

Assessment of beef sensory attributes and physicochemical characteristics: A comparative study of intermediate versus normal ultimate pH striploin cuts

Iliani Patinho, Cecylyana Leite Cavalcante, Erick Saldaña, Mohammed

Gagaoua, Jorge Behrens, Carmen Contreras-Castillo

▶ To cite this version:

Iliani Patinho, Cecylyana Leite Cavalcante, Erick Saldaña, Mohammed Gagaoua, Jorge Behrens, et al.. Assessment of beef sensory attributes and physicochemical characteristics: A comparative study of intermediate versus normal ultimate pH striploin cuts. Food Research International, 2024, 175, pp.113778. 10.1016/j.foodres.2023.113778. hal-04309414

HAL Id: hal-04309414 https://hal.inrae.fr/hal-04309414

Submitted on 4 Dec 2023

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License

1	Assessment of beef sensory attributes and physicochemical characteristics: A
2	comparative study of intermediate versus normal ultimate pH striploin cuts
3	
4	Iliani Patinho ^{a*} , Cecylyana Leite Cavalcante ^a , Erick Saldaña ^b , Mohammed Gagaoua ^c ,
5	Jorge H. Behrens ^d , Carmen J. Contreras-Castillo ^{a*}
6	
7	^a Department of Agri-food Industry, Food and Nutrition, Luiz de Queiroz College of
8	Agriculture, University of Sao Paulo, Piracicaba, SP 13418-900, Brazil
9	^b Sensory analysis and consumer study group, Escuela Profesional de Ingeniería
10	Agroindustrial, Universidad Nacional de Moquegua, Prolongación Calle Ancash s/n,
11	Moquegua, 18001, Peru.
12	^c PEGASE, INRAE, Institut Agro, 35590 Saint-Gilles, France
13	^d Department of Food Science and Nutrition, School of Food Engineering, University of
14	Campinas, SP, Brazil
15	
16	*Corresponding authors email: <u>ilianipatinho@usp.br; ccastill@usp.br</u>
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	
30	
31	
32	
33	
34	

35 Abstract

36 The quality of beef, defined by key attributes such as texture, flavour, and post-cooking 37 texture, is shaped by various intrinsic and extrinsic factors. This study conducted a detailed 38 examination of Nellore beef, dividing it into two categories based on ultimate pH (pHu) 39 levels: intermediate (pHu \geq 5.8) and normal (pHu < 5.6). A comprehensive approach was 40 taken, involving twenty trained assessors who applied the Optimised Descriptive Profile 41 (ODP) method to evaluate grilled striploin steak samples. In parallel, consumer preferences 42 were measured through a hedonic test and a Check-all-that-apply (CATA) task, involving 43 135 participants. The ODP results revealed that the intermediate pHu samples were 44 significantly juicier (P < 0.05) compared to the normal pHu group. The CATA analysis 45 highlighted differences in both intermediate and normal pHu beef, especially in juiciness, 46 a crucial factor for consumer satisfaction. Notably, variations in deoxymyoglobin content linked to ageing were observed, with higher levels on the 3rd day compared to the 28th day, 47 48 especially in the intermediate pHu samples (P < 0.05). Moreover, colour-related aspects 49 such as L^* , b^* , chroma, and oxymyoglobin were significantly influenced (P < 0.05) by both 50 the pHu category and ageing duration. Regarding consumer acceptance, the study found 51 no significant difference in perception between the intermediate and normal pHu groups 52 (P > 0.05). These findings illuminate the complex interaction between pHu levels, sensory 53 characteristics, and consumer preferences in beef quality, offering valuable insights for 54 both the industry and research community. 55

56

57 **Keywords:** Beef quality, *Longissimus thoracis et lumborum*, Nellore, Consumer 58 acceptability, Sensory evaluation.

- 59
- 60
- 61
- 62
- 63
- 05
- 64

65 **1. Introduction**

Animal protein, particularly bovine meat, is a fundamental part of the human diet, especially in Western countries where beef is a major source of protein. Consumer preferences for beef vary across different markets and are influenced by diverse factors including (i) cultural and psychological aspects of consumers (Troy & Kerry, 2010), (ii) the sensory properties of the products (Saldaña et al., 2020a), and (iii) marketing considerations such as price, regulation, quality standards, and distribution (Font-i-Furnols & Guerrero, 2014).

73

74 Texture is a key sensory attribute of beef, offering a range of mouthfeel experiences during 75 consumption, such as tenderness, juiciness, and chewiness (Zhu et al., 2021). The aroma 76 and flavour are also critical, arising from chemical compounds like amino acids, peptides, 77 organic acids, and adenine nucleotide metabolism by-products (Spanier et al., 1997). The 78 Maillard reaction and lipid degradation in meat generate various volatile compounds, 79 contributing to the distinctive aromas (Kosowska et al., 2017). Recent research suggests 80 that the chemical properties of muscle fibres (type I and II) vary and significantly influence 81 the formation of volatiles and beef flavour (Li et al., 2023).

82

83 The sensory quality of beef is largely determined by its ultimate pH (pHu), which is linked 84 to the animal's ability to store glycogen in muscles and the differing amounts of 85 mitochondria in muscle fibres (Picard & Gagaoua, 2020; Poleti et al., 2018). Variations in 86 pHu between intermediate and normal beef can result from factors like animal diet, 87 exercise, pre-slaughter stress, and processing conditions, all impacting the final quality, 88 particularly in terms of colour, tenderness, and flavour (Gagaoua et al., 2021a; Loudon et 89 al., 2018; Ponnampalam et al., 2017). This presents a challenge for food scientists and the 90 industry in aligning consumer perception with variations in beef pHu (Warner et al., 2021). 91

92 The meat industry aims to consistently produce high-quality cuts while reducing consumer 93 dissatisfaction (Gagaoua & Picard, 2020). Various sensory evaluation methods have been 94 deployed, including both analytical (trained panels) and holistic (consumer) approaches 95 (Saldaña et al., 2021). According to Aaslyng et al. (2014), a product's sensory profile can 96 be established using the Optimised Descriptive Profile (ODP) by a trained panel, where 97 product attributes are selected and agreed upon by the assessors (Murray et al., 2001). 98 Conversely, affective methods rely on consumer reactions, such as hedonic measures, and can be augmented with techniques like Check-all-that-apply (CATA) questions, a versatile
tool for capturing perceptions, feelings, and attitudes (Jaeger et al., 2015).

101 Considering the prominence of beef in Brazilian diets and the preference for this animal 102 protein, this study aimed to develop a comprehensive sensory profile and deepen our 103 understanding of the acceptance and perception of beef cuts within two pHu ranges: 104 intermediate and normal. This innovative study combined the expertise of trained assessors 105 for consistent data, alongside the views of 135 regular beef consumers. Additionally, 106 instrumental measurements taken at 3, 14, and 28 days *post-mortem* were analysed. The 107 hypothesis was that individual reactions to sensory and physicochemical properties of beef 108 could predict consumer perception of beef quality, providing valuable insights to the meat 109 industry about consumer expectations and purchasing decisions.

110

111

2. Materials and Methods

All procedures and protocols used in this study complied with the Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee Guidelines (protocol 2019/22) and were approved by the committees of the Luiz de Queiroz College of Agriculture at the University of São Paulo. All participants in the sensory tests provided informed consent, in accordance with the form approved by the ethics committee, under CAAE number: 56217222.2.0000.5395.

117

118 2.1 Animals, treatments, and sampling

119 Animals were sourced from a commercial meat slaughterhouse under federal inspection, 120 and they were part of a larger experiment involving 104 animals. The normal and 121 intermediate pHu frequencies stood at 76.92% and 16.35%, respectively. From this pool, 122 ten carcasses of Nellore (*Bos Indicus*) bulls, categorised as intermediate ($pHu \ge 5.8$; n = 5) 123 and normal (pHu < 5.6; n = 5) beef, were selected. The bulls, aged between 18 and 35 124 months, had 2 to 6 permanent incisor teeth and a hot carcass weight of 303 ± 40 kg. Beef 125 samples (~1 g) were excised from the right side of the *Longissimus thoracis* (LT) muscle between the 10th and 11th ribs, aging after 3 days *post-mortem*, for pHu determination. Each 126 127 animal's LT muscle was sheared perpendicular to the natural muscle fibres, into five steaks 128 (2.0 cm thick), vacuum-packed, and stored at -18 °C for subsequent sensory analysis. For 129 instrumental analysis, the Longissimus thoracis et lumborum (striploin cut) muscles were sheared between the 3rd and 6th lumbar vertebrae, portioned into steaks (2.0 cm thick), 130 vacuum-packed, and refrigerated in a chamber (Danic, Model C-EC/U) at 0±2.0 °C without 131 132 light exposure during the aging period of 3, 14, and 28 days *post-mortem*.

133 2.2 Sensory analyses

Sensory evaluations were conducted on LT steaks 3 days *post-mortem*, utilising the
methodology outlined by Patinho et al. (2019, 2021). For data collection, the Compusense
Cloud platform (Compusense Inc., Guelph, Canada) was employed, with the information
being recorded on Android tablets (Samsung Galaxy Tab E T560).

138

139 2.3 Sample preparation

140 Sensory evaluations of LT steaks, cut into 2.0 cm thick steaks, were carried out 3 days after 141 slaughter. The steaks were grilled on an electric griddle at 200 °C (SSE50, EDANCA, São 142 Paulo, Brazil) until the internal temperature reached 71 °C, monitored using a puncture 143 thermometer. The steaks were flipped every 60 seconds during grilling, a process that 144 lasted about 5 minutes to achieve the desired internal temperature. Post-cooking, each steak 145 was cut into 1 cm³ cubes, as advised by Gomes et al. (2014) and based on preliminary tests. 146 In consumer testing, the steaks were seasoned with salt (1.7% w/w) before grilling (Martins 147 et al., 2021). The samples, approximately 5g each, were then wrapped in aluminium foil, 148 kept warm in an electrically heated display at around 50 °C for 20 minutes, and served to 149 assessors in plastic dishes marked with three-digit codes. Assessors were instructed to 150 cleanse their palates with water between samples.

151

152 2.4 Optimised Descriptive Profile

153 The ODP involved candidates including undergraduate and postgraduate students, staff, 154 and faculty from the Department of Agri-food Industry, Food and Nutrition at the 155 University of São Paulo (ESALQ/USP). These individuals were selected for their 156 experience with meat product sensory evaluations, availability, dietary or health 157 constraints, and non-smoking status. The ODP, conducted with 20 trained assessors (age 158 18-65; comprising 57% women, 39% men, and 4% non-binary individuals; all regular beef 159 consumers), spanned six independent one-hour sessions. In the initial session, the ODP 160 methodology was introduced, and a list of attributes from prior studies (Martins et al., 2021; 161 Yang et al., 2021; Gomes et al., 2014) was discussed, leading to the consensus on sixteen 162 descriptors. The second session was dedicated to finalising the attribute order, evaluation 163 techniques, reference samples, and intensity terms defined as "low" or "high". The third 164 session focused on training the assessors in using the Compusense Cloud and the 9-cm 165 unstructured linear scale to measure attribute intensity in each sample. The final three 166 sessions involved the actual evaluations, with each assessor analysing two beef samples

per session, one from the intermediate and the other from the normal pHu range, presentedmonadically following the Latin Square design of Williams (Wakeling & MacFie, 1995).

169

170 2.5 Consumer testing

171 For consumer testing, 135 regular beef consumers (age 18-64; 56% women, 43% men, and 172 1% non-binary; 90% with higher education; beef consumption varied from daily to once a 173 week) from the University of Campinas campus rated the samples' overall liking on a 9-174 point hedonic scale. The scale ranged from (1) "extremely disliked" to (9) "extremely 175 liked". Participants then used a Check-all-that-apply (CATA) task to identify sensory 176 descriptors for each sample. After tasting both samples, they were asked to describe the 177 sensory profile of an ideal beef using the same CATA task, based on the previous study by 178 Martins et al. (2021).

179

2.6 Quality parameters of beef 3 days post-mortem: pHu, composition, drip loss and
texture analysis

182

183 2.6.1 pHu determination

184 Muscle pHu was determined according to the method by Bendall (1973). Briefly, the LT 185 muscle samples were taken 3 days *post-mortem* and homogenised using an Ultra Turrax 186 (IKA, model T18 basic, Wilmington, NC, USA) with a buffer containing 5mM sodium 187 iodoacetate and 150mM KCl (pH 7.0) at a 1:8 ratio (w/v). The muscle homogenates were 188 centrifuged using an Eppendorf centrifuge (model 5810R, Hamburg, Germany) at 189 13,000×g for 5 minutes at room temperature, equilibrated to 25 °C, and measured using a 190 digital pH meter (Lucadema, model LUCA-210, São José do Rio Preto, Brazil) with 191 automatic temperature compensation and a glass penetration electrode.

192

193 2.6.2 Proximate composition

The moisture content, crude protein, ash, and total lipids of muscle samples, taken 3 days post-mortem, were evaluated (**Table 2**). The moisture content was determined by ovendrying samples at 105 °C until a constant weight was achieved (Association of Official Analytical Chemists [AOAC], 1995). Total nitrogen was measured using the Kjeldahl method (Nx6.25) (ISO 1871:2009) to ascertain the crude protein content, while ash content was determined by calcining organic matter at 550 °C (ISO 936:1998). Total lipids were extracted with hexane using the Soxhlet method (AOAC, 1995). The results werecalculated on a wet basis and expressed as a percentage.

202

203 2.6.3 Drip loss

Drip loss in refrigerated striploin steaks was determined 3 days *post-mortem*. Approximately 50 g of rectangular muscle (30 mm thickness, 60 mm length, 25 mm width) was cut in the direction of the fibre, weighed, placed inside a net, and suspended into airfilled polyethene plastic. After 48 hours at 0 ± 4.0 °C, all samples were weighed again, and the drip loss percentage was calculated according to the method outlined by Honikel (1998), with adaptations from Torres Filho et al. (2017), using the following equation:

210

211

 $Drip loss (\%) = [(Initial weight - Final weight)/initial weight] \times 100$ (1)

212

213 2.6.4 Texture profile analysis (TPA)

214 Before conducting the texture profile analysis (TPA), the Longissimus thoracis (LT) 215 muscle samples, taken 3 days post-mortem and initially frozen at -18 °C, were thawed at a temperature of 2-4 °C for 24 hours. These were then cooked on an electric griddle until 216 217 reaching an internal temperature of 71 °C (Martins et al., 2021). The TPA was carried out 218 using a TA-XT texturometer (Stable Micro Systems, Godalming, United Kingdom) 219 equipped with a P-35 probe (long shaft, regular base), adhering to the methods outlined by 220 Jia et al. (2022). For the analysis, the samples were shaped into cylinders using a circular 221 stainless-steel cutter. Each sample yielded five to seven cylinders, each 3.0 cm in diameter. 222 These were then tested at room temperature under specific conditions: a 5.0-second interval 223 between the first and second compressions, a crosshead speed of 1.0 mm/s, a trigger force 224 of 5 g, and a working distance set at 50% strain. The TPA, defined as the peak force needed 225 to compress the sample, mimics the mechanical process of chewing, thus providing data 226 on texture characteristics such as hardness (measured in Newtons), springiness, 227 cohesiveness, chewiness, and gumminess. The average values from five replicates were 228 used for statistical analysis, with the results for hardness specifically expressed in Newtons. 229

230 2.7 *Quality parameters of beef at 3, 14, and 28 days post-mortem: colour, water-*231 *holding capacity, cooking losses and shear force*

232

233 2.7.1 Instrumental colour

234 The instrumental colour measurement of the refrigerated striploin steaks was carried out at 235 3, 14, and 28 days *post-mortem* using a MiniScan XE Plus spectrophotometer® (HunterLab 236 Associates, Virginia, USA). The spectrophotometer was calibrated with a white ceramic 237 plate adjusted to Y = 93.7, x = 0.3160, and y = 0.3323, using an 8 mm diameter 238 measurement area, a 10° observation angle, and A10 illumination. CIELAB coordinates 239 L^* (lightness), a^* (redness), and b^* (yellowness) were obtained by taking 5 readings at 240 random locations on the steak surface without connective tissue, after allowing 30 minutes 241 of oxygenation at 4 °C. Chroma (C*), hue angle (h*), and the percentages of 242 metmyoglobin, deoxymyoglobin, and oxymyoglobin were calculated using equations 243 defined by American Meat Science Association [AMSA] (2012). The reflectance ratio at 244 630 nm and 580 nm (R630/580) was measured to estimate the stability of meat colour, where a higher ratio indicates lower metmyoglobin accumulation on the beef surface and 245 246 thus greater colour stability (AMSA, 2012; Canto et al., 2016).

247

248 2.7.2 Water-holding capacity (WHC)

The water-holding capacity (WHC) of the refrigerated striploin steaks at 3, 14, and 28 days *post-mortem* was determined using the method described by Grau and Hamm (1953), modified by Hoffmann et al. (1982). Meat samples (0.5 g) were weighed on filter paper and pressed with a 5 kg weight for 5 minutes. The WHC result was expressed as a percentage based on the difference between the final and initial weights of the sample.

254

255 2.7.3 Cooking losses

Cooking losses for refrigerated striploin steaks at 3, 14, and 28 days *post-mortem* were cooked on an electric plate (model SSE50, EDANCA, São Paulo, Brazil) at 200 °C until they reached an internal temperature of 71 °C. The cooking loss was calculated by subtracting the sample's weight after cooking (weight₂) from its weight before cooking (weight₁) (Anne et al., 2022), and converting the result to a percentage using the following equation:

262

$$Cooking \ loss \ (\%) = \frac{\text{weight}_1 \ (g) - \text{weight}_2 \ (g) \ x \ 100}{\text{weight}_1 \ (g)}$$
(2)

264

265 2.7.4 Shear force

266 The Warner–Bratzler shear force of the refrigerated striploin steaks at 3, 14, and 28 days 267 post-mortem was determined according to Shackelford et al. (1991), with modifications. 268 Briefly, the LT steaks were cooked on an electric plate (model SSE50, EDANCA, São 269 Paulo, Brazil) at 200 °C until they reached an internal temperature of 71 °C (Martins et al., 270 2021). After cooking, the steaks were refrigerated at 0±2.0 °C for 24 h. Using a drill and 271 leaker, between five and seven sections (1.27 cm in diameter) were extracted by cutting 272 parallel to the muscle fibres. Each section was sheared perpendicular to the fibre orientation 273 using a Warner-Bratzler shear blade (HDP/BS) attached to a TA-XT texturometer (Stable 274 Micro Systems, Godalming, United Kingdom) calibrated for a pre-test speed of 2 mm/s, 275 test speed of 2 mm/s, and post-test speed of 10 mm/s. The device was programmed to travel 276 30 mm at the end of the three phases. The maximum force peak recorded during the analysis 277 represented the shear force in Newtons (N) for hardness. The highest and lowest 278 measurements were excluded, and the mean of five sections was used for statistical 279 analysis.

280

281 2.8 Data analysis

Statistical analyses were carried out using XLSTAT (Student 2023.1.2.1406) and R project
version 4.3.1 (R core team, 2023).

284

285 2.8.1 Optimised Descriptive Profile

The Optimised Descriptive Profile (ODP) data were examined univariately using a Student's t-test to identify potential sensory differences between the pHu ranges at a 5% significance level in R software. Principal Component Analysis was conducted on the correlation matrix from a multivariate standpoint in XLSTAT.

290

291 2.8.2 Consumer testing

Hedonic data from the meat acceptance tests were analysed using ANOVA, with pHu range as a fixed factor and consumers as a random factor, treating both samples and consumers as sources of variation. The frequency of terms by pH range from the Check-All-That-Apply (CATA) data was compiled and then analysed using Correspondence Analysis (CA). The correlation between liking and sensory attributes was explored through Principal Coordinate Analysis, as recommended by Saldaña et al. (2020b). Additionally, a penalty analysis was conducted to calculate the impact on liking when sensory attributes were

9

- marked or unmarked as ideal, following the method of Selani et al. (2022). All theseanalyses were performed using XLSTAT.
- 301
- 302 2.8.3 Quality parameters of beef 3 days post-mortem

For the instrumental analyses, data related to pH, drip loss, and texture profile analysis(TPA) of the two different pHu ranges of steaks were compared using a Student's t-test in

- 305 R software to identify significant differences.
- 306

307 2.8.4 Quality parameters of beef at 3, 14, and 28 days post-mortem

Instrumental data assessing colour, water-holding capacity, cooking losses, and shear force considered two pHu ranges and three refrigeration periods as sources of variation. ANOVA was then performed at a 5% significance level, with pHu range as a fixed factor and animal as a random factor, using R software. A Principal Component Analysis (PCA) was conducted with combinations of pHu and storage time as individuals (rows) and instrumental data as variables (columns), using the Pearson correlation matrix in XLSTAT.

- 314
- 315 **3. Results**
- 316

317 3.1 Optimised Descriptive Profile

318 The study revealed significant differences in the sensory profile only regarding juiciness 319 (**Table 3**). Specifically, the panel found steaks with intermediate pHu to be juicier (P < 0.05) 320 than those with normal pHu. When considering the overall impact of pHu on beef quality, 321 other sensory characteristics appeared similar. Vector size was used to analyse the positive 322 and/or negative relationships between the 16 sensory characteristics and intermediate and 323 normal pHu. Notably, the flavour attributes of roast beef, fat, connective tissue, and blood 324 odour were prominent in steaks within the intermediate pH range. Conversely, the surface 325 brown colour, chewiness, and hardness were more intense in steaks from the normal pHu 326 range (Fig. 1A;B).

327

328 3.2 Consumer testing

The relationship between striploin steak samples from intermediate and normal pHu ranges and the sensory descriptors used by consumers in the CATA task is represented by the first two dimensions of the Correspondence Analysis (CA), which captures 100% of the original information (**Fig. 2A**). Steaks treated with intermediate pHu were characterised by the 333 attributes of blood odour, hardness, fibrousness, surface brown colour, and a meaty beef 334 flavour. In contrast, the sample with a normal pHu was described as having apparent 335 opacity, blood flavour, dryness, and an internal brown colour. Significantly, none of the 336 samples were near the ideal sensory profile, indicating substantial room for improvement 337 in order to satisfy consumers' ideal sensory preferences. It is worth noting that samples 338 with intermediate and normal pHu were perceived similarly, with no significant difference 339 in terms of acceptance (P > 0.05) and overall liking scores of 6.93 and 6.63, respectively 340 (data not shown). Overall liking was associated with the attributes of overall juiciness, fat 341 flavour, roast beef aroma, roast beef flavour, overall tenderness, chewiness, and saltiness 342 (Fig. 2B), suggesting that these attributes are instrumental in driving consumer liking. 343 Furthermore, it was identified that the characteristics of chewiness, saltiness, overall 344 tenderness, juiciness, aroma, and roast beef flavour were the main drivers of preference for 345 the optimal beef sample (Fig. 2A).

346

A penalty-lift analysis pinpointed attributes positively and negatively associated with overall liking. Positively influencing acceptance were roast beef flavour, internal red colour, juiciness, chewiness, tenderness, and roast beef aroma (**Fig. 3**). Conversely, hardness, fibrousness, dryness, and apparent opacity were inversely related, indicating their detrimental effect on beef acceptability.

352

353 3.3 Quality parameters of beef 3 days post-mortem

The results demonstrated that the differences between intermediate and normal pHu did not significantly affect the drip loss or any texture parameters of the beef (**Table 4**).

356

357 3.4 Quality parameters of beef at 3, 14, and 28 days post-mortem

According to **Table 5**, there was a significant (P<0.05) impact of pHu and ageing time on the *L**, *b** *parameters*, specifically on chroma, oxymyoglobin, and deoxymyoglobin. Only the ageing time had an effect on the *a**, hue, surface colour stability, metmyoglobin, and water-holding capacity; without interaction between the two variables (pHu x ageing time). However, only in the pHu ranges was a difference seen for shear force. Compared to meat with a normal pHu, meat with an intermediate pHu had a lower shear force value.

364

Lastly, data collected for both intermediate and normal pHu samples during the ageingperiod was subjected to Principal Component Analysis (PCA). 93.21% of the variation in

367 the total could be explained by the first two principal components, according to this 368 analysis. The first dimension was primarily formed by the intermediate pHu (70.96%), 369 whereas the second dimension was primarily formed by the normal pHu (22.25%) (Fig. 4). 370 There were noticeable variations in quality metrics between the two pHu ranges. In relation 371 to lightness (L^*) , redness (a^*) , yellowness (b^*) , chroma, hue, oxymyoglobin, 372 metmyoglobin, and shear force for normal pHu, the intermediate pHu was positively 373 correlated with deoxymyoglobin, cooking losses, water-holding capacity, and surface 374 colour stability.

375

376 4. Discussion

377

378 4.1 Optimised Descriptive Profile

Amongst the range of sensory characteristics examined, pHu notably influenced only the juiciness of meat. Meat juiciness, defined as the sensation of moisture released during chewing, is a vital aspect of meat texture. While initial tenderness sensations diminish rapidly, the experience of juiciness persists in various intensities throughout mastication. This study found that meat samples with intermediate pHu were juicier (P < 0.05) than those with normal pHu (Table 3), supporting the findings of Grayson et al. (2016) and mirroring results from Yang et al. (2021) for high pHu (dark-cutting) meat.

386 A higher water-holding capacity (WHC), associated with greater juiciness, was noted in 387 meat with intermediate pHu (Table 5). Although there wasn't a significant statistical 388 difference in WHC across pHu ranges, a positive correlation with the intermediate pHu 389 group was evident (Fig. 4). This phenomenon can be attributed to the isoelectric point (IP) 390 of myofibrillar proteins, like myosin, near pH 5.4, where myofilaments and myofilament 391 spaces have zero net charge. As explained by Zhang et al. (2022), a pH shift above this 392 point results in myofibrillar proteins having a higher net charge, thus increasing 393 myofilament distances and improving WHC. This seems to be the case with intermediate 394 pHu muscle. Conversely, a rapid pH decline leading to low pHu is linked to reduced WHC, 395 likely due to increased surface hydrophobicity and decreased solubility of myofibrillar 396 proteins, impacting the myofilament structure and surface charges (Huff-Lonergan & 397 Lonergan, 2005; Sharedeh et al., 2015). Additionally, a decrease in pH affects the redox 398 stability of myoglobin, accelerating the oxidation of ferrous myoglobin to ferric, increasing 399 surface moisture, and altering the appearance of *post-mortem* muscle (Faustman & Suman, 400 2017). These findings for low/normal pHu are consistent with our study's observations.

401

402 Significantly, an improvement in water-holding capacity was noted during extended ageing
403 (**Table 5**). Changes in muscle structure during this period, such as proteolysis of
404 myofibrillar and cytoskeletal proteins and alterations in collagen, affect ion-protein
405 interactions, thereby increasing the space available for water retention (della Malva et al.,
406 2021).

407

408 The perception of fat and roast beef flavours appears positively influenced by the higher 409 lipid content in intermediate pHu (Table 2). The rich flavour of meat is the result of 410 complex interactions among various ingredients during thermal processing (Aaslyng et al., 411 2014; Troy & Kerry, 2010), likely explaining the noted preference for roast beef flavour in 412 intermediate pHu samples. The differences in fatty acid profiles between pHu ranges 413 significantly impact the cooking process and the formation of aroma and flavour-active 414 compounds (Kerth & Miller, 2015). O'Quinn et al. (2012) observed a correlation between 415 meat flavour and fat content, suggesting that higher fat content in steaks enhances meat 416 flavour intensity. In summary, Table 3 indicates that all sensory panel evaluators 417 consistently rated the same attributes - taste, colour, and aroma - despite the inherent 418 challenges in achieving a consensus on these aspects.

419

420 4.2 Consumer testing

421 Our study's findings, supported by trained sensory panel evaluations and consumer CATA 422 task results (Ares & Jaeger, 2023), are significant. Both panels characterized normal pHu 423 steaks as dry, and intermediate pHu steaks as tough (Table 3; Fig. 2A). This aligns with 424 Miller et al. (2001), who noted that flavour and juiciness significantly influence consumer 425 satisfaction as steak toughness increases (Fig. 2B). Key determinants for consumer 426 approval in beef are tenderness, juiciness, and flavour (Duarte et al., 2022). The primary 427 attributes influencing consumer preferences in our study include roast beef aroma, flavour, 428 chewiness, salty taste, overall tenderness, and juiciness (Fig. 2A). This aligns with Liu et 429 al. (2022), who highlighted juiciness as a vital factor in meat quality, with the American 430 Meat Science Association (AMSA) stating it accounts for 10% of consumer approval 431 variation (Watson et al., 2008). Future studies should focus on juiciness, especially in 432 under-researched regions like Brazil.

433

434 Concerning overall acceptance (Fig. 2B), previous research indicated a preference for 435 tender and juicy beef (Corcoran et al., 2023; Gomes et al., 2014). Lyford et al. (2010) and 436 Malheiros et al. (2022) suggested consumers are willing to pay more for tender steaks. 437 Zebu beef, compared to *Taurus* cattle, often has lower tenderness and marbling, potentially 438 due to feeding regimes and the rate of muscle pH decline (Antonelo et al., 2022). Our 439 findings affirm tenderness as a desirable quality in beef. Gomes et al. (2014) noted that 440 high cooking temperatures, such as grilling, can enhance meat's appearance, flavour, and 441 aroma. However, cooking meat above 70 °C typically results in drier and tougher meat 442 compared to lower temperatures (60 °C) (Obuz & Dikeman, 2003). The Nellore breed (Bos 443 taurus indicus) and the internal temperature used for cooking (71 °C) in our study, 444 recommended by Brazilian restaurants and AMSA, might have influenced the lack of 445 perceived tenderness in both pHu ranges (Fig. 2A).

446

447 Meat colour perception involves more than just brown or red (Corlett et al., 2021; Hopkins, 448 1996). Factors influencing myoglobin's thermal stability and internal colour of cooked 449 meat include the protein's redox state (Suman et al., 2016). Higher muscle pH helps 450 maintain myoglobin in the reduced ferrous state, offering protection against denaturation 451 (Faustman & Suman 2017; Hunt et al., 1999). Additionally, the brown colour on cooked 452 meats' outer surfaces, observed in the intermediate pHu group (Fig. 2A), involves Maillard 453 reaction pigments, which are separate from myoglobin pigments (Faustman & Suman 454 2017). The Maillard reaction, a heat-induced reaction between reducing sugars and 455 proteins, occurs more slowly at low pH (Feiner, 2006). Higher pH may increase non-456 protonated amino acids in meat, enhancing reactivity in the Maillard reaction (Madruga & 457 Mottram, 1995). High pHu contributes to this reaction, leading to more pigments that affect 458 the external colour of beef.

459

460 Our study also shows that taste and aroma are major drivers of consumption and 461 satisfaction in cooked beef. Previous studies highlight the importance of identifying 462 common sensory attributes that satisfy consumer preferences and promote regular beef 463 consumption. The meat industry should focus on efficient technological solutions that 464 balance large-scale production with defined quality parameters, catering to Brazilian 465 consumers' demands for affordable, high-quality products meeting hygienic, nutritional, 466 and ethical standards.

467

The penalty-lift analysis suggests flavour and aroma significantly impact perceived sensory quality, supporting the idea that juiciness enhances liking (**Fig. 3**). These factors collectively increase overall liking, as beef taste and juiciness are perceived early in mastication (Djekic et al., 2022), chewing affects juiciness perception (Aaslyng et al., 2003), and meat flavour and aroma are released during this process (Watanabe et al., 2019). Research indicates a negative correlation between beef pH and hardness (Troy & Kerry, 2010), leading to increased sensory hardness and dryness and decreased liking.

- 475
- 476

6 4.3 Parameters of beef quality during ageing (3, 14, and 28 days post-mortem)

Fresh meat colour intensity is shaped by various intrinsic and extrinsic factors during
muscle-to-meat conversion (Gagaoua et al., 2018). The pH value plays a pivotal role in
meat colour development, primarily by affecting oxygen consumption and the reducing
activity of myoglobin (Ramanathan & Mancini, 2018).

481

482 Important colour parameters like L^* , a^* , b^* , chroma, hue, oxymyoglobin, and 483 metmyoglobin were significantly influenced (P < 0.05) by the normal pHu class and ageing 484 period (3, 14, and 28 days) (Fig. 4). pHu values explain variations in L^* values, with higher 485 L* values observed in steaks with normal pHu (**Table 5**). Increased pH levels lead proteins 486 to retain more water, causing muscle fibres to swell and reduce the distance between them, 487 resulting in a darker muscle surface due to decreased light scattering and increased light 488 absorption by myoglobin (Wu et al., 2020). On day three, steaks showed higher L^* values, 489 but after 14 and 28 days, the values were similar (Table 5). This supports Canto et al. 490 (2016), who suggested variations in L^* values might be due to higher myoglobin content 491 on day three, as myoglobin concentration in beef negatively correlates with surface 492 luminosity. Studies also observed higher L* values in Longissimus thoracis et lumborum 493 on day 3 during cold storage (Jeong et al., 2009; Hwang et al., 2010).

494

No significant difference was found between pHu ranges in terms of redness (a^*), suggesting either no effect of higher pH on colour stability or an insufficient pH increase to cause additional darkening. However, the highest values (P < 0.05) at 14 and 28 days of ageing occurred during the ageing period (**Table 5**). According to **Fig. 4**, low a^* values were linked to high deoxymyoglobin content 3 days *post-mortem* in intermediate pHu beef, while high a^* values were directly associated with oxymyoglobin content in beef with normal pHu (Wu et al., 2020). Previous studies reported increased a^* values in *longissimus* steaks during cold storage (Canto et al., 2016; Kim et al., 2009) due to limited oxygen availability for myoglobin in the early *post-mortem* period (Li et al., 2020). The increase of *a** during ageing may suggest increased colour stability and lessened susceptibility to ageing-induced discolouration (della Malva et al., 2021). Stable-coloured *longissimus* steaks exhibited a surfeit of glycolytic enzymes contributing to enhanced colour stability (Suman et al., 2023). This may also elucidate the elevated oxymyoglobin content in the 14 and 28 day *post-mortem* samples.

509

510 The a^* value has been suggested as a simple and reliable indicator to predict consumer 511 acceptability of beef colour (Wang et al., 2020). According to Holman et al. (2017), meat 512 colour is considered acceptable when a^* values are equal to or greater than 14.5. In our 513 study, beef samples from both pH ranges at 3, 14, and 28 days displayed a^* values above 514 14.5, indicating likely consumer acceptance. Similarly, the yellowness values (b^*) 515 followed a similar pattern as the a^* values, with higher values (P < 0.05) at 14 and 28 days, 516 aligning with the results of Canto et al. (2016), Kim et al. (2009), and McKenna et al. 517 (2005).

518

519 Chroma and hue angles, derived from a^* and b^* values, are influenced by myoglobin 520 content and mitochondrial functions (Li et al., 2020). In our study, elevated chroma values 521 at 14 and 28 days associated with an increase in oxymyoglobin and a decrease in 522 metmyoglobin, consistent with a prior study by Kannan et al. (2001). The hue angle 523 demonstrated a positive association with oxymyoglobin at 14 and 28 days and a negative 524 association with metmyoglobin at 3 days, which corresponds to the study by Lindahl et al. 525 (2001).

526

527 Surface colour stability (R630/580) showed a significant difference related to ageing time 528 (P<0.05), with lower values on day 3 compared to days 14 and 28. This observation of 529 surface colour stability is consistent with our findings on a^* values and supports a previous 530 study that noticed higher R630/580 values in Longissimus lumborum muscles during retail 531 exposure on days 5 and 9 (Joseph et al., 2012). McKenna et al. (2005) noted that muscles 532 with robust colour stability, like the *Longissimus lumborum*, tend to have higher b^* values 533 during storage, which aligns with our results. Also, the presence of sarcoplasmic proteins, 534 acting as antioxidants to inhibit lipid and myoglobin oxidation, may contribute to the 535 enhanced colour stability in longissimus steaks (Suman et al., 2023).

536

537 In our study, the relative content of deoxymyoglobin was influenced by both the pHu range 538 and ageing time (P < 0.05). Steaks with an intermediate pHu had higher deoxymyoglobin 539 content on day 3 than after 28 days of ageing (Table 5). This aligns with findings by Li et 540 al. (2020), indicating that meat with limited glycolysis and higher pH impacts the presence 541 of deoxymyoglobin and oxymyoglobin formation by promoting a higher rate of 542 mitochondrial respiration (Gagaoua et al., 2021b). Elevated muscle pH increases 543 mitochondrial respiration capacity, leading to more oxygen consumption by the 544 mitochondria, which in turn causes muscle darkening by reducing myoglobin's oxygen 545 (Kiyimba et al., 2022). Several pathways influence the activity of metmyoglobin reductase 546 (MRA), all relying on NADH, a crucial electron donor. Mitacek et al. (2019) highlighted 547 NADH's key role in reducing metmyoglobin in post-mortem muscle. These insights help 548 explain variations in colour stability between beef with normal and intermediate pHu.

549

550 No significant difference in cooking loss was observed during ageing (Table 5), though 551 the intermediate pHu group showed higher cooking loss values. This suggests that beef 552 muscles with more moisture undergo greater cooking losses (Jeremiah et al., 2003). Higher 553 fat content in meat corresponds to less bound water and protein (Table 2), impacting 554 cooking losses (Ueda et al., 2007). Protein denaturation during cooking, particularly at 555 temperatures above 70 °C, contributes to meat weight loss (Purslow et al., 2016). Our 556 findings agree with Wicklund et al. (2005) and Berger et al. (2018), who reported no 557 significant differences in cooking loss over varying ageing periods and ageing methods, 558 respectively.

559

560 Shear force results aligned with Gomes et al. (2014), showing a negative correlation 561 between normal pHu beef and shear force, as opposed to intermediate pHu beef, which 562 exhibited lower values. However, our study found no significant interaction between pHu 563 and storage period for shear force values. Liu et al. (2022) suggest that higher pH isn't 564 always the sole factor in reduced meat quality. Pre-slaughter stress, even if the final carcass 565 pH is acceptable (Ferguson & Warner, 2008), can increase shear force values (Gruber et 566 al., 2010). Heat treatment can also raise meat shear force, as it causes muscle fibre 567 disruption due to the thermal denaturation of actin and sarcoplasmic proteins at around 70 568 to 80 °C (Christensen et al., 2000). Various factors, including breed, species, diet, animal 569 age, pH rate, and myofibrillar protein breakdown, significantly affect meat tenderization 570 (Ponnampalam et al., 2017). These factors also influence shear force results. The role of μ -571 calpain in breaking down larger proteins like titin and nebulin early *post-mortem* is thought 572 to delay meat tenderization in normal pHu meat (Lomiwes et al., 2014).

573

From a sensory science perspective, tenderness isn't just about the force needed to chew but also involves mouthfeel sensations from moisture and fat. Our study, comparing the pHu group to texture profile at 3 days *post-mortem* and shear force at 3, 14, and 28 days *post-mortem*, found these differences to be non-significant. This is in line with Powell et al. (2011), who found no impact of shear force on consumer ratings across seven muscles. Liu et al. (2022) argue that the lack of significant correlation between shear force and perceived tenderness indicates these are distinct aspects.

581

582 **5.** Conclusion

583 This study provides valuable insights into assessing beef quality attributes and consumer 584 perceptions based on variations in beef muscle pHu levels. We observed that beef with an 585 intermediate pHu showed increased juiciness compared to typical pHu beef. This 586 heightened juiciness is likely due to increased water-holding capacity. These findings align 587 with consumer preference assessments that identified steaks with intermediate pHu as 588 tougher and those with normal pHu as drier. Consumer feedback indicates that attributes 589 like tenderness and juiciness significantly influence overall beef appreciation. Other important factors include roast beef flavour, chewability, saltiness, and juiciness. The study 590 591 also showed that steaks with intermediate pHu had higher deoxymyoglobin concentrations 592 on the third day compared to the twenty-eighth day of ageing. Instrumental colour 593 measurements, such as L^* , b^* , chroma, and oxymyoglobin, were significantly affected by 594 both pHu category and ageing duration (3, 14, and 28 days). This research enhances our 595 understanding of pHu variations in beef muscle and their impact on sensory attributes and 596 consumer preferences. Further studies with larger sample sizes are essential to support and 597 expand these findings, aligning with consumer expectations for premium-quality beef.

598

599 Acknowledgements

This work was supported by the São Paulo Research Foundation FAPESP (grant #
2017/26667-2; 2019/26026-2).

602

603 **Declarations of competing interest**

18

- 604 The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal
- relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.
- 606

607 **References**

- 608
- Aaslyng, M. D., Bejerholm, C., Ertbjerg, P., Bertram, H. C., & Andersen, H. J. (2003).
- 610 Cooking loss and juiciness of pork in relation to raw meat quality and cooking procedure.
- 611 Food Quality and Preference, 14(4), 277-288. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0950-</u>
- 612 <u>3293(02)00086-1</u>
- Aaslyng, M. D., Meinert, L., Bejerholm, C., & Warner, R. (2014). Sensory assessment of
- 614 meat. In Encyclopedia of Meat Sciences (pp. 272-279). Elsevier Inc.
- 615 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-323-85125-1.00042-9</u>
- 616 AMSA. (2012). Guidelines for meat color measurement. American Meat Science
- 617 Association. http://www.meatscience.org/publications-resources/printedpublicat
- 618 ions/amsa-meat-color-measurement-guidelines.
- 619 AMSA American Meat Science Association (2016). Research guidelines for cookery,
- 620 sensory evaluation, and instrumental tenderness measurements of fresh meat (2 ed,
- 621 version 1.02). American Meat Science Association, Champaign, IL, USA.
- 622 Anne, D., Thierry, A., Keisuke, S., & Michiyo, M. (2022). Transformation of highly
- 623 marbled meats under various cooking processes. Meat Science, 189, Article 108810.
- 624 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2022.108810
- 625 Antonelo, D. S., Gómez, J. F., Silva, S. L., Beline, M., Zhang, X., Wang, Y., Pavan, B.,
- 626 Koulicoff, L. A., Rosa, A. F., Goulart, R. S., Li, S., Gerrard, D. E., Suman, S. P., Wes
- 627 Schilling, M., & Balieiro, J. C. (2022). Proteome basis for the biological variations in
- 628 color and tenderness of *longissimus thoracis* muscle from beef cattle differing in growth
- 629 rate and feeding regime. *Food Research International*, *153*, Article 110947.
- 630 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2022.110947</u>
- 631 AOAC. (1995). Official Methods of Analysis. Association of Official Analytical
- 632 Chemists International. Washington D.C.
- Ares, G., & Jaeger, S. R. (2023). Check-all-that-apply (CATA) questions with consumers
- 634 in practice: Experimental considerations and impact on outcome. In Rapid sensory
- 635 profiling techniques (pp. 257-280). Woodhead Publishing. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-</u>
- 636 <u>0-12-821936-2.00013-3</u>
- 637 Bejerholm, C., Tørngren, M. A., & Aaslyng, M. D. (2014). Cooking of meat. In M., & C.

- 638 (Eds.), Encyclopedia of meat sciences (pp. 370-376) (2nd ed.). Oxford: Academic Press.
- 639 Bendall, J. R. (1973). *Postmortem* changes in muscle. The structure and function of
- 640 muscle, 2(Part 1), 243-309.
- 641 Berger, J., Kim, Y. H. B., Legako, J. F., Martini, S., Lee, J., Ebner, P., & Zuelly, S. M. S.
- 642 (2018). Dry-aging improves meat quality attributes of grass-fed beef loins. *Meat Science*,
- 643 145, 285-291. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2018.07.004</u>
- 644 Calkins, C. R., & Hodgen, J. M. (2007). A fresh look at meat flavor. Meat science, 77(1),
- 645 63-80. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2007.04.016</u>
- 646 Canto, A. C. V. C. S., Costa-Lima, B. R. C., Suman, S. P., Monteiro, M. L. G., Viana, F.
- 647 M., Salim, A. P. A. A., Mahesh, N. N., Silva, T. J. P., & Conte-Junior, C. A. (2016).
- 648 Color attributes and oxidative stability of *longissimus lumborum* and *psoas major*
- 649 muscles from Nellore bulls. *Meat Science*, 121, 19-26.
- 650 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2016.05.015</u>
- 651 Christensen, M., Purslow, P. P., & Larsen, L. M. (2000). The effect of cooking
- temperature on mechanical properties of whole meat, single muscle fibres and perimysial
- 653 connective tissue. *Meat Science*, 55(3), 301-307. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0309-
- 654 <u>1740(99)00157-6</u>
- 655 Corcoran, L. C., Schlich, P., Moloney, A. P., O'Riordan, E., Millar, K., Botinestean, C.,
- 656 Gallagher, E., O'Sullivan, M. G., & Crofton, E. C. (2023). Comparing consumer liking of
- beef from three feeding systems using a combination of traditional and temporal liking
- 658 sensory methods. *Food Research International, 168*, Article 112747.
- 659 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2023.112747</u>
- 660 Corlett, M. T., Pethick, D. W., Kelman, K. R., Jacob, R. H., & Gardner, G. E. (2021).
- 661 Consumer perceptions of meat redness were strongly influenced by storage and display
- 662 times. *Foods*, 10(3), Article 540. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/foods10030540</u>
- 663 Della Malva, A., Gagaoua, M., Santillo, A., De Palo, P., Sevi, A., & Albenzio, M. (2022).
- 664 First insights about the underlying mechanisms of Martina Franca donkey meat
- tenderization during aging: A proteomic approach. *Meat Science*, 193, Article 108925.
- 666 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2022.108925</u>
- 667 Djekic, I. V., Ilic, J. G., Sołowiej, B. G., Djekić, R. I., & Tomasevic, I. B. (2022).
- 668 Application of Food Mechanics and Oral Processing in Modelling First Bite of Grilled
- 669 Meat. Journal of Food Quality, 2022, Article ID 9176628.
- 670 <u>https://doi.org/10.1155/2022/9176628</u>
- 671 Duarte, T. L., Bolkenov, B., Klopatek, S. C., Oltjen, J. W., King, D. A., Shackelford, S.

- D., Wheeler, T. L., & Yang, X. (2022). Evaluating the Shelf Life and Sensory Properties
- of Beef Steaks from Cattle Raised on Different Grass Feeding Systems in the Western
- 674 United States. *Foods*, 11(14), Article 2141. https://doi.org/10.3390/foods11142141
- 675 Faustman, C., & Suman, S. P. (2017). The Eating Quality of Meat: I-Color. Lawrie's
- 676 Meat Science (Eight Edition), 329-356. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-100694-</u>
- 677 <u>8.00011-X</u>
- 678 Ferguson, D. M., & Warner, R. D. (2008). Have we underestimated the impact of pre-
- 679 slaughter stress on meat quality in ruminants? *Meat Science*, 80(1), 12-19.
- 680 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2008.05.004
- 681 Feiner, G. (2006). Definitions of terms used in meat science. *Meat Products Handbook*,
- 682 46-71. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1533/9781845691721.1.46
- 683 Font-i-Furnols, M., & Guerrero, L. (2014). Consumer preference, behavior and
- 684 perception about meat and meat products: An overview. *Meat science*, 98(3), 361-371.
- 685 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2014.06.025</u>
- 686 Gagaoua, M., Micol, D., Picard, B., Terlouw, C. E. M., Moloney, A. P., Juin, H., Meteau,
- 687 K., Scollan, N., Richardson, I., & Hocquette, J-F. (2016). Inter-laboratory assessment by
- trained panelists from France and the United Kingdom of beef cooked at two different
- end-point temperatures. *Meat Science*, 122, 90-96.
- 690 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2016.07.026</u>
- 691 Gagaoua, M., Picard, B., & Monteils, V. (2018). Associations among animal, carcass,
- muscle characteristics, and fresh meat color traits in Charolais cattle. *Meat Science*, 140,
- 693 145-156. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2018.03.004</u>
- 694 Gagaoua, M., Terlouw, E. M. C., Mullen, A. M., Franco, D., Warner, R. D., Lorenzo, J.
- 695 M., Purslow, P. P., Gerrard, D., Hopkins, D. L., Troy, D., & Picard, B. (2021a).
- 696 Molecular signatures of beef tenderness: Underlying mechanisms based on integromics
- 697 of protein biomarkers from multi-platform proteomics studies. *Meat Science*, 172, Article
- 698 108311. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j. meatsci.2020.108311</u>
- 699 Gagaoua, M., Warner, R. D., Purslow, P., Ramanathan, R., Mullen, A. M., López-
- 700 Pedrouso, M.,... & Terlouw, E. M. C. (2021b). Dark-cutting beef: A brief review and an
- integromics meta-analysis at the proteome level to decipher the underlying pathways.
- 702 *Meat Science*, 181, Article 108611. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2021.108611</u>
- 703 Gomes, C. L., Pflanzer, S. B., Cruz, A. G., De Felício, P. E., & Bolini, H. M. A. (2014).
- 704 Sensory descriptive profiling and consumer preferences of beef strip loin steaks. Food
- 705 *Research International*, *59*, 76-84. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2014.01.061

- 706 Grau, R., & Hamm, R. (1953). Eine einfache methode zur bestimmung der
- 707 wasserbindung im muskel. *Naturwissenschaften*, 40(1), 29-30.
- 708 Grayson, A. L., Shackelford, S. D., King, D. A., McKeith, R. O., Miller, R. K., &
- 709 Wheeler, T. L. (2016). The effects of degree of dark cutting on tenderness and sensory
- 710 attributes of beef. *Journal of Animal Science*, 94(6), 2583-2591.
- 711 <u>https://doi.org/10.2527/jas.2016-0388</u>
- 712 Gruber, S. L., Tatum, J. D., Engle, T. E., Chapman, P. L., Belk, K. E., & Smith, G. C.
- 713 (2010). Relationships of behavioral and physiological symptoms of preslaughter stress to
- beef *longissimus* muscle tenderness. *Journal of Animal Science*, 88(3), 1148-1159.
- 715 https://doi.org/10.2527/jas.2009-2183
- 716 Hoffmann, H., Hamm, R., & Bluchel, E. (1982). Neus uber die bestimung der
- 717 wasserbinding des nut hielf filter paper premethods. *Fleishwirtchaft*, 62(1), 87-94.
- 718 Holman, B. W., van de Ven, R. J., Mao, Y., Coombs, C. E., & Hopkins, D. L. (2017).
- 719 Using instrumental (CIE and reflectance) measures to predict consumers' acceptance of
- 720 beef colour. *Meat Science*, 127, 57-62. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2017.01.005</u>
- 721 Honikel, K. O. (1998). Reference methods for the assessment of physical characteristics
- 722 of meat. *Meat science*, 49(4), 447-457. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0309-1740(98)00034-5</u>
- 723 Hopkins, D. L. (1996). Assessment of lamb meat colour. *Meat Focus*
- 724 *International*, *5*(11), 400-401.
- Huff-Lonergan, E., & Lonergan, S. M. (2005). Mechanisms of water-holding capacity of
- meat: The role of postmortem biochemical and structural changes. *Meat Science*, 71(1),
- 727 194-204. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2005.04.022</u>
- Hunt, M. C., Sørhelm, O., & Slinde, E. (1999). Color and heat denaturation of myoglobin
- forms in ground beef. *Journal of Food Science*, 64(5), 847-851.
- 730 <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2621.1999.tb15925.x</u>
- 731 Hwang, Y-H., Kim, G-D., Jeong, J-Y., Hur, S-J., & Joo, S-T. (2010). The relationship
- between muscle fiber characteristics and meat quality traits of highly marbled Hanwoo
- 733 (Korean native cattle) steers. *Meat Science*, 86(2), 456-461.
- 734 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2010.05.034</u>
- 735 Jaeger, S. R., Beresford, M. K., Paisley, A. G., Antúnez, L., Vidal, L., Cadena, R. S.,
- 736 Giménez, A., & Ares, G. (2015). Check-all-that-apply (CATA) questions for sensory
- 737 product characterization by consumers: Investigations into the number of terms used in
- 738 CATA questions. *Food Quality and Preference*, *42*, 154-164.
- 739 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodqual.2015.02.003

- 740 Jeong, J. Y., Hur, S. J., Yang, H. S., Moon, S. H., Hwang, Y. H., Park, G. B., & Joo, S. T.
- 741 (2009). Discoloration Characteristics of 3 Major Muscles From Cattle During Cold
- 742 Storage. Journal of Food Science, 74(1), C1-C5. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1750-</u>
- 743 <u>3841.2008.00983.x</u>
- 744 Jeremiah, L., Dugan, M., Aalhus, J., & Gibson, L. (2003). Assessment of the chemical
- and cooking properties of the major beef muscles and muscle groups. Meat Science,
- 746 65(3), 985-992. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0309-1740(02)00308-X
- Jia, W., Wang, X., Zhang, R., Shi, Q., & Shi, L. (2022). Irradiation role on meat quality
- 748 induced dynamic molecular transformation: From nutrition to texture. Food Reviews
- 749 International, 1, 1-23. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/87559129.2022.2026377</u>
- Joseph, P., Suman, S. P., Rentfrow, G., Li, S., & Beach, C. M. (2012). Proteomics of
- muscle-specific beef color stability. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 60(12),
- 752 3196-3203. <u>https://doi.org/10.1021/jf204188v</u>
- 753 Kannan, G., Kouakou, B., & Gelaye, S. (2001). Color changes reflecting myoglobin and
- 154 lipid oxidation in chevon cuts during refrigerated display. Small Ruminant Research,
- 755 *42(1)*, 67-74. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0921-4488(01)00232-2</u>
- 756 Kerth, C. R., & R. K. Miller. 2015. Beef flavor: A review from chemistry to
- consumer. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 95, 2783-2798.
- 758 <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.7204</u>
- King, N. J., & Whyte, R. (2006). Does it look cooked? A review of factors that influence
- cooked meat color. *Journal of food science*, *71(4)*, R31-R40.
- 761 <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1750-3841.2006.00029.x</u>
- 762 Kim, Y. H., Keeton, J. T., Smith, S. B., Berghman, L. R., & Savell, J. W. (2009). Role of
- ⁷⁶³ lactate dehydrogenase in metmyoglobin reduction and color stability of different bovine
- 764 muscles. *Meat Science*, 83(3), 376-382. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2009.06.009</u>
- 765 Kiyimba, F., Hartson, S. D., Rogers, J., Vanoverbeke, D. L., Mafi, G. G., & Ramanathan,
- 766 R. (2022). Dark-cutting beef mitochondrial proteomic signatures reveal increased
- 767 biogenesis proteins and bioenergetics capabilities. Journal of Proteomics, 265, Article
- 768 104637. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jprot.2022.104637</u>
- Kosowska, M., Majcher, M. A., & Fortuna, T. (2017). Volatile compounds in meat and
- meat products. *Food Science and Technology (Brazil)*, *37(1)*, 1-7.
- 771 <u>https://doi.org/10.1590/1678-457X.08416</u>
- Li, C., Wang, D., Xu, W., Gao, F., & Zhou, G. (2013). Effect of final cooked temperature
- on tenderness, protein solubility and microstructure of duck breast muscle. LWT Food

- 774 *Science and Technology*, *51*(*1*), 266-274.
- 775 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2012.10.003</u>
- Li, X., Zhang, D., Ijaz, M., Tian, G., Chen, J., & Du, M. (2020). Colour characteristics of
- beef *longissimus thoracis* during early 72 h postmortem. *Meat Science*, *170*, 108245.
- 778 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2020.108245</u>
- Li, Z., Ha, M., Frank, D., Hastie, M., & Warner, R. D. (2023). Muscle fibre type
- composition influences the formation of odour-active volatiles in beef. *Food Research*
- 781 International, 165, Article 112468. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2023.112468</u>
- 782 Lindahl, G., Lundström, K., & Tornberg, E. (2001). Contribution of pigment content,
- myoglobin forms and internal reflectance to the colour of pork loin and ham from pure
- 784 breed pigs. *Meat Science*, 59(2), 141-151. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0309-1740(01)00064-</u>
- 785 <u>X</u>
- Liu, J., Ellies-Oury, M. P., Stoyanchev, T., & Hocquette, J. F. (2022). Consumer
- 787 perception of beef quality and how to control, improve and predict it? Focus on eating
- 788 quality. *Foods*, 11(12), Article 1732. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/foods11121732</u>
- 789 Lomiwes, D., Farouk, M. M., Wu, G., & Young, O. A. (2014). The development of meat
- tenderness is likely to be compartmentalised by ultimate pH. Meat Science, 96(1), 646-
- 791 651. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2013.08.022</u>
- 792 Loudon, K. M. W., Lean, I. J., Pethick, D. W., Gardner, G. E., Grubb, L. J., Evans, A. C.,
- 8 McGilchrist, P. (2018). On farm factors increasing dark cutting in pasture finished beef
- 794 cattle. *Meat science*, 144, 110-117. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2018.06.011</u>
- 795 Lyford, C., Thompson, J., Polkinghorne, R., Miller, M., Nishimura, T., Neath, K., Allen,
- P., & Belasco, E. (2010). Is willingness to pay (WTP) for beef quality grades affected by
- consumer demographics and meat consumption preferences? *Australasian Agribusiness*
- 798 *Review*, 18, 1-17.
- 799 Madruga, M. S., & Mottram, D. S. (1995). The effect of pH on the formation of maillard-
- 800 derived aroma volatiles using a cooked meat system. Journal of the Science of Food and
- 801 Agriculture, 68(3), 305-310. <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.2740680308</u>
- 802 Malheiros, B. A., Spers, E. E., Silva, H. M. R. D., & Contreras Castillo, C. J. (2022).
- 803 Southeast Brazilian Consumers' Involvement and Willingness to Pay for Quality Cues in
- Fresh and Cooked Beef. *Journal of Food Products Marketing*, 28(6), 276-293.
- 805 https://doi.org/10.1080/10454446.2022.2129539
- 806 Martins, M. M., Saldaña, E., Teixeira, A. C. B., Selani, M. M., & Contreras-Castillo, C. J.
- 807 (2021). Going beyond sensory and hedonic aspects: A Brazilian study of emotions

- 808 evoked by beef in different contexts. *Meat Science*, 180, Article 108536.
- 809 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2021.108536</u>
- 810 McKenna, D., Mies, P., Baird, B., Pfeiffer, K., Ellebracht, J., & Savell, J. (2005).
- 811 Biochemical and physical factors affecting discoloration characteristics of 19 bovine
- 812 muscles. *Meat Science*, 70(4), 665-682. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2005.02.016</u>
- 813 Miller, M. F., Carr, M. A., Ramsey, C. B., Crockett, K. L., & Hoover, L. C. (2001).
- 814 Consumer thresholds for establishing the value of beef tenderness. *Journal of animal*
- 815 science, 79(12), 3062-3068. <u>https://doi.org/10.2527/2001.79123062x</u>
- 816 Mitacek, R. M., Ke, Y., Prenni, J. E., Jadeja, R., VanOverbeke, D. L., Mafi, G. G., &
- 817 Ramanathan, R. (2019). Mitochondrial degeneration, depletion of NADH, and oxidative
- 818 stress Decrease color stability of wet-aged beef Longissimus steaks. Journal of Food
- 819 Science, 84(1), 38-50. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/1750-3841.14396</u>
- 820 Murray, J. M., Delahunty, C. M., & Baxter, I. A. (2001). Descriptive sensory analysis:
- past, present and future. *Food research international*, *34*(6), 461-471.
- 822 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0963-9969(01)00070-9
- 823 Obuz, E., & Dikeman, M. E. (2003). Effects of cooking beef muscles from frozen or
- thawed states on cooking traits and palatability. *Meat Science*, 65(3), 993–997.
- 825 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0309-1740(02)00314-5</u>
- 826 O'Quinn, T. G., Brooks, J. C., Polkinghorne, R. J., Garmyn, A. J., Johnson, B. J., Starkey,
- J. D., Rathmann, R. J., & Miller, M. F. (2012). Consumer assessment of beef strip loin
- steaks of varying fat levels. *Journal of Animal Science*, 90(2), 626-634.
- 829 <u>https://doi.org/10.2527/jas.2011-4282</u>
- 830 Patinho, I., Saldaña, E., Selani, M. M., Camargo, A. C., Merlo, T. C., Menegali, B. S.,
- 831 Silva, A. P. S., & Contreras-Castillo, C. J. (2019). Use of Agaricus bisporus mushroom in
- 832 beef burgers: Antioxidant, flavor enhancer and fat replacing potential. Food Production,
- 833 *Processing and Nutrition, 1*, 1-15. <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/s43014-019-0006-3</u>
- Patinho, I., Selani, M. M., Saldaña, E., Bortoluzzi, A. C. T., Rios-Mera, J. D., Silva, C.
- 835 M., Kushida, M. M., & Contreras-Castillo, C. J. (2021). Agaricus bisporus mushroom as
- 836 partial fat replacer improves the sensory quality maintaining the instrumental
- 837 characteristics of beef burger. *Meat science*, 172, Article 108307.
- 838 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2020.108307
- 839 Picard, B., & Gagaoua, M. (2020). Muscle fiber properties in cattle and their relationships
- 840 with meat qualities: An overview. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 68(22),
- 841 6021-6039. <u>https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.jafc.0c02086</u>

- 842 Poleti, M. D., Moncau, C. T., Silva-Vignato, B., Rosa, A. F., Lobo, A. R., Cataldi, T. R.,
- 843 Negrão, J. A., Silva, S. L., Eler, J. P., & Balieiro, J. C. C. (2018). Label-free quantitative
- 844 proteomic analysis reveals muscle contraction and metabolism proteins linked to ultimate
- pH in bovine skeletal muscle. *Meat science*, *145*, 209-219.
- 846 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2018.06.041</u>
- 847 Ponnampalam, E. N., Hopkins, D. L., Bruce, H., Li, D., Baldi, G., & Bekhit, A. E.
- 848 (2017). Causes and contributing factors to "dark cutting" meat: Current trends and future
- 849 directions: A review. Comprehensive Reviews in Food Science and Food Safety, 16(3),
- 850 400-430. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/1541-4337.12258</u>
- 851 Powell, L., Nicholson, K. L., Huerta-Montauti, D., Miller, R. K., & Savell, J. W. (2011).
- 852 Constraints on establishing threshold levels for Warner–Bratzler shear-force values based
- on consumer sensory ratings for seven beef muscles. Animal production science, 51(10),
- 854 959-966. <u>https://doi.org/10.1071/AN10267</u>
- Purslow, P., Oiseth, S., Hughes, J., & Warner, R. (2016). The structural basis of cooking
- loss in beef: Variations with temperature and ageing. Food Research International, 89,
- 857 739-748. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2016.09.010</u>
- 858 Ramanathan, R. & Mancini, R. A. (2018). Role of Mitochondria in Beef Color: A
- Review, *Meat and Muscle Biology 2(1)*, 309-320.
- 860 <u>https://doi.org/10.22175/mmb2018.05.0013</u>
- 861 Ramanathan, R., Kiyimba, F., Gonzalez, J., Mafi, G., & DeSilva, U. (2020). Impact of Up
- and Down regulation of Metabolites and Mitochondrial Content on pH and Color of the
- 863 Longissimus Muscle from Normal-pH and Dark-Cutting Beef. Journal of Agricultural
- 864 and Food Chemistry, 68, 7194-7203. <u>https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.jafc.0c01884</u>
- 865 Saldaña, E., Martins, M. M., Behrens, J. H., Valentin, D., Selani, M. M., & Contreras-
- 866 Castillo, C. J. (2020a). Looking at non-sensory factors underlying consumers' perception
- 867 of smoked bacon. *Meat science*, 163, Article 108072.
- 868 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2020.108072</u>
- 869 Saldaña, E., Serrano-León, J., Selani, M. M., & Contreras-Castillo, C. J. (2020b). Sensory
- and hedonic impact of the replacement of synthetic antioxidant for pink pepper residue
- extract in chicken burger. Journal of food science and technology, 57, 617-627.
- 872 <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s13197-019-04093-x</u>
- 873 Saldaña, E., Merlo, T. C., Patinho, I., Rios-Mera, J. D., Contreras-Castillo, C. J., &
- 874 Selani, M. M. (2021). Use of sensory science for the development of healthier processed
- 875 meat products: A critical opinion. *Current opinion in food science*, 40, 13-19.

- 876 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cofs.2020.04.012</u>
- 877 Selani, M. M., Ramos, P. H. B., Patinho, I., França, F., dos Santos Harada-Padermo, S.,
- 878 Contreras-Castillo, C. J., & Saldaña, E. (2022). Consumer's perception and expected
- 879 liking of labels of burgers with sodium reduction and addition of mushroom flavor
- enhancer. *Meat Science*, 185, Article 108720.
- 881 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2021.108720
- Shackelford, S. D., M. Koohmaraie, M. F. Miller, J. D. Crouse, and J. O. Reagan. 1991.
- 883 An evaluation of tenderness of the *longissimus* muscle of Angus by Hereford versus
- Brahman crossbred heifers. Journal of Animal Science, 69, 171-177.
- 885 <u>https://doi.org/10.2527/1991.691171x</u>
- Sharedeh, D., Gatellier, P., Astruc, T., & Daudin, J. D. (2015). Effects of pH and NaCl
- 887 levels in a beef marinade on physicochemical states of lipids and proteins and on tissue
- 888 microstructure. Meat Science, 110, 24-31. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2015.07.004</u>
- 889 Spanier, A. M., Flores, M., McMillin, K. W., & Bidner, T. D. (1997). The effect of post-
- 890 mortem aging on meat flavor quality in Brangus beef. Correlation of treatments, sensory,
- instrumental and chemical descriptors. *Food Chemistry*, 59(4), 531-538.
- 892 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0308-8146(97)00003-4
- Suman, S. P., Nair, M. N., Joseph, P., & Hunt, M. C. (2016). Factors influencing internal
- color of cooked meats. *Meat Science*, *120*, 133-144.
- 895 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2016.04.006</u>
- 896 Suman, S. P., Wang, Y., Gagaoua, M., Kiyimba, F., & Ramanathan, R. (2023). Proteomic
- approaches to characterize biochemistry of fresh beef color. Journal of Proteomics, 281,
- 898 Article 104893. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jprot.2023.104893</u>
- 899 Torres Filho, R. D. A., Cazedey, H. P., Fontes, P. R., Ramos, A. D. L. S., & Ramos, E.
- 900 M. (2017). Drip loss assessment by different analytical methods and their relationships
- 901 with pork quality classification. *Journal of Food Quality, 2017*, Article ID 9170768.
- 902 <u>https://doi.org/10.1155/2017/9170768</u>
- 903 Troy, D. J., & Kerry, J. P. (2010). Consumer perception and the role of science in the
- 904 meat industry. *Meat science*, *86(1)*, 214-226.
- 905 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2010.05.009</u>
- 906 Ueda, Y., Watanabe, A., Higuchi, M., Shingu, H., Kushibiki, S., & Shinoda,
- 907 M. (2007). Effects of intramuscular fat deposition on the beef traits of Japanese Black
- 908 steers (Wagyu). Animal Science Journal, 78(2), 189-194. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1740-</u>
- 909 <u>0929.2007.00424.x</u>

- 910 Wakeling, I. N., & MacFie, H. J. (1995). Designing consumer trials balanced for first and
- 911 higher orders of carry-over effect when only a subset of k samples from t may be
- 912 tested. Food Quality and Preference, 6(4), 299-308. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/0950-</u>
- 913 <u>3293(95)00032-1</u>
- 914 Wang, F., Holman, B. W., Zhang, Y., Luo, X., Mao, Y., & Hopkins, D. L. (2020).
- 915 Investigation of colour requirements of frozen beef rolls by Chinese consumers for hot
- 916 pot. Meat Science, 162, Article 108038. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2019.108038</u>
- 917 Warner, R. & Miller, R. & Ha, M. & Wheeler, T. L. & Dunshea, F. & Li, X. & Vaskoska,
- 918 R. & Purslow, P. (2021). Meat Tenderness: Underlying Mechanisms, Instrumental
- 919 Measurement, and Sensory Assessment. *Meat and Muscle Biology* 4(2), 1-25.
- 920 <u>https://doi.org/10.22175/mmb.10489</u>
- 921 Watanabe, G., Motoyama, M., Orita, K., Takita, K., Aonuma, T., Nakajima, I., Tajima,
- A., Abe, A., & Sasaki, K. (2019). Assessment of the dynamics of sensory perception of
- 923 Wagyu beef strip loin prepared with different cooking methods and fattening periods
- 924 using the temporal dominance of sensations. Food Science & Nutrition, 7(11), 3538-
- 925 3548. <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/fsn3.1205</u>
- 926 Watson, R., Polkinghorne, R., & Thompson, J. M. (2008). Development of the Meat
- 927 Standards Australia (MSA) prediction model for beef palatability. Australian Journal of
- 928 Experimental Agriculture, 48(11), 1368-1379. <u>https://doi.org/10.1071/EA07184</u>
- 929 Wicklund, S. E., Homco-Ryan, C., Ryan, K. J., Mckeith, F. K., Mcfarlane, B. J., &
- 930 Brewer, M. S. (2005). Aging and Enhancement Effects on Quality Characteristics of Beef
- 931 Strip Steaks. Journal of Food Science, 70(3), S242-S248. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-</u>
- 932 <u>2621.2005.tb07164.x</u>
- 933 Wu, S., Han, J., Liang, R., Dong, P., Zhu, L., Hopkins, D. L., Zhang, Y., & Luo, X.
- 934 (2020). Investigation of muscle-specific beef color stability at different ultimate pHs.
- Asian-Australasian Journal of Animal Sciences, 33(12), 1999-2007.
- 936 <u>https://doi.org/10.5713/ajas.19.0943</u>
- 937 Yang, X., Wang, J., Holman, B. W., Liang, R., Chen, X., Luo, X., Zhu, L., Hopkins, D.
- 938 L., & Zhang, Y. (2021). Investigation of the physicochemical, bacteriological, and
- sensory quality of beef steaks held under modified atmosphere packaging and
- 940 representative of different ultimate pH values. *Meat Science*, 174, Article 108416.
- 941 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2020.108416
- 242 Zhang, Y., Kim, Y., Puolanne, E., & Ertbjerg, P. (2022). Role of freezing-induced
- 943 myofibrillar protein denaturation in the generation of thaw loss: A review. *Meat Science*,

- 944 *190*, Article 108841. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2022.108841</u>
- 245 Zhu, Y., Gagaoua, M., Mullen, A. M., Viala, D., Rai, D. K., Kelly, A. L., Sheehan, D., &
- Hamill, R. M. (2021). Shotgun proteomics for the preliminary identification of
- 947 biomarkers of beef sensory tenderness, juiciness and chewiness from plasma and muscle
- 948 of young Limousin-sired bulls. Meat science, 176, Article 108488.
- 949 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2021.108488</u>
- 250 Zimoch, J., & Gullett, E. A. (1997). Temporal aspects of perception of juiciness and
- tenderness of beef. *Food Quality and Preference*, 8(3), 203-211.
- 952 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0950-3293(96)00049-3</u>
- 953

Table 1. Attributes, definitions, assessment techniques, and scale endpoints used in the Optimised

 Sensory Profile of beef.

*Attribute	Definition	Technique	Scale endpoints
Connective tissue presence	Visual presence of white-coloured gelatinous matter	The assessor should be seated at a 90° angle and can approach the sample without touching the plate, at a minimum distance of ~40 cm	Lowest: beef knuckle Highest: beef shin
Apparent opacity	Opacity outside colour (opaque)	The assessor should be seated at a 90° angle and can approach the sample without touching the plate, at a minimum distance of ~40 cm	Lowest: roasted Chester TM Highest: grilled broiler breast fillet
Surface brown colour	Brown pigmentation on meat surface, characteristic of cooked beef	The assessor should be seated at a 90° angle and can approach the sample without touching the plate, at a minimum distance of ~40 cm	Lowest: boiled beef Highest: grilled beef
Internal colour	Internal colour of beef, ranging from red to brown	The assessor should be seated at a 90° angle and can approach the sample without touching the plate, at a minimum distance of ~40 cm	Lowest: rare grilled beef Highest: well-done grilled beef
Roast beef aroma	Characteristic aroma of roast beef	Raise the sample container to the nose and perform up to 3 long inhalations	Lowest: meat cooked in water Highest: meat baked in the oven
Blood aroma	Characteristic aroma of raw beef	Raise the sample container to the nose and perform up to 3 long inhalations	Lowest: medium steak Highest: raw beef
Overall tenderness	Little force required for chewing	Chewing with molar teeth until sample is swallowed	Lowest: grilled beef outside flat Highest: grilled beef tenderloin
Overall juiciness	Release of liquid during chewing	Chewing with molar teeth until sample is swallowed	Lowest: grilled beef knuckle Highest: Grilled sirloin cap steak
Hardness	Force required to achieve certain product deformation	Chewing with molar teeth until sample is swallowed	Lowest: medium rump steak (63 °C) Highest: well-done outside flat steak (79 °C)
Dryness	No liquid release during chewing	Chewing with molar teeth until sample is swallowed	Lowest: rare sirloin cap steak (60 °C) Highest: cooked pork chop (79 °C)
Fibrousness		Place the sample in the mouth and generate a perception within 7 chews	

*Attribute	Definition	Technique	Scale endpoints
	Presence of fibres that persists throughout chewing		Lowest: grilled tenderloin steak Highest: grilled outside flat steak
Chewiness	The number of chews required for the product to be ready for swallowing	Place the sample in the mouth and generate a perception within 7 chews	Lowest: medium tenderloin (63 °C) Highest: well-done pork chop (79 °C)
Roast beef flavour	Characteristic roast meat flavour	Chewing with molar teeth until sample is swallowed	Lowest: Boiled beef Highest: baked beef
Meaty beef flavour	Characteristic beef flavour	Chewing with molar teeth until sample is swallowed	Lowest: Boiled beef Highest: grilled beef
Fat flavour	Perception of fat in the mouth during chewing	Place the sample in the mouth and generate a perception within 7 chews	Lowest: cooked chicken breast fillet (79 °C) Highest: cooked beef rib (69 °C)
Blood flavour	Flavour associated with blood in cooked meat products; closely related to a metallic flavour	Place the sample in the mouth and generate a perception within 7 chews	Lowest: well-done sirloin cap steak (82 °C) Highest: rare sirloin steak (55 °C)

* For each attribute, a 9-cm unstructured linear intensity scale was utilised, with intensity levels ranging from 'Lowest' at 0 to 'Highest' at 9, anchored at both ends of the scale

Table 2. Proximate composition of intermediate and normal pHu beef 3 days post-mortem

Treatment	Moisture (%)	Protein (%)	Lipid (%)	Ash (%)
Intermediate pHu	74.95	20.89	2.67	1.03
Normal pHu	73.49	24.02	1.40	1.06

Proximate composition was determined by method (AOAC, 1995) and (ISO 1871:2009; 936:1998).

Table 3 – Mean ratings* of the sensory attributes evaluated in the intermediate and normal pHu beef 3 days *post-mortem*. Measurements on a 9-cm unstructured linear scale (0 = none/Lowest; 9= Highest)

Sensory attributes				
Sensory attributes	Intermediate pHu	Normal pHu	t-value	P-value**
Connective tissue presence	1.90±2.21	1.62±2.21	0.68	0.50
Apparent opacity	2.36±2.31	3.02±2.31	-1.57	0.12
Surface brown colour	7.18±1.57	7.44±1.57	-0.90	0.37
Internal colour	6.35±1.98	6.22 ± 1.98	0.36	0.72
Roast beef aroma	6.92±2.29	7.10±2.29	-0.43	0.67
Blood aroma	$0.97{\pm}1.46$	0.81 ± 1.46	0.60	0.55
Overall tenderness	4.19 ± 2.88	4.06 ± 2.88	0.23	0.82
Overall juiciness	5.88±2.50	4.48±2.50	3.18	0.00
Hardness	4.35 ± 2.94	4.21±2.94	0.27	0.79
Dryness	2.35 ± 2.35	3.02 ± 2.35	-1.56	0.12
Fibrousness	3.66 ± 2.80	3.64 ± 2.80	0.03	0.97
Chewiness	5.42 ± 2.85	5.36 ± 2.85	0.12	0.91
Roast beef flavour	6.92±2.26	6.89 ± 2.26	0.06	0.95
Meaty beef flavour	7.95±1.30	7.87 ± 1.30	0.34	0.73
Fat flavour	1.76 ± 2.02	1.78 ± 2.02	-0.04	0.97
Blood flavour	1.71±1.71	1.21±1.71	1.64	0.10

* Measurements on a 9-cm unstructured linear scale (0 = none/Lowest; 9= Highest)

**Sensory attributes with a significant (P < 0.05) effect on responses are marked in bold. Results are expressed as mean \pm standard deviation.

Parameters	Intermediate pHu	Normal pHu	<i>P</i> -value*	
Ultimate pH	5.89±0.04	5.58±0.04	0.01	
Drip loss (%)	2.12±0.40	3.32±0.40	0.10	
TPA				
Hardness (N)	62.19±7.01	81.94±7.01	0.12	
Springiness	0.01 ± 0.00	0.01 ± 0.00	0.66	
Cohesiveness	0.01 ± 0.00	0.01 ± 0.00	0.19	
Chewiness	21.83±3.65	32.08 ± 3.65	0.12	
Gumminess	34.13±3.96	48.73±3.96	0.06	

Table 4. Quality parameters of intermediate and normal pHu beef 3 days *post-mortem*

The parameters which have a significant (P<0.05) effect on responses are marked in bold. Results are expressed as mean \pm standard error of the mean. TPA, texture profile analysis. N = Newtons.

Parameters	L^*	<i>a</i> *	<i>b</i> *	Chroma	Hue	Surface colour stability	%OMb	%MMb	%DMb	%WHC	%Cooking losses	Shear force (N)
Source of variation						·						
Intermediate pHu	38.50 ^b	25.81ª	18.12 ^b	31.55 ^b	34.70 ^a	5.94 ^a	68.22 ^b	17.17 ^a	14.51 ^a	34.22 ^a	28.43 ^a	85.19 ^b
Normal pHu	41.90 ^a	28.06 ^a	20.60 ^a	34.87 ^a	35.61 ^a	6.00 ^a	73.38 ^a	17.92ª	8.66 ^b	32.74 ^a	26.00 ^a	102.43 ^a
SEM	0.44	0.74	0.76	1.05	0.39	0.31	1.27	0.65	1.21	0.77	1.14	5.34
Aging days	L^*	<i>a</i> *	b *	Chroma	Hue	Surface colour stability	%OMb	%MMb	%DMb	%WHC	%Cooking losses	Shear force (N)
3	42.13 ^a	21.83 ^b	13.55 ^b	25.71 ^b	31.59 ^b	3.64 ^b	61.78 ^b	23.06 ^a	15.16 ^a	30.92 ^b	25.10 ^a	104.89ª
14	38.60 ^b	28.79 ^a	21.63 ^a	36.03 ^a	36.75 ^a	6.99 ^a	73.09 ^a	14.05 ^b	12.68 ^a	33.86 ^{ab}	29.44 ^a	92.67 ^a
28	39.87 ^b	30.17 ^a	22.90 ^a	37.89 ^a	37.13 ^a	7.28 ^a	77.53 ^a	15.52 ^b	6.91 ^b	35.65 ^a	27.10 ^a	83.86 ^a
SEM	0.53	0.91	0.93	1.28	0.48	0.38	1.55	0.79	1.48	0.95	1.40	6.54

Table 5. Effect of ultimate pH (pHu) and aging days on quality parameters of intermediate and normal pHu beef at 3, 14, and 28 days post-mortem

Different letters in the same column indicate significant differences (P < 0.05) according to the Tukey's test. SEM: Standard error of the mean. Luminosity (L^*), Redness (a^*), Yellowness (b^*), Chroma and Hue. OMb: oxymyoglobin, MMb: metmyoglobin. DMb: deoxymyoglobin. Surface colour stability, Water-holding capacity (WHC), Cooking losses and Shear force (N = Newtons).

Fig. 1. Principal Component Analysis of ODP data from intermediate and normal pHu beef at 3 days *post-mortem*. A) Individual data points. B) Variables plots.



Fig. 2. Correspondence and Principal Coordinate Analysis of Sensory Descriptors. A) Correspondence Analysis of sensory descriptors for intermediate and normal pHu beef at 3 days post-mortem, depicted in the first two dimensions derived from PCA of the Check-All-That-Apply (CATA) questions and the ideal sample. **B**) Representation of the relationship between overall liking and the sensory descriptors by Principal Coordinate Analysis.



Fig. 3. Penalty-Lift Analysis on Sensory Attributes and Overall Liking Scores. Penalty-lift analysis showing the impact of sensory attributes on the mean overall liking scores for beef samples with intermediate and normal pHu, 3 days post-mortem.



Fig. 4. Principal Component Analysis of Instrumental Quality Parameters in Beef Samples.

Principal Component Analysis of various instrumental quality parameters measured in beef samples with intermediate and normal pHu at 3, 14, and 28 days post-mortem. The parameters evaluated include luminosity (L*), redness (a*), yellowness (b*), chroma, hue angle, and concentrations of oxymyoglobin, metmyoglobin, and deoxymyoglobin, alongside assessments of surface color stability, water holding capacity (WHC), cooking losses, and shear force.



Highlights

- Sensory analysis of Nellore beef comparing normal and intermediate pHu
- Intermediate pHu beef scored higher for juiciness according to trained panellists
- Consumers could not differentiate between intermediate and normal pHu beef
- Higher deoxymyoglobin on day 3 than on day 28 in intermediate pHu beef
- Beef colour is influenced by pHu and ageing: L^* , b^* , Chroma, and Oxymyoglobin