



HAL
open science

A Note on Optimal and Sub-Optimal Feedback Controls for Biogas Production

Antoine Haddon, Hector Ramirez, Alain Rapaport

► **To cite this version:**

Antoine Haddon, Hector Ramirez, Alain Rapaport. A Note on Optimal and Sub-Optimal Feedback Controls for Biogas Production. *Journal of Optimization Theory and Applications*, 2020, 186 (3), pp.1053-1055. 10.1007/s10957-020-01723-9 . hal-02915334

HAL Id: hal-02915334

<https://hal.inrae.fr/hal-02915334>

Submitted on 14 Aug 2020

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



A Note on “Optimal and Sub-Optimal Feedback Controls for Biogas Production”

Antoine Haddon^{1,2}  · Héctor Ramírez¹ · Alain Rapaport²

Received: 26 May 2020 / Accepted: 18 July 2020

© Springer Science+Business Media, LLC, part of Springer Nature 2020

Abstract

We correct Proposition 3.1 of Ref. Haddon et al. (J Optim Theory Appl 183:642, 2019).

Keywords Optimal control · Chemostat model · Singular Arc · Sub-optimality · Infinite horizon

Mathematics Subject Classification 49K15 · 49N35 · 49N90 · 93B52

1 Introduction

In Ref. [1], Proposition 3.1 deals with the convergence of the discounted reward (16), the associated value function (17) and optimal trajectories, as the discount factor goes to 0. The proof of the Γ -convergence of the discounted reward is incorrect since, in general, this reward is not monotone with respect to the discount factor δ .

Communicated by Benoit Chachuat.

✉ Antoine Haddon
ahaddon@dim.uchile.cl
Héctor Ramírez
hramirez@dim.uchile.cl
Alain Rapaport
alain.rapaport@inrae.fr

¹ Mathematical Engineering Department and Center for Mathematical Modelling (CNRS UMI 2807), Universidad de Chile, Beauchef 851, Santiago, Chile

² MISTEA, Université Montpellier, INRAE, Montpellier SupAgro, 2 pl. Viala, 34060 Montpellier, France

2 The Correction

Proposition 3.1 can be revised as follows.

Proposition 2.1 *For all $\xi \in \mathcal{D}$ and for all $\delta > 0$, the suprema are attained,*

$$V_\delta(\xi) = \max_{\zeta(\cdot)} J_\delta(\zeta(\cdot)).$$

If the Γ -limit of $J_\delta(\cdot)$ exists as δ goes to 0,

$$J_0(\zeta(\cdot)) := \Gamma - \lim_{\delta \rightarrow 0} J_\delta(\zeta(\cdot)),$$

then the maxima converge, pointwise in ξ , to the maximum of the limit,

$$V_0(\xi) := \lim_{\delta \rightarrow 0} V_\delta(\xi) = \max_{\zeta(\cdot)} J_0(\zeta(\cdot)). \tag{1}$$

Furthermore, if $\zeta_\delta(\cdot)$ is an optimal trajectory, i.e. if $V_\delta(\xi) = J_\delta(\zeta_\delta(\cdot))$, and if $\zeta_\delta(\cdot)$ converges to $\zeta_0(\cdot)$ in $\mathcal{S}(\xi)$, then $\zeta_0(\cdot)$ is an optimal trajectory for (1) and

$$V_0(\xi) = J_0(\zeta_0(\cdot)) = \lim_{\delta \rightarrow 0} J_\delta(\zeta_\delta(\cdot)).$$

Proof To show that the suprema are attained, we show that the set of all forward trajectories of (3) of [1], with initial condition ξ , is compact for the topology on $W^{1,1}(0, \infty; \mathbb{R}^2, e^{-bt} dt)$ given in Definition 3.1 of [1].

For each $\xi \in \mathcal{D}$ we set

$$F_\xi(\zeta) := F(P_{\mathcal{L}(\xi)}(\zeta)),$$

where $P_{\mathcal{L}(\xi)}$ is the projection on the convex set $\mathcal{L}(\xi)$. Then, F_ξ has linear growth, so that we can define

$$c = \sup_{\zeta \in \text{Dom}(F_\xi)} \frac{\|F_\xi(\zeta)\|}{\|\zeta\| + 1},$$

where $\|F_\xi(\zeta)\| := \sup_{\eta \in F_\xi(\zeta)} \|\eta\|$. Note that F is upper semi-continuous and has compact non-empty convex images (such a map is known as a Marchaud map [2]). With this, the set $\mathcal{S}(\xi)$ is the set of absolutely continuous solutions of the differential inclusion

$$\dot{\zeta}(t) \in F_\xi(\zeta(t)), \quad \zeta(0) = \xi.$$

We can therefore use [2, Theorem 3.5.2] to establish that $\mathcal{S}(\xi)$ is compact for the topology of $W^{1,1}(0, \infty; \mathbb{R}^2, e^{-bt} dt)$ for $b > c$, thereby proving the existence of optimal trajectories in $\mathcal{S}(\xi)$.

In addition, this allows us to show that the maxima converge to the maximum of the limit. Indeed, when the rewards Γ -converge, it is sufficient to show that there exists a countably compact set on which the suprema are attained for all δ [3, Theorem 7.4]. The set $\mathcal{S}(\xi)$ is clearly independent of δ and countably compact, since it is compact. Finally, the convergence of optimal trajectories can be shown with [3, Corollary 7.20]. \square

3 Conclusions

The originally published proof of Proposition 3.1 of [1] was incorrect and we have revised here the result to obtain an accurate statement. However, we have not found reasonable assumptions that ensure the existence of the Γ -limit of $J_\delta(\cdot)$, when δ goes to 0, although it seems to be satisfied in our examples. We thus posit the Γ -convergence as a conjecture, that will be investigated in future research.

Acknowledgements The authors would like to thank Frédéric Bonnans for pointing out a problem with the originally published proof. The first and second authors were supported by FONDECYT grant 1160567 and 1160204, and by Basal Program CMM-AFB 170001 from CONICYT-Chile. The first author was supported by a doctoral fellowship CONICYT-PFCHA/Doctorado Nacional/2017-21170249. The third author was supported by the LabEx NUMEV incorporated into the I-Site MUSE.

References

1. Haddon, A., Ramirez, H., Rapaport, A.: Optimal and sub-optimal feedback controls for biogas production. *J. Optim. Theory Appl.* **183**, 642 (2019)
2. Aubin, J.P.: *Viability theory*. Springer, Berlin (2009)
3. Dal Maso, G.: *An Introduction to Γ -Convergence*, vol. 8. Springer, Berlin (2012)

Publisher's Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.