

CV chondrites: More than one parent body

J. Gattacceca, L. Bonal, C. Sonzogni, J. Longerey

To cite this version:

J. Gattacceca, L. Bonal, C. Sonzogni, J. Longerey. CV chondrites: More than one parent body. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 2020, 54, pp.116467. 10.1016/j.epsl.2020.116467. hal-02734079

HAL Id: hal-02734079 <https://hal.inrae.fr/hal-02734079>

Submitted on 22 Oct 2021

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

 CV chondrites are one of the most studied group of carbonaceous chondrites. Based on a 13 number of mineralogical features, they have been divided into three sub-groups: CV_{OxA} , CV_{OxB}, and CV_{Red}. These sub-groups are classically interpreted as coming from a single parent body, with a common protolith affected by significant parent body fluid-assisted metasomatism occurring at different temperatures and/or redox conditions. In this work, we studied a set of 53 CV chondrites. We classified them into the three sub-groups, measured their apparent chondrule sizes and their matrix modal abundance. We measured the triple oxygen isotopic composition for 17 of them. The distributions of chondrule size and matrix 20 abundances in CV_{OxA} and CV_{OxB} cannot be statistically distinguished. Conversely, CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} have distinct distributions. These two robust and simple petrographic indicators combined with the previous knowledge of the peak metamorphic temperatures experienced by 23 these meteorites show that CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} originate from two distinct parent bodies. On the 24 other hand, CV_{OxA} and CV_{OxB} likely originate from the same parent body, with CV_{OxA} representing deeper, more metamorphosed levels. For clarification of the chondrite 26 classification scheme, in which one group should ultimately represent a single parent body, 27 we propose to divide the CV group into two proper groups (and not subgroups as is the current 28 scheme), keeping the names CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} . These two groups can be readily separated by estimating the average nickel content of their sulfides.

1. Introduction

 Most meteorites come from the main asteroid belt. They are extracted from asteroids by impact under the form of meteoroids (~ centimeter- to meter-sized objects), that orbit in the interplanetary space for typically a few Myr before colliding with the Earth (e.g., Eugster et al., 2006; Gravnik and Brown, 2018). The 60000 meteorites registered to date by the Meteoritical Society are classified into groups (e.g., Weisberg et al., 2006). The general idea behind grouping is that meteorites from a group derive from the same primary parent body (*senso* Greenwood et al. (2020), i.e., the source body from which the meteorite ultimately derived), in most cases an asteroid. This is strictly applicable to chondrites, the classification for achondrites being a little less coherent. For instance, meteorites originating from asteroid Vesta are separated into three groups (eucrites, diogenites, howardites) and meteorites originating from Mars are separated into several groups as well (shergottites, nakhlites, …). 43 However, even for chondrites, it is not established that all meteorites within a group come 44 from a single parent body, although this would be the ultimate objective of the classification 45 scheme. CM chondrites, for instance, have been proposed to come from multiple parent bodies (e.g., Lee et al. 2019), but there has been no success in separating them into coherent sub-groups originating from distinct parent bodies.

 The current classification scheme contains 50 groups (Weisberg et al., 2006). In addition, there are a number of ungrouped meteorites that derive from parent bodies that are not represented by these groups. This number can be roughly estimated to be a maximum of 50

 distinct parent bodies for ungrouped iron meteorites, and a maximum of 50 for ungrouped chondrites, based on the Meteoritical Bulletin Database. The total number of asteroids represented in the global meteorite collection is thus about 150 at most. A similar estimate of ~110 asteroids was reached based on consideration of oxygen isotopes (Greenwood et al., 2017). A more recent estimate, also based on consideration of oxygen isotopes, places the number of parent bodies between 95 and 148 (Greenwood et al., 2020). In this total, the number of chondrite parent bodies is estimated to be approximately 15 to 20, with an additional 11 to 17 parent bodies to account for ungrouped chondrites (Greenwood et al., 2020). Whatever the exact number of parent bodies represented in the global meteorite collection, it is almost negligible compared to the number of asteroids in the main belt, over one million asteroids larger than 1 km (Burbine et al., 2002). This suggests at first sight that meteorites are not representative at all of the asteroid population. However, asteroids were 63 formed as bodies $>$ ~35 km (Delbo et al., 2017). The smaller asteroids in the present-day asteroid belt belong to dynamical families and thus represent fragments of a small number (several dozens) of shattered planetesimals (Delbo et al., 2017). In addition to these fragments, the asteroid belt contains a small number (about a hundred) of pristine planetesimals with a diameter above ~35 km (Delbo et al., 2017). Therefore, with about 150 groups, meteorites may provide a rather exhaustive sampling of the planetesimals (shattered and pristine) that are present today in the asteroid belt. This justifies paying particular care to the grouping of meteorites into groups that actually originate from distinct primary parent bodies, especially for chondrites that are distributed within only 15 groups. Deciphering the parent body history, in terms of accretion (timing and physico-chemical environment) and evolution (thermal metamorphism and possible differentiation, aqueous alteration, and shock histories), also requires that the classification scheme efficiently separates groups of meteorites that were formed on different parent bodies.

 CV chondrites are a fairly abundant type of carbonaceous chondrites with 525 meteorites registered by the Meteoritical Society to date (21% of the total number of carbonaceous chondrites). They are classically interpreted as coming from a single parent body (e.g., Krot et 79 al, 1995). They have been divided into reduced (CV_{Red}) and oxidized (CV_{Ox}) sub-groups, based on a number of mineralogical features, the Ni content of sulfides and the abundance of Fe,Ni metal (McSween, 1977). The oxidized sub-group has been further divided into Allende-82 (CV_{OxA}) and Bali- (CV_{OxB}) like sub-groups, based on a combination of chemical and petrographic criteria (e.g., Krot et al., 1998; Bonal et al., 2020). Although an in-depth discussion of relations between CK and CV chondrites is beyond the scope of this paper, we note that it had also been proposed that CK chondrites may come from a more thermally metamorphosed (deeper) part of the same CV parent body based on compositional and oxygen isotope evidence (e.g., Wasson et al., 2013; Greenwood et al., 2010). On these bases, 88 it was proposed to make CK chondrites a new sub-group of CV chondrites named CV_{OxK} (Greenwood et al., 2010). However, this interpretation has been later challenged by the different magnetite composition (Dunn et al., 2016) and the different chromium isotopic 91 composition between CV and CK (Yin and Sanborn, 2019).

 The present-day paradigm is that all CV chondrites come from a single parent asteroid, with a common protolith affected by significant parent body fluid-assisted metasomatism occurring at different temperatures and/or redox conditions (Krot et al., 1995; Ganino and 95 Libourel, 2017). In this work we will argue that although CV_{OxA} and CV_{OxB} are likely to 96 originate from a single parent body, CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} originate from two distinct parent bodies.

2. Material and methods

 We investigated a suite of 53 CV chondrites. The main dataset is composed of 30 meteorites (7 falls and 23 finds, mostly from Antarctica) whose thermal metamorphism and aqueous alteration history, matrix abundances, modal metal abundances, and sub-103 classification into CV_{OxA}, CV_{OxB} , and CV_{Red} have been characterized previously (Bonal et al., 2020). This dataset was completed by 23 meteorites from hot deserts, mostly from Northwest Africa (NWA meteorites). For this new set of meteorites, we determined the sub-group (OxA, OxB or Red) by combining proxies (mostly the average Ni content of sulfides, the Fe,Ni metal abundance, and magnetic parameters) that have been shown to allow for a clear separation of the three sub-groups (Bonal et al., 2020). We also estimated the modal abundance of fine-grained matrix. We then estimated the apparent chondrule diameters for all 53 meteorites. For a subset of samples, we measured the bulk oxygen isotopic composition by laser fluorination coupled with isotope-ratio mass spectrometry.

 The chemical compositions of sulfides and Fe,Ni metal were determined using either a Cameca SX100 electron microprobe at CAMPARIS facility (15 kV accelerating voltage, 10 nA current), or a Hitachi S3000-N Scanning Electron Microscope equipped with a Bruker X-ray Energy Dispersive Spectrometer at CEREGE. Both natural and synthetic standards were used for calibration.

117 Magnetic susceptibility (χ) was measured at CEREGE, using a MFK1 apparatus from 118 Agico in an AC field of 200 A.m⁻¹ (peak field) and frequency 976 Hz. For easiness, it is 119 expressed in the following as logy, with χ in 10⁻⁹ m³/kg.

 Chondrule apparent diameters were determined from mosaic images obtained by reflected and/or transmitted light microscopy on thin and/or thick polished sections using a Leica 122 DM2500P microscope. Intact chondrules were outlined manually. Igneous chondrule rims, that are abundant in CV chondrites (Rubin, 1984), were included in the chondrule outline 124 since they are obviously a pre-accretionary feature. The chondrule outlines were processed

125 using imageJ software and fitted with ellipses to extract chondrule apparent diameters. Most chondrules are not spheres but ellipsoids, giving an ellipse rather than a circle when observed 127 in section. The maximum and minimum axes of the ellipses, noted a and b, were determined 128 to estimate the aspect ratio of the chondrule. Chondrule apparent diameter was computed as $\sqrt{a.b}$, which is the diameter of the circle with equivalent surface to the observed chondrule. 130 This method is slightly different from the simple averaging of a and b that is used classically 131 in the literature (e.g., Nelson and Rubin, 2002) and provide systematically higher diameter 132 estimates. However, the difference between the two methods is negligible (less than 1% for the typical aspect ratios observed in CV chondrules), so our results can be safely compared 134 with literature data. Because chondrules are igneous fragments with almost no initial porosity, 135 their volume will not change upon deformation. Our method therefore provides a more 136 reliable estimate of the initial diameter of the initially spherical chondrules.

 Modal metal abundances were determined by reflected light optical microscopy on polished sections by point-counting using a x500 magnification and a step size of 100 μm. The modal abundances of fine-grained matrix were determined by reflected and transmitted light optical microscopy on polished and thin sections by point-counting using a x200 magnification and a step size of 100 µm. The 95% confidence intervals around the modal abundances were computed after Howarth (1998).

 Measurements of oxygen isotopic compositions of 1.5 mg aliquots of bulk gently powdered CV meteorites were carried out at the Stable Isotopes Laboratory of CEREGE using laser fluorination coupled with isotope ratio mass spectrometry (IRMS) (see e.g., Alexandre et al., 2006; Suavet et al., 2010 for more details about the analytical procedure). The initial sample mass was 112 mg on average to ensure that measured aliquot is representative of the bulk meteorite. The three oxygen isotopic compositions were measured with a dual-inlet mass spectrometer ThermoScientific Delta V plus. The oxygen isotope

150 results are expressed in ‰ versus the international reference standard V-SMOW: $\delta^{18}O =$ $[({}^{18}O/{}^{16}O)_{sample}/({}^{18}O/{}^{16}O)_{V-SMOW}$ -1] $\times 1000$ and $\delta^{17}O = [({}^{17}O/{}^{16}O)_{sample}/({}^{17}O/{}^{16}O)_{V-SMOW}$ -152 1] \times 1000. The δ^{18} O and δ^{17} O values of the reference gas were calibrated with measurements of 153 NBS28 standard ($\delta^{18}O=9.60\%$, Gröning, 2004). The $\delta^{17}O$ value of the NBS28 standard is 154 taken as $\delta^{17}O = 4.992\%$, to ensure $\Delta^{17}O = 0\%$, where $\Delta^{17}O = \delta^{17}O - 0.52 \times \delta^{18}O$. The 155 measurements were corrected on a daily basis using 1.5 mg quartz internal laboratory 156 standard "Boulangé" (Alexandre et al., 2006; Suavet et al., 2010). During the analyzing 157 period, the analytical uncertainties derived from repeated measurement (n = 16) of this 158 internal laboratory standard are 0.08 ‰, 0.14 ‰, 0.013 ‰ for $\delta^{17}O$, $\delta^{18}O$ and $\Delta^{17}O$, 159 respectively.

160 A number of datasets were compared using the Kolmogorov-Smirnov (K-S) statistical test 161 for two populations performed using Holliday (2017). The K-S test is used to tests the null 162 hypothesis that the two data sets are from the same distribution. It provides a p value that 163 must be compared to the *a priori* level of significance (α). If $p>\alpha$, the null hypothesis cannot 164 be rejected. If $p<\alpha$, the null hypothesis is rejected. The significance level α has a specific 165 meaning: it is the probably of rejecting the null hypothesis when it is true. α is classically set 166 at 0.05, and we use this value in this work.

167

168 **3. Results**

169 All meteorites could be readily classified into one of the three sub-groups (Ox_A, Ox_B, Red) , based mostly on the Ni content in sulfides and their magnetic susceptibility (Table 1, Figure 1). Unlike for fresh Antarctic meteorites and falls, the modal metal abundance in hot desert meteorites is not a reliable proxy for the separation into the three subgroups because metal is extensively altered into oxides and oxyhydroxides through terrestrial weathering during the residence of the meteorites in hot deserts. Magnetic susceptibility remains

175 nevertheless a reliable proxy to separate CV_{OxA} from CV_{OxB} . Indeed, although terrestrial 176 weathering of metal-bearing meteorites does result in a decrease of magnetic susceptibility 177 (e.g., Rochette et al., 2003), it does not affect magnetite which is the main ferromagnetic 178 mineral in CV_{Ox} . Therefore, the cut-off value at $log\chi=3.9-4$ for separation of CV_{OxA} from 179 CV_{OxB} remains valid. On the contrary, the susceptibility of hot desert CV_{Red} is lower on 180 average than that measured for falls and Antarctic CV_{Red}, with $\log \chi = 4.12 \pm 0.45$ (n=10) 181 against 4.36 ± 0.22 (n=5) for Antarctic CV_{Red} and 4.52 ± 0.22 (n=3) for CV_{Red} falls (Rochette 182 et al., 2008; Bonal et al., 2020). But CV_{Red} are easily distinguished from CV_{Ox} based on the 183 average Ni content of sulfides.

184 The 23 CV3 chondrites from hot deserts separate into 4 CV_{OxA} , 9 CV_{OxB} , 10 CV_{Red} . 185 Together with the 30 meteorites studied in Bonal et al. (2020), the dataset comprises 14 186 CV_{OxA}, 20 CV_{OxB}, 19 CV_{Red}. The number of CV_{OxB} goes down to 18 when considering the 187 pairing of Antarctic meteorites proposed by Bonal et al. (2020).

188 A total of 2806 chondrule apparent diameters were measured (Table 1). We did not attempt 189 any correction to calculate a true (3D) size distribution from the 2D apparent size because it 190 has been shown that many correction models yield erroneous values and should not be applied 191 to chondrule size distributions (Metzler, 2018). Average values for the three sub-groups are 192 given in Table 2. Although the chondrule diameters of all CV chondrites are usually pooled 193 together to indicate an approximate mean apparent diameter of 900 µm (Friedrich 2015), our 194 data show that CV chondrites actually have an average diameter of 801 μ m (n=2806). 195 Moreover, CV_{Red} meteorites have, on average, larger chondrules than CV_{Ox} meteorites 196 (860 µm versus 768 µm). The size distributions of the sub-groups were compared using the 197 K-S test (Table 3, Figure 2). The hypothesis that the chondrule size distributions of CV_{OxA} 198 and CV_{OxB} are different cannot be rejected ($p = 0.056 > \alpha = 0.05$), whereas the chondrule size 199 distributions of CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} are different (p = 6.78x10⁻¹⁰ < α = 0.05).

200 Matrix modal abundances are also different between CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} meteorites with 201 average values 52.3 vol. % and 40.3 vol. %, respectively (Table 2). Their distributions were 202 compared using the K-S test (Table 3). With $p=1.23 \times 10^{-4}$, the matrix abundance distributions 203 of CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} are different. Conversely, the distributions of matrix abundances in CV_{OxA} 204 and CV_{OxB} cannot be distinguished at the 5% significance level ($p = 0.295 > \alpha = 0.05$).

205 Oxygen isotopes were measured in this study for 17 CV chondrites (Table 4). Literature 206 data are available for another 56 CV chondrites (Table 5, Figure 3), but most of these 207 chondrites are not subclassified into CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} . It has been noted earlier that CV 208 chondrite can have heterogeneous oxygen isotopic composition (Greenwood et al., 2010). 209 This is attributable to the small mass analyzed (usually in the mg range), combined with the 210 size of their petrographic components: chondrules, calcium-aluminum inclusions (CAIs) and 211 matrix lumps can be mm-sized and have widely variable oxygen isotopic composition 212 (Clayton and Mayeda, 1999). In this study, we started from as large as possible bulk samples 213 before analyzing a 1.5 mg aliquot. To reduce this homogeneity issue, when multiple analyses 214 are available from the literature and our analyses, we use the average value (Table 5). 215 Combining our new data and literature data, oxygen isotopic composition is available for 7 216 CV_{OxA}, 10 CV_{OxB}, 4 CV_{Ox}, and 16 CV_{Red}. In a three-isotope plot, the data are distributed 217 along a line with slope 0.94 (Clayton, 1993), called the carbonaceous chondrite anhydrous 218 mineral (CCAM) line. Therefore, the discussion can be limited to either $\delta^{18}O$ or $\delta^{17}O$. The 219 distributions of $\delta^{18}O$ for the three sub-groups were tested using the K-S test. Again, the 220 hypothesis that CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} have identical distributions can be rejected at the 5% 221 significance level ($p = 6.0x10^{-5} < \alpha = 0.05$), whereas CV_{OxA} and CV_{OxB} distribution cannot be 222 distinguished at the same significance level ($p = 0.117 > \alpha = 0.05$). This latter observation 223 contradicts previous observations that CV_{OxB} have a heavier oxygen isotopic than CV_{OxA} 224 (Clayton and Mayeda, 1999; Greenwood, 2010), which was interpreted as more extensive

225 aqueous alteration in CV_{OxB} than in CV_{OxA} . We attribute this discrepancy to the more limited dataset used in previous studies.

4. Discussion

 The distribution of matrix abundances and chondrule apparent diameters are identical for 230 CV_{OxA} and CV_{OxB} chondrites but significantly different between CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} chondrites. Regarding chondrule apparent diameter, it is noteworthy that chondrules are usually not spherical but ellipsoidal. This flattening, also observed at microscopic scale (Bland et al., 2011) is likely due to hypervelocity impacts (e.g., Gattacceca et al., 2005). However, the 234 larger apparent chondrule diameters of CV_{Red} compared to CV_{Ox} cannot be attributed to the 235 effect of chondrule flattening. First, CV_{Red} chondrules are only slightly more flattened than 236 CV_{Ox} chondrules, with average aspect ratio 1.33 and 1.27, respectively (Table 2). Second, we estimated the effect of the flattening of spherical chondrules into oblate ellipsoids on the average apparent surface of the chondrules in polished sections (Supplementary figure S1). This was done using an analytical solution for the intersection of plane and ellipsoids (Klein, 2012). The effect is a decrease of the apparent surface for increasing flattening. The effect is small (about 0.5% average apparent diameter decrease for an aspect ratio of 1.35), and more 242 importantly it is the opposite of what is observed: CV_{Red} are slightly more flattened on 243 average than CV_{Ox} , but they have larger chondrules. The difference in chondrule size 244 distribution between CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} is therefore a primary feature from the time of accretion, and is not related to secondary parent body processes (shock).

 Regarding matrix abundance, it is noteworthy than hypervelocity impacts will reduce matrix porosity (e.g., Bland et al., 2011; Rubin, 2012) and reduce its modal abundance compared to chondrules that have sub-null initial porosity. However, although it often 249 assumed that CV_{Red} are more shocked than CV_{Ox} on average based on a very limited number

250 of unusually shocked CV_{Red} (mostly Leoville and Efremovka), it has been shown recently that 251 this is not the case. Indeed, shock stages for CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} have essentially the same distribution (Bonal et al., 2020). This is confirmed here by the almost identical chondrule 253 apparent aspect ratio for CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} (Tables 1 and 2). Therefore, the difference in matrix 254 abundance distribution between CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} is also a primary feature from the time of accretion.

 These two robust petrographic indicators (chondrule size and matrix abundance) can be 257 interpreted in two different ways: CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} originate from different stratigraphic position within a single parent body, or from two distinct parent bodies. Different stratigraphic positions in an asteroid with "onion-shell" structure would imply contrasted metamorphic temperatures with the deeper group being metamorphosed to higher 261 temperatures. This is not observed, as both CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} meteorites span the whole range 262 of type 3 metamorphic subtypes (Bonal et al., 2020). Therefore, CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} meteorites 263 must originate from two different parent bodies. The existence of CV_{Ox} clasts in Vigarano CV_{Red} regolith breccia (Krot et al., 2000), often used as an evidence for a single parent body is not a decisive argument as xenolithic clasts from different meteorite groups are found in a number of meteorites. About 5% of impacts in the main asteroid belt should occur at velocities that are below the estimated survivable impact velocity for stony meteorites (Bottke et al., 1994; Bland, 2001), so that chondritic xenoliths are expected in chondrites, especially for chondrites from the same clan that are interpreted to come from parent bodies located at similar heliocentric distances. For instance, several ordinary chondrites contain cm-size clasts from another ordinary chondrite group (e.g., Gattacceca et al., 2017).

 CV_{OxA} and CV_{OxB} cannot be distinguished in terms of chondrule size and matrix abundance. As such they may well originate from the same parent body. It was recently 274 evidenced that CV_{OxA} are systematically more metamorphosed than CV_{OxB} , with a continuum 275 spanning all the petrographic subtypes 3.0 to \geq 3.7 (Bonal et al., 2020). Such a distribution of 276 metamorphic grades is very unlikely to be casual and strongly suggests that indeed, CV_{OxA} 277 represent deeper level than CV_{OxB} in a single and thermally stratified parent body. A potential 278 counter-argument is that experimental data show that dehydration by heating of a 279 phyllosilicate-bearing rock should result in a shift towards heavier oxygen isotopic 280 composition (Mayeda and Clayton, 1998). Such a trend is not seen in the oxygen isotopic 281 distributions of CV_{OxA} and CV_{OxB} , that cannot be distinguished by the K-S test. However, $282 \text{ CV}_{\text{Ox}}$ chondrites are complex rocks with only a minor fraction of phyllosilicates, a few wt.% 283 at most (Bonal et al., 2020), so that the effect of dehydration of phyllosilicates during thermal 284 metamorphism would not be significant compared to the natural inhomogeneity of oxygen 285 isotopic composition of CV chondrites discussed above.

286 The difference between CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} in terms of oxygen isotopic composition may be a 287 primary feature acquired at the time of accretion, or a secondary parent body feature. A parent 288 body origin can be tested by assuming an original identical oxygen isotopic composition later 289 modified by aqueous alteration and/or thermal metamorphism. We tested the correlation 290 between δ^{18} O and quantitative proxies describing aqueous alteration and thermal 291 metamorphism (Figure 4). For aqueous alteration we use the total mass loss between 200 and 292 900 °C during thermogravimetric analyses (TGA) that increases with increasing hydration of 293 the meteorite. For thermal metamorphism, we use the Raman spectral parameter $FWHM_D$ that 294 decreases with increasing peak metamorphic temperature. The TGA and Raman parameters 295 are from Bonal et al. (2020). We see no correlation between $\delta^{18}O$ and TGA parameters 296 $(R^2=0.007)$, suggesting no straightforward influence of aqueous alteration on the oxygen 297 isotopic composition of CV chondrites. There is a correlation between $\delta^{18}O$ and the Raman 298 spectroscopy parameter FWHM_D (R^2 =0.27, Figure 4). Such a correlation suggests that higher 299 metamorphic temperatures result in heavier oxygen isotope compositions. This can be accounted for by the effects of metamorphic heating, such as recrystallization or dehydration, 301 that would result in an increase of δ^{18} O by mass fractionation. But the observed correlation is 302 faint (R^2 =0.27), and it does not hold at all if we consider CV_{OxA} and CV_{OxB} subgroups. Eventually, we find no robust correlation between the peak metamorphic temperature or the degree of aqueous alteration, and the oxygen isotopic composition of CV chondrites: no global parent body processes is able to account for the observed distribution of oxygen 306 isotopic compositions in CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} chondrites. Therefore, the difference in isotopic 307 composition between CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} is more likely controlled by subtle differences in the abundances of petrographic components (matrix, chondrules, CAIs for instance), or by accretion at slightly different distances from the Sun implying reservoirs with slightly different oxygen isotopic compositions.

 Cosmic ray exposure (CRE) ages, that represent the transit time of a meteorite (under the form of a meteoroid) from the asteroid belt to the Earth are another useful proxy in the discussion about whether different meteorites may originate from a single parent body. Similar CRE ages may indicate provenance from the same parent body affected by a major disruption event. However, the dataset of CRE ages for CV chondrites is limited to 4, 5, and 3 316 ages available for CV_{OxA} , CV_{OxB} and CV_{Red} , respectively (Schere and Schultz, 2000). The three sub-groups span broadly the same time interval of CRE ages between 1.7 and 28.1 Ma, 318 with average CRE ages 16.0 ± 7.8 Ma (n=4) for CV_{OxA}, 11.0 ± 9.4 Ma (n=5) for CV_{OxB}, 13.2 \pm 9.1 Ma (n=9) for all CV_{Ox}, and 8.6 \pm 2.2 Ma (n=3) for CV_{Red}. Because of the limited dataset, CRE ages cannot be used to discuss the hypothesis of a single or multiple parent bodies for CV chondrite sub-groups.

322 We have demonstrated that CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} meteorites come from two distinct parent 323 bodies. Because the ultimate goal in chondrite classification is that a chondrite group 324 represents one parent body, CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} should be separated into two proper groups. 325 Chondrite groups are classically, but not systematically, named after the first fall of the group. 326 Strictly speaking, the CV appellation, that comes from Vigarano CV_{Red} fall, should be 327 applicable only to CV_{Red} chondrites, and an alternative name should be defined for CV_{Ox} 328 chondrites. Such a name could be CA for the iconic Allende meteorite, because all other CV_{0x} 329 fall names (except Grosnaja) initiate with letters already in use for other meteorite groups. 330 However, because there are already thousands of scientific publications about Allende and 331 other CV_{Ox} meteorites calling them CV, it very likely that such an appellation would 332 encounter strong resistance from the meteorite community. Therefore, the best names for 333 these two separate meteorite groups are probably simply CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} , where the 334 reference to Vigarano remain somewhat valid since this meteorite contains material from both 335 associated parent bodies. We hope that from now on, CV chondrites will be required to be 336 declared to the Meteoritical Society as CV_{Ox} or CV_{Red} , and not only as CV. On the other hand, 337 the distinction between CV_{OxA} and CV_{OxB} is only related to thermal metamorphic intensity 338 and could be overlooked in the classification scheme.

339 On a practical point of view, the easiest and most robust way to separate CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} is to estimate the average Ni content of sulfides. Indeed, in contrast to metal abundance or magnetic parameters, this indicator is not much affected by terrestrial weathering. Analyses of 342 a random selection of about 10 to 20 sulfide grains is enough to decide between CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} and can be performed routinely during classification work using either an electron microprobe or a scanning electron microscope equipped with an energy dispersive spectrometer.

346

347 **5. Conclusions**

348 The comparison of chondrule size distribution, matrix abundances, metamorphic history 349 (and marginally oxygen isotopic composition) of the three sub-groups of CV chondrites 350 indicate that CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} originate from distinct parent bodies. In view of the many 351 petrographic, compositional and isotopic similarities between CV_{Ox} and CV_{Red} , these two parent bodies may have however formed at roughly the same heliocentric distance and time.

353 On the other hand, CV_{OxA} and CV_{OxB} likely originate from the same parent body, with CV_{OxA} representing deeper, more metamorphosed levels of the original asteroid with onion- shell structure. This new view must be considered in future works about the formation and evolution of these two parent bodies, as results (existing and to come) must be interpreted in two separate frameworks.

 For clarification of the chondrite classification scheme, in which one group should 359 represent a parent body, we propose to break the CV group into two proper groups (and not 360 subgroups as is the current scheme), keeping the names CV_{Red} and CV_{Ox} . These two groups can be readily separated by estimating the average nickel content of their sulfides.

Acknowledgements

 We thank two anonymous reviewers for their constructive comments. We thank Yoann Quesnel for coding the computation of the effect of flattening on chondrule apparent diameters. We thank Jeff Grossman for useful discussion about meteorite nomenclature.

Figure captions

 Figure 1: Ni content of sulfides versus magnetic susceptibility for the CV chondrites studied 370 in this work. Light blue= CV_{OxA} , deep blue= CV_{OxB} , red = CV_{Red} . Circles are for hot desert meteorites (this study), squares are for Antarctic meteorites and falls (Bonal et al., 2020).

Figure 2: Cumulative percentile plots for apparent chondrule size, matrix abundance and

374 δ^{18} O. Light blue = CV_{OxA}, deep blue=CV_{OxB}, black=CV_{Ox}, red=CV_{Red}.

 Figure 3: Oxygen isotopic composition of CV chondrites. The CCAM line is from Clayton (1993).

 Figure 4: Oxygen isotopic composition versus (a) the total mass loss as measured by TGA 380 between 200 and 900 $^{\circ}$ C, (b) the Raman spectral parameter FWHM_D. The TGA parameters reflects the present-day hydration state of the samples, while the Raman parameters the 382 experienced peak metamorphic temperature. Light blue = CV_{OxA} , deep blue= CV_{OxB} , red= CV_{Red} .

 Supplementary figure S1: Effect of flattening on the average apparent diameters of chondrules. This graph shows the ratio of the average equivalent diameters (i.e., diameter of the disk with equivalent surface) of the of the intersection of ellipsoids with planes of random orientation as a function of the aspect ratio of these ellipsoids. To simulate the case of chondrules flattening by impacts, the case considered here is for oblate ellipsoids that have identical long and intermediate axis. The initial diameter considered here for normalizing the ellipsoid diameter assumes volume conservation during flattening.

Table captions

Table 1. CV chondrites physical, petrological and geochemical properties

 Metal abundance: *tr* indicate that traces of metal have been observed. No polished section was available for GRA 06101. References: R2008= Rochette et al. (2008), B2020 = Bonal et al. (2020).

Table 3: Kolmogorov-Smirnov test results.

N is the number of meteorites in the considered population. The hypothesis that the two

403 distributions are identical can be rejected if $p > \alpha$. If $p < \alpha$, this hypothesis cannot be rejected.

404 α is the significance level of the K-S test and is taken as 0.05 in this study.

Table 4: CV3 oxygen isotopic compositions measured in this study.

 Table 5: summary of CV3 oxygen isotopic compositions. References: C&M1999= Clayton and Mayeda, 1999; G2010= Greenwood, 2010; MDB= Meteoritical Society Meteorite Database (https://www.lpi.usra.edu/meteor/).

References

 Alexandre, A., Basile-Doelsch, I., Sonzogni, C., Sylvestre, F., Parron, C., Meunier, J.-D., Colin, F., 2006. Oxygen isotope analyses of fine silica grains using laser-extraction technique: Comparison with oxygen isotope data obtained from ion microprobe analyses and application to quartzite and silcrete cement investigation. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 70, 2827–2835.

 Bland, P. A., 2001. Quantification of meteorite infall rates from accumulations in deserts, and meteorite accumulations on Mars. In Accretion of extraterrestrial matter throughout Earth's history, edited by Peucker-Ehrenbrink B. and Schmitz B. New York: Kluwer Academic/Plenum Publishers. pp. 267–303.

 Bland, P.A., Howard, L.E., Prior, D.J., Wheeler, J., Hough, R.M., Dyl, K.A., 2011. Earliest rock fabric formed in the Solar System preserved in a chondrule rim. Nature Geoscience 4, 244-247.

- Bonal, L., Gattacceca, J., Garenne, A., Eschrig, J., Rochette, P., Krämer Ruggiu, L., 2020. Water and heat: new constraints on the evolution of the CV chondrite parent body. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 276, 363-383.
- Bottke, W. F. Jr., Nolan, M. C., Greenberg, R., Kolvoord, R. A., 1994. Velocity distributions among colliding asteroids. Icarus 107, 255-268.
- Burbine, T.H., McCoy, T.J., Meibom, A., Gladman, B., Keil, K., 2002. Meteoriticparent
- bodies: their number and identification. In: Bottke, W.F., Cellino, A.,Paolicchi, P., Binzel, R.P. (Eds.), Asteroids III. University of Arizona Press, Tucson, pp. 653–667.
- Clayton, R. N., 1993. Oxygen isotopes in meteorites. Ann. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci. 21, 115- 149.
- Clayton, R.N., Mayeda, T.K., 1999. Oxygen isotope studies of carbonaceous chondrites. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 63, 2089–2104.
- Delbo, M., Walsh, K., Avdellidou, C., Morbidelli, A., 2017. Identification of a primordial asteroid family constrains the original planetesimal population. Science 357, 1026- 1029.
- Dunn, T. L., Gross, J., Ivanova, M. A., Runyon, S. E., Bruck, A. M., 2016. Magnetite in the unequilibrated CK chondrites: Implications for metamorphism and new insights into the relationship between the CV and CK chondrites. Meteoritics Planet. Sci. 51, 1701-1720.
- Eugster, O., Herzog, G.F., Marti, K., Caffee, M.W., 2006. Irradiation records, cosmic-ray exposure ages, and transfer times of meteorites, in Meteorites and the Early Solar System II, pp. 829-851.
- Friedrich, J. M., Weisberg, M. K., Ebel, D. S., Biltz, A. E., Corbett, B. M., Iotzov, I. V., Khan, W. S., Wolman, M. D., 2015. Chondrule size and related physical properties: A compilation and evaluation of current data across all meteorite groups. Chemie der Erde 75, 419-443.
- Ganino, C., Libourel, G., 2017. Reduced and unstratified crust in CV chondrite parent body. Nature Communications 8, 261.
- Gattacceca, J., Krzesinska, A.M., Marrocchi, Y., Meier, M.M., Bourot-Denise, M., Lenssen,
- R., 2017. Young asteroid mixing revealed in ordinary chondrites: the case of NWA
- 5764, a polymict LL breccia with L clasts. Meteoritics Planet. Sci. 52, 2289-2304.
- Gattacceca, J., Rochette, P., Denise, M., Consolmagno, G., Folco, L., 2005. An impact origin for the foliation of ordinary chondrites. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 234, 351-368.
- Gravnik, M., Brown, P., 2018. Identification of meteorite source regions in the Solar System. Icarus 311, 271-287.
- Greenwood, R.C., Franchi, I.A., Kearsley, A.T., Alard, O., 2010. The relationship between CK and CV chondrites. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 74, 1684-1705.
- Greenwood, R.C., Burbine, T.H., Miller, M.F., Franchi, I.A., 2017. Melting and differentiation of early-formed asteroids: The perspective from high precision oxygen isotope studies. Chemie der Erde – Geochemistry 77,1-43.
- Greenwood, R.C., Burbine, T.H., Franchi, I.A., 2020. Linking asteroids and meteorites to the primordial planetesimal population. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2020.02.004
- Gröning, M., 2004. Chapter 40 International Stable Isotope Reference Materials. In Handbook of Stable Isotope Analytical Techniques. pp. 874–906.
- Holliday, I.E., 2017. Kolmogorov-Smirnov Test (v1.0.4) in Free Statistics Software (v1.2.1),
- Office for Research Development and Education, URL https://www.wessa.net/rwasp_Reddy-Moores%20K-S%20Test.wasp/
- Howarth, R.J., 1998. Improved estimators of uncertainty in proportions, point-counting, and
- pass-fail test results. American J. Sci. 298, 594-607.
- Klein, P.P., 2012. On the ellipsoid and plane intersection equation. Applied Mathematics 3, 1634-1640.
- Krot, A.N., Scott, E.R.D., Zolensky, M.E., 1995. Mineralogical and chemical modification of components in CV3 chondrites: Nebular or asteroidal processing? Meteoritics 30, 748- 775.
- Krot, A.N., Petaev, M.I., Scott, E.R.D., Choi, B.-G., Zolensky, M.E., Keil, K., 1998. Progressive alteration in CV3 chondrites: More evidence for asteroidal alteration. Meteoritics Planet. Sci. 33, 1065-1085.
- Krot, A.N., Meibom, A., Keil, K., 2000. A clast of Bali-like oxidized CV material in the
- reduced CV chondrite breccia Vigarano. Meteoritics Planet. Sci. 35, 817-825.
- Lee, M.R., Cohen, B.E., King, A.J., Greenwood, R.C., 2019. The diversity of CM carbonaceous chondrite parent bodies explored using Lewis Cliff 85311. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 264, 224-244.
- McSween, H.Y., 1977. Petrographic variations among carbonaceous chondrites of the Vigarano type. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 41, 1777-1790.
- Mayeda, T.K., Clayton, R.N., 1998. Oxygen isotope effects in serpentine dehydration. Lunar Planet. Sci. Conf. 29, abstract #1405.
- Metzler, K., 2018. From 2D to 3D chondrule size data: Some empirical ground truths. Meteoritics Planet. Sci 53, 489-1499.
- Nelson, V.E., Rubin, A., 2002. Size-frequency distributions of chondrules and chondrule
- fragments in LL3 chondrites: Implications for parent-body fragmentation of chondrules. Meteoritics Planet. Sci. 37, 1361-1376.
- Rochette, P., Sagnotti, L., Bourot-Denise, M., Consolmagno, G., Folco, L., Gattacceca, J.,
- Osete, M. L., Pesonen, L., 2003. Magnetic Classification of stony meteorites: 1.
- Ordinary chondrites. Meteoritics Planet. Sci. 38, 251-258.
- Rochette, P., Gattacceca, J., Bonal, L., Bourot-Denise, M., Chevrier, V., Clerc, J.-P.,
- Consolmagno, G., Folco, L., Gounelle, M., Kohout, T., Pesonen, L., Quirico, E.,
- Sagnotti, L., Skripnik, A., 2008. Magnetic Classification of Stony Meteorites: 2. Non-
- Ordinary Chondrites. Meteoritics Planet. Sci. 43, 959-980.
- Rubin, A. E., 1984. Coarse-grained chondrule rims in type 3 chondrites. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 48, 1779-1789.
- Rubin, A. E. 2012. Collisional facilitation of aqueous alteration of CM and CV carbonaceous chondrites. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 90, 181-194.
- Scherer, P., Schultz, L., 2000. Noble gas record, collisional history, and pairing of CV, CO,
- CK, and other carbonaceous chondrites. Meteorit. Planet. Sci. 35, 145-153.
- Suavet, C., Alexandre, A., Franchi, I. A., Gattacceca, J., Sonzogni, C., Greenwood, R. C.,
- Folco, L., Rochette, P., 2010. Identification of the parent bodies of micrometeorites with high-precision oxygen isotope ratios. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 293, 313-320.
- Wasson, J. T., Isa, J., Rubin, A. E., 2013. Compositional and petrographic similarities of CV
- and CK chondrites: A single group with variations in textures and volatile concentrations attributable to impact heating, crushing and oxidation. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 108, 45-62.
- Weisberg, M. K., McCoy, T. J., Krot, A. N., 2006. Systematics and evaluation of meteorite
- classification. In Meteorites and the Early Solar System II, edited by Lauretta, Dante S.
- 518 and Sween Jr, H. Y., pp. 19-52.
- Yin, Q.-Z., Sanborn, M.E., 2019. An update on disconnecting CV and CK chondrites parents
- bodies and more. 50th Lunar Planet. Sci. Conf., abstract #3023.

1 **Figure 2 [Click here to download Figure: Fig2-cumulative plots.pdf](http://ees.elsevier.com/epsl/download.aspx?id=1209931&guid=3050659e-b3fd-4840-b4b0-4565ab3253d6&scheme=1)**

Table 1 [Click here to download Table: Table 1-CV properties.xlsx](http://ees.elsevier.com/epsl/download.aspx?id=1209936&guid=a7713e84-a164-4aae-9af4-7671842148a1&scheme=1)

Table 5 [Click here to download Table: Table 5-oxygen isotopes summary with17O.xlsx](http://ees.elsevier.com/epsl/download.aspx?id=1209938&guid=2d07d5ab-e2b6-4025-86be-bf6725aaf1d1&scheme=1)

–

Table 4 [Click here to download Table: Table 4-oxygen isotopes CEREGE with17O.xlsx](http://ees.elsevier.com/epsl/download.aspx?id=1209939&guid=c178a74c-da9e-4ede-b33a-1e9cc0c62db7&scheme=1)

Table 3 [Click here to download Table: Table 3-Ks Test.xlsx](http://ees.elsevier.com/epsl/download.aspx?id=1209940&guid=d8395d60-be48-4f9c-9a72-03e4cab52f0b&scheme=1)

Table 2 [Click here to download Table: Table 2-CV average properties.pdf](http://ees.elsevier.com/epsl/download.aspx?id=1209941&guid=43fea237-336f-4c70-8285-06ba983738cc&scheme=1)

Figure S1 [Click here to download Supplementary material for online publication only: Figure S1-elipsoids flattening.pdf](http://ees.elsevier.com/epsl/download.aspx?id=1209933&guid=718207cd-67ea-4a4a-abb0-fa585e9fbec0&scheme=1)