published or unpublished) 466 concerning genes displaying signatures of natural selection (e.g. Eveno *et al*. 2008; Grivet *et* 467 *al.* 2011), involved in environmental associations (e.g. Jaramillo-Correa *et al*. 2015) or 468 displaying differential expression (e.g. for pine nematode resistance, Santos *et al*. 2012; or 469 drought response, Perdiguero *et al*. 2013) in this species. We therefore expected the use of 470 this SNP genotyping array to generate highly informative data, increasing our understanding 471 of the ecological drivers of adaptation and of use for breeding applications, including genomic 472 selection (see below). For example, Westbrook *et al*. (2013) found that a small number of 473 significantly associated SNPs (~20-30) had the same predictive power as the full dataset 474 (4,854 SNPs) in SNP-based models for oleoresin flow in *Pinus taeda* L. Finally, this SNP

Page 21 of 53 Molecular Ecology Resources

475 array will allow unprecedented explorations of the molecular basis of polygenic quantitative 476 traits, through the implementation of multilocus association models (e.g. piMASS, Guan and 477 Stephen 2011), for which high-density genotyping is required. Most of the traits relevant for 478 adaptation or breeding are polygenic. The development of high-density SNP genotyping 479 assays for forest trees thus constitutes a first step towards the use of molecular information in 480 operational forestry.

- 481
- 482 *Genomic selection*
- 483

Formally Consumers and the new SNP array develoption decisions (Eggen 2011). Genomic selection (GS) animal breeding in 2008 for the selection of superior is 1 2009). The major difference between GS and marker of markers 484 High-throughput genotyping platforms, such as the new SNP array developed here, can guide 485 breeding and selection decisions (Eggen 2011). Genomic selection (GS) is a paradigm shift 486 first introduced into animal breeding in 2008 for the selection of superior individuals in many 487 countries (Goddard 2009). The major difference between GS and marker-assisted selection 488 (MAS) is the number of markers used. GS makes use of a much larger number of markers to 489 trace all the QTLs with small or large effect (Hayes and Goddard 2010). SNP-based 490 genotyping platforms are reliable and repeatable for the genotyping of large numbers of 491 individuals. There are few missing genotypes, and these genotypes can be handled (dropped 492 or imputed) without markedly decreasing data quality. Thus, SNP arrays have become the 493 choice genotyping platform for animal breeding and human genetics studies, despite advances 494 in the efficiency of DNA sequencing technologies. Whole-genome sequences have been 495 obtained for several major forest trees subjected to breeding programmes in recent years, and 496 draft assemblies of whole genomes are now available even for conifers, which have 497 particularly large genomes (Birol *et al.* 2013, Nystedt *et al.* 2013, Neale *et al*. 2014). These 498 resources should facilitate the development of efficient genotyping by sequencing platforms 499 in the near future. GS is expected to revolutionise forest tree breeding, by decreasing the need

500 for expensive and time-consuming progeny-testing practices. If successful, GS could halve 501 the long breeding cycles (>15 years) of forest trees and double the genetic gain per unit time 502 (Isik 2014). One probable application of GS application in forest trees would involve the use 503 of data from different sources, such as progeny tests and genotyping centres, in a single-step 504 approach to predicting the genetic merit of individuals (Legarra *et al.* 2009). The predicted 505 model for one cycle can then be refined as new data become available. As breeding cycles 506 progress and genotyping/sequencing costs fall, progeny testing will have a lesser effect on 507 selection decisions. Nevertheless, the lack of a reliable and cost-efficient genotyping platform 508 remains the major bottleneck for the routine application of GS in forest trees. The new high-509 density SNP array presented here constitutes a first step towards the implementation of GS in 510 maritime pine.

511

512 *Population genomics*

513

514 The high-density SNP array developed in this study provides a powerful tool for the genome-515 wide genotyping of a large number of populations across the full distribution range of the 516 species. The genotyping of hundreds of individuals across the entire range of maritime pine, 517 with SNPs located both in coding and noncoding regions, would increase our understanding 518 of the role of the evolutionary, demographic and adaptive mechanisms acting on natural 519 populations. The available molecular markers have shown that maritime pine populations are 520 spatially structured into regional gene pools connected by gene flow, particularly in the 521 Iberian Peninsula (Burban and Petit 2003, Bucci *et al*. 2007, Jaramillo-Correa *et al.* 2015). 522 However, the timing of the historical events leading to this spatial separation, and the degree 523 of connectivity between gene pools, remain to be determined. In addition, maritime pine 524 grows in diverse environmental conditions, resulting in the local adaptation of populations

Page 23 of 53 Molecular Ecology Resources

lele frequencies between populations (*F_{ST}*-based methoter *al.* 2012), site-frequency spectrum statistics (e.g., Eq. nvironmental variables (e.g., Eckert *et al.* 2010, Jarantions of these approaches. 'Reverse' ecology 525 over the range of this species (González-Martínez *et al*. 2002, Jaramillo-Correa *et al*. 2015, 526 Serra-Varela *et al*. 2015), but the molecular mechanisms underlying this adaptation are poorly 527 understood. Most ecologically and economically important traits are quantitative in nature and 528 controlled by many loci (Rockman 2012). Extensive genome coverage is therefore required to 529 disentangle selection from other factors that have shaped genomic variation across 530 populations (e.g. genetic drift). This SNP array provides a means of identifying functional 531 variation and the molecular bases of adaptation, through various methods based on the 532 differentiation of allele frequencies between populations (*FST*-based methods; see e.g. Prunier 533 *et al*. 2011, Chen *et al*. 2012), site-frequency spectrum statistics (e.g., Eckert *et al.* 2009b), 534 correlations with environmental variables (e.g., Eckert *et al*. 2010, Jaramillo-Correa *et al.* 535 2015), or combinations of these approaches. 'Reverse' ecology approaches connecting 536 genomic data with environmental parameters have also proved useful for identifying the 537 major ecological drivers of adaptation (Levy and Borenstein 2012). This SNP array is 538 therefore highly promising for studies aiming to interpret the signatures left in the genome by 539 different evolutionary forces, making inferences about complex population processes, or 540 investigating geographic patterns of genome-wide genetic variation.

541

```
542 Conclusion
```
543

544 In this study we report the discovery of new SNP markers in maritime pine, from RNA-seq 545 and amplicon resequencing data, and the establishment of an Infinium genotyping array 546 including SNPs that have already been validated. The SNP array presented here represents a 547 major step forward for population and conservation genetics and for breeding in maritime 548 pine. However, this array is subject to a number of limitations. Ascertainment biases, resulting 549 from the small panel of individuals from which SNPs were obtained (ascertainment width)

um and haplotype diversity as metrics for population ge will develop genotyping-by-sequencing approaches, where the problem of ascertainment bias, because the individent Considering allele drop out of genotyping-by-sequenc 550 and from the stringent criteria in terms of minimum allele frequency and read coverage used 551 to retain the SNPs (ascertainment depth), must be taken into account when interpreting the 552 results of future studies of natural populations. A systematic bias would be expected for 553 estimates of nucleotide diversity, inferences about population structure, evolutionary 554 processes based on natural selection and/or historical demographic models, particularly if 555 based on the site frequency spectrum (reviewed by Helyar *et al*. 2011). Furthermore, most of 556 the SNPs were obtained from independent contigs of the UniGene, precluding the use of 557 linkage disequilibrium and haplotype diversity as metrics for population genetic inferences. In 558 the near future, we will develop genotyping-by-sequencing approaches, which should make it 559 possible to decrease the problem of ascertainment bias, because the individuals of interest are 560 sequenced directly. Considering allele drop out of genotyping-by-sequencing approaches 561 which reduces genome complexity through restriction digest (e.g. restriction-site-associated 562 DNA sequencing, Baird et al. 2008) as a major drawbacks for genetic inferences in highly 563 heterozygous species such as maritime pine (Davey et al. 2013, Gautier et al. 2013, Puritz et 564 al. 2014, Mastretta-Yanes et al. 2015), future development of marker technology in this 565 species will be based on sequence capture and direct sequencing (Gnirke et al. 2009).

566

567 **Acknowledgements**

568

569 This study was carried out with financial support from the European Union Sixth and Seventh 570 Framework Programmes: Evoltree (no. 016322), Procogen (no. 289841), Noveltree (no. 571 211868), Forger (no. KBBE-289119), TipTree (BiodivERsA-ERANET); the French National 572 Research Agency: ANR-FLAG (ANR-12ADAP-007-01); the Italian Ministry of Education, 573 University and Scientific Research: Biodiversitalia (RBAP10A2T4); the Spanish Ministry of 574 Science and Innovation: AdapCon (CGL2011-30182-C02-01). We thank C García-Barriga for

Page 25 of 53 Molecular Ecology Resources

ta have been deposited in the short-read archive of
notype 110-4019-1, SRX208012 for genotype 0284-2 a
The assembled contigs of the second maritime pine Un
tigbrowser.toulouse.inra.fr:9092/Pinus_pinaster2/index.
tions 575 DNA extraction. D Grivet was supported by a "Ramón y Cajal" Fellowship from the Spanish 576 Ministry of Science and Innovation, I Lesur by ANR-FLAG and C Boury by Procogen. H 577 Lagraulet received a PhD fellowship from INRA (EFPA division and ACCAF 578 metaprogramme) and Région Aquitaine (no. 20111203004). J Bartholomé was supported by a 579 postdoctoral fellowship from "Conseil Général des Landes". I Rodríguez-Quilón 580 acknowledges a PhD scholarship (FPI-INIA) from the Spanish National Institute for 581 Agricultural and Food Research and Technology and the Spanish Ministry of Science and 582 Innovation. 583 584 **Data accessibility** 585 586 Roche 454 raw data have been deposited in the short-read archive of NCBI (accessions: 587 SRX031589 for genotype 110-4019-1, SRX208012 for genotype 0284-2 and SRX031592 for 588 genotype 112-4-1). The assembled contigs of the second maritime pine UniGene are available 589 from: 590 http://genotoul-contigbrowser.toulouse.inra.fr:9092/Pinus_pinaster2/index.html. 591 592 **Authors' contributions** 593 594 IL and HL: *in silico* SNP detection in mapping populations; IL: SNP array design and SNP 595 annotation; CB, LB, JMG, FB, GGV, DG, IRQ, and SCGM: logistical aspects of genotyping; 596 CB, JB IRQ, and DG: SNP scoring; CP, IL, MdM, MTC, NdM and FH: database compilation 597 from published and unpublished data; JB: linkage mapping; SCGM and DG: population 598 genetics analysis; CP: design of the study and overall coordination. All the authors 599 participated in the writing of the paper, and have read and approved the manuscript submitted.

Page 27 of 53 Molecular Ecology Resources

658 Chagné D, Brown G, Lalanne C, *et al.* (2003) Comparative genome and QTL mapping 659 between maritime and loblolly pines. *Molecular Breeding,* **12**, 185-195.

660

Formular C. *et al.* (2003) Comparative genome and loblolly pines. Molecular Breeding, **12**, 185-195.
 F JB, Lesur I, *et al.* (2013) High density linkage map region associated with inbreeding depression and proximati 661 Chancerel E, Lamy JB, Lesur I, *et al.* (2013) High density linkage mapping in a pine tree 662 reveals a genomic region associated with inbreeding depression and provides clues to the

663 extent and distribution of meiotic recombination. *BMC Biology,* **11**:50.

664

665 Chancerel E, Lepoittevin C, Le Provost G, *et al.* C (2011) Development and implementation

666 of a highly-multiplexed SNP array for genetic mapping in maritime pine and comparative

667 mapping with loblolly pine. *BMC Genomics,* **12**: 368.

668

- 669 Chen J, Källman T, Ma X, *et al.* (2012) Disentangling the roles of history and local selection
- 670 in shaping clinal variation of allelee frequencies and gene expression in Norway spruce (*Picea*
- 671 *abies*). *Genetics,* **191**: 865–881.

672

- 673 Davey JW, Cezard T, Fuentes-Utrilla P, *et al.* (2013) Special features of RAD sequencing
- 674 data: implications for genotyping. *Molecular Ecology,* **22**, 3151–3164.

- 699 Eveno E, Collada C, Guevara MA, *et al.* (2008) Contrasting patterns of selection at *Pinus*
- 700 *pinaster* Ait. drought stress candidate genes as revealed by genetic differentiation analyses.
- 701 *Molecular Biology and Evolution,* **25**, 417-437.

- 703 Falush D, Stephens M, Pritchard JK (2003) Inference of population structure using multilocus
- 704 genotype data: linked loci and correlated allele frequencies. *Genetics,* **164**, 1567–1587.

705

- 706 Ganapathy G, Uyenoyama MK (2009) Site frequency spectra from genomic SNP surveys.
- 707 *Theoretical Population Biology*, **75**, 346–354.

708

709 Gautier M, Gharbi K, Cezard T, *et al.* (2013) The effect of RAD allele dropout on the 710 estimation of genetic variation within and between populations. *Molecular Ecology,* **21**,

711 3165–3178.

712

noyama MK (2009) Site frequency spectra from generation Biology, 75, 346–354.
 For Review Concernsity 15, 346–354.
 For RAD alletic variation within and between populations. Moletic variation within and between populat 713 Gnirke A, Melnikov A, Maguire J, *et al.* (2009) Solution hybrid selection with ultra-long 714 oligonucleotides for massively parallel targeted sequencing. *Nature Biotechnology,* **27**, 182- 715 189.

716

717 Goddard M (2009) Genomic selection: prediction of accuracy and maximisation of long term 718 response. *Genetica,* **136**, 245–257.

- 720 Gonzalez-Martinez SC, Dillon S, Garnier-Géré P, *et al.* (2011). Patterns of nucleotide
- 721 diversity and association mapping. In: *Genetics, Genomics and Breeding of Conifer Trees*
- 722 *(eds. Plomion C, Bousquet J, & Kole C).* pp. 239–275. Edenbridge Science Publishers and
- 723 CRC Press, USA, New-York.

- 770 pine (*Pinus lambertiana* Dougl.) and loblolly pine (*Pinus taeda* L.). *Tree Genetics and*
- 771 *Genomes,* **7**, 457–68.
- 772

- 798 Lefèvre F, Boivin T, Bontemps A, *et al.* (2014) Considering evolutionary processes in
- 799 adaptive forestry. *Annals of Forest Science,* **71**, 723-739
- 800
- 801 Le Provost G, Domergue F, Lalanne C, *et al.* (2013) Cuticular wax: an essential component of
- 802 fast-growing maritime pine saplings to cope with water deficit. *BMC Plant Biology,* **13**, 95.
- 803
- 804 Legarra A, Aguilar I, Misztal I (2009) A relationship matrix including full pedigree and 805 genomic information. *Journal of Dairy Science,* **92**, 4656–4663.
- 806
- 807 Lepoittevin C, Frigerio JM, Garnier-Géré P, *et al.* (2010) *In vitro vs. in silico* detected SNPs
- 808 for the development of a genotyping array: What can we learn from a non-model species? 809 *PLoS ONE,* **5**, e11034.
- 810
- F I, Misztal I (2009) A relationship matrix including

in. *Journal of Dairy Science*, **92**, 4656–4663.

erio JM, Garnier-Géré P, *et al.* (2010) *In vitro vs. in si*

int of a genotyping array: What can we learn from a r
 811 Lepoittevin C, Harvengt L, Plomion C, Garnier-Géré P (2012) Association mapping for 812 growth, straightness and wood-chemistry traits in the *Pinus pinaster* Aquitaine breeding 813 population. *Tree Genetics and Genomes,* **8**, 113–126.
- 814
- 815 Levy R, Borenstein E (2012) Reverse ecology: from systems to environments and back. 816 *Advances in Experimental Medicine and Biology,* **751**, 329-345.
- 817
- 818 Lewis PO, Zaykin D (2001) Genetic Data Analysis: Computer program for the analysis of
- 819 allelic data. Version 1.0 (d16c). Free program distributed by the authors over the internet from
- 820 http://lewis.eeb.uconn.edu/lewishome/software.html.
- 821

- 847 Mollinari M, Margarido GRA, Vencovsky R, Garcia AAF (2009) Evaluation of algorithms
- 848 used to order markers on genetic maps. *Heredity*, **103**, 494-502.
- 849
- 850 Monclus R, Leplé JC, Bastien C, *et al.* (2012) Integrating genome annotation and QTL
- 851 position to identify candidate genes for productivity, architecture and water-use efficiency in
- 852 *Populus* spp. *BMC Plant Biology,* **12**, 173.
- 853
- 854 Mullin TJ, Andersson B, Bastien JC, et al. (2011) Economic importance, breeding objectives
- 855 and achievements. In: *Genetics, Genomics and Breeding of Conifer Trees (eds. Plomion C,*
- 856 *Bousquet J, & Kole C).* pp. 40-127. Edenbridge Science Publishers and CRC Press, USA,
- 857 New-York.
- 858
- 859 Neale DB, Wegrzyn JL, Stevens KA, *et al.* (2014) Decoding the massive genome of loblolly
- 860 pine using haploid DNA and novel assembly strategies. *Genome Biology,* **15**, R59

- **For Review Only** 862 Neale DB, Savolainen O (2004) Association genetics of complex traits in conifers. *Trends in*
- 863 *Plant Science,* **9**, 325–30.

- 865 Nei M (1987) Molecular Evolutionary Genetics. Columbia University Press, USA, New York. 866
- 867 Neves LG, Davis JM, Barbazuk WB, Kirst M (2014) A high-density gene map of loblolly
- 868 pine (*Pinus taeda* L.) based on exome sequence capture genotyping. *Genes, Genomes,* 869 *Genetics,* **4**, 29–37.
- 870
- 871 Nystedt B, Street NR, Wetterbom A, *et al.* (2013) The Norway spruce genome sequence and
- 872 conifer genome evolution. *Nature,* **497**, 579-584.
- 873
- 874 Os H, Stam P, Visser RF, Eck H (2005) RECORD: a novel method for ordering loci on a
- 875 genetic linkage map. *Theoretical and Applied Genetics,* **112**, 30-40.
- 876
- 877 Ouborg NJ, Pertoldi C, Loeschcke V, *et al.* (2010). Conservation genetics in transition to
- 878 conservation genomics. *Trends in Genetics,* **26**, 177–187.
- 879
- 880 Parchman TL, Gompert Z, Mudge J, *et al.* (2012). Genome-wide association genetics of an
- 881 adaptive trait in lodgepole pine. *Molecular Ecology,* **21**, 2991–3005.
- 882
- 883 Pavy N, Gagnon F, Rigault P, et al. (2013) Development of high-density SNP genotyping
- 884 arrays for white spruce (*Picea glauca*) and transferability to subtropical and nordic congeners.
- 885 *Molecular Ecology Resources,* **13**, 324-336
- 886
- 887 Pavy N, Pelgas B, Laroche J, *et al.* (2012) A Spruce gene map infers ancient plant genome
- nics. *Trends in Genetics*, **26**, 177–187.
 Formally Eq. 31, *et al.* (2012). Genome-wide associal

gepole pine. *Molecular Ecology*, **21**, 2991–3005.

Formally P, et al. (2013) Development of high-densit

ruce (*Picea g* 888 reshuffling and subsequent slow evolution in the gymnosperm lineage leading to extant 889 conifers. *BMC Biology,* **10**, 84.
- 890
- 891 Pavy N, Pelgas B, Beauseigle S, *et al.* (2008) Enhancing genetic mapping of complex 892 genomes through the design of highly-multiplexed SNP arrays: application to the large and 893 unsequenced genomes of white spruce and black spruce. *BMC Genomics,* **9**, 21.
- 894

918 stands in France using chloroplast single-sequence repeats. *Annals of Forest Science,* **59**, 53- 919 62.

Page 41 of 53 Molecular Ecology Resources

Figure 1

Figure 3

Synonymous and non-synonymous substitutions in the polymorphic SNPs.

Follow Superintensity in the polymorphic SNR and non-synonymous (NS) mutations at the three consitions and transversions. (A) Synonymous (S) and non-synonymous (NS) mutations at the three codon positions.

(B) Proportion of transitions and transversions.

Figure 5

Figure 6

Table 1

Table 2

