

Deciphering the biotic and abiotic drivers of coalescence asymmetry between soil and manure microbiomes

Chunkai Li, Xianping Li, Sana Romdhane, Yanhong Cheng, Gen Li, Rui Cao, Peng Li, Jingjing Xu, Yexin Zhao, Yang Yang, et al.

To cite this version:

Chunkai Li, Xianping Li, Sana Romdhane, Yanhong Cheng, Gen Li, et al.. Deciphering the biotic and abiotic drivers of coalescence asymmetry between soil and manure microbiomes. 2024. hal-04674206

HAL Id: hal-04674206 <https://hal.inrae.fr/hal-04674206v1>

Preprint submitted on 21 Aug 2024

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

*** Corresponding author:**

- Dr. Huixin Li
- 25 Tel.: +86-025-84395210; Fax: +86-025-84395210; E-mail: huixinli@njau.edu.cn
-

E-mail addresses:

- Chunkai Li: chunkaili217@njfu.edu.cn
- Xianping Li: xianpingli@njau.edu.cn
- Sana Romdhane: Sana.Romdhane@inrae.fr
- Yanhong Cheng: yanhongch007@163.com
- Gen Li: T2021113@njau.edu.cn
- Rui Cao: 2020103010@stu.njau.edu.cn
- Peng Li: lp152690@163.com
- 35 Jingjing Xu: $xujingjing@njau.edu.cn$
- Yexin Zhao: zhaoyexin@njau.edu.cn
- Yang Yang: yyang0335@njau.edu.cn
- Jiaguo Jiao: jiaguojiao@njau.edu.cn
- Feng Hu: fenghu@njau.edu.cn
- Jun Wu: wujun2013@njau.edu.cn
- Huixin Li: huixinli@njau.edu.cn
- Laurent Philippot: laurent.philippot@inrae.fr

Keywords

Organic fertilization; Bacteria; Fungi; Environmental filtering; Biotic interactions

Abstract

 Manure application improves soil fertility, yet its implications for the invasion success of manure-borne microorganisms into the soil are poorly understood. Here, we assessed the importance of abiotic and biotic factors in modulating the extent to which manure- borne fungal and bacterial communities can invade resident soil microbial communities. For this purpose, we applied different manure treatments over 180 days and monitored changes in bacterial and fungal communities. Two different amounts of manure were applied at varying frequencies to nine soils differing in their physico-chemical properties as well as in land use history. Variance partitioning revealed the differential contributions of abiotic and biotic factors to invasion success, that together accounted for up to 82% of the variance explained. We showed that the interaction effects between biotic and abiotic factors increased with coalescence frequency and with manure amount for the bacterial and fungal community, respectively. Both abiotic and biotic factors were important in modulating coalescence asymmetry for the bacterial community, while abiotic factors had a greater effect on the fungal community. Our results provide new insights into the drivers of coalescence events between manure and resident soil microbial communities. Moreover, our findings highlight the roles of the mixing ratio and frequency of coalescence events in modulating manure-borne microorganism survival.

1. Introduction

 Manure is increasingly used as a substitute for mineral fertilizers as an environmentally friendly alternative towards sustainable agriculture (Bender et al., 2016; Tilman et al., 70 2002). The estimated manure production worldwide reached 127.6 Tg N yr^{-1} in 2019, with more than one-fifth of the produced manure applied to soil (FAO, 2019). Manure application not only provides a valuable source of nutrients required for plant growth, as it contains nitrogen, phosphorus, and potassium (Maillard and Angers, 2014; Hazra, 2016), but also improves soil physical properties such as soil aggregate stability and soil porosity (Karami et al., 2012; Tripathi et al., 2014). Moreover, manure application can reduce carbon losses and increase soil carbon sequestration, thereby mitigating the impacts of climate change (Gattinger et al., 2012). As such, the application of manure to agricultural soils could contribute to achieving various targets of the Sustainable Development Goals of the United Nations (Bernstein, 2017).

 The impact of manure application on soil microbial communities has been well documented using both field and microcosm experiments (Chen et al., 2017; Hartmann et al., 2015). For example, Hartmann et al. (2015) showed that manure application altered soil microbial community composition, richness, and evenness. However, these effects of manure applications are the net consequences of both shifts in native soil communities and invasion by manure-borne microorganisms. Thus, manure application, by supplying valuable nutrients, can significantly increase the abundance of several soil copiotrophic taxa that exhibit optimal growth at high nutrient concentrations, such as the Proteobacteria (Fierer et al., 2007; Zhang et al., 2017). A few studies also reported that some bacterial taxa in manure can survive in the soil for several months (Johansson et al., 2005; Lourenco et al., 2018). Most invasion ecology studies have focused on plants and to a lesser extent on animals (Alp et al., 2016; Li et al., 2022), and therefore knowledge of the factors contributing to the invasion success of microorganisms in soil is scarce (Litchman, 2010). Moreover, whereas manure application exposes resident soil microbial communities to multiple microbial invaders, previous studies have examined soil invasion by only a single microbial species (Pettay et al., 2015; Van Elsas et al., 2012).

 There are key challenges in studying and understanding the effect of manure application on soil microbial communities, as both biotic and abiotic components of soil and manure can influence the invasion success of manure-borne microorganisms. For example, Elton's diversity-invasibility hypothesis states that diversity of the native communities confers resistance to invasion by reducing resources availability for newly arriving species (Elton, 1958). Accordingly, Van Elsas et al (2012) found a negative correlation between the diversity of the soil microbial community and the survival of the bacterial invader. Previous studies also showed that the survival of bacterial invader can also be negatively affected by its phylogenetic relatedness to the native communities, because more closely related species exhibit higher niche overlap, as suggested by Darwin's naturalization hypothesis (Darwin et al., 1895; Tan et al., 2015). The addition of nutrients through manure fertilization also modifies soil properties, which can not only affect the native soil microbial community but also the survival of manure-borne microorganisms (Lourenco et al., 2018; Sun et al. 2016). Thus, resource

 pulses due to manure application can abiotically improve invasion success by providing additional niches and disrupting the resident community through habitat disturbance (Ma et al., 2015; Mallon et al., 2015a). Consequently, differential responses of microbial communities to manure fertilization according to the soil properties and to the manure fertilization regimes have previously reported in several studies (Ren et al. 2019, Pérez-Valera et al. 2019; Feng et al. 2022, Sadet-Bourgeteau et al., 2019), but very few have provided a clear understanding of the underlying factors.

 Recently, the concept of coalescence has been used to describe such encounter of previously separate microbial communities and their habitats to better understand and predict the resulting microbial assemblages (Huet et al., 2023; Ramoneda et al., 2021; Rillig et al., 2015). As proposed by Rillig et al. (2016), manure application to soil results in asymmetric coalescence, with the soil microbial community overrepresented compared to the manure-borne microbial community. Little is known about the relative importance of biotic and abiotic factors in modulating the outcome of coalescence between soil- and manure-borne microorganisms. This is even more important as manure is a reservoir of both pathogenic and antibiotic-resistant bacteria (Udikovic-Kolic et al., 2014).

 Here, our main objective was to investigate the factors influencing coalescence asymmetry between soil- and manure-borne microbial communities. For this purpose, we used a comprehensive approach to explicitly quantify the importance of the soil abiotic and biotic factors during coalescence events involving two different amounts of manure added at varying frequencies and nine soils differing in their physico-chemical properties as well as land use history. To avoid transient effects of manure application on microbial communities, we monitored changes in bacterial and fungal communities after 60 and 180 days. We hypothesized that the relative contributions of biotic and abiotic soil factors to the outcome of coalescence events between native soil microbial communities and invading manure microbial communities would be modulated by the mixing ratio (i.e., manure amount) and by the frequency of coalescence between soil and manure. Specifically, we hypothesized that the importance of biotic factors should increase when the frequency of coalescence events is higher as repeated manure application may generate a legacy effect that influences future invasion attempts (Mallon et al., 2018). To test our hypothesis, we analyzed manure and soil physico-chemical properties and sequenced both bacterial and fungal communities. Our findings indicate that manure application treatment can have a major impact on the outcome of coalescence events between complex microbial communities and that the interaction effect between the abiotic and biotic soil properties increases with the amount of manure added.

- **2. Materials and methods**
- *2.1 Soil sampling*

 Soil samples were collected in 2018 from five agricultural fields and four adjacent uncultivated grasslands across China and classified as black soil, fluvo-aquic soil, desert saline soil, red soil, or coastal saline soil. At each site, samples were collected from the uppermost 20 cm of the soil by the S-shaped sampling method in 50-m interval 155 and immediately sieved (< 5 mm). The details of the sampling sites and soil physico-156 chemical properties are indicated in Table S1.

157

158 *2.2 Laboratory-controlled mesocosm experimental design*

159 Soil mesocosms were established by filling PVC containers (35 cm length \times 25 cm 160 width \times 25 cm depth) with 5 kg sieved soil samples following a completely randomized 161 design. The experiment was conducted in triplicate with five manure application 162 regimes: nonamended soil mesocosms used as controls (CS); 6.60 g kg⁻¹ manure added 163 in one application at day 0 (1M1) or in three equal applications at days 0, 60 and 120 (1M3; 2.20 g kg⁻¹ manure each time); or 19.80 g kg⁻¹ manure added in one application at day 0 (3M1) or in three equal applications at days 0, 60 and 120 (3M3; 6.60 g kg⁻¹ 165 166 manure each time). The manure was added by mixing it with soil, and the amounts of 167 manure added were based on traditional fertilization regimes in China, which ranged 168 between 15 and 45 t ha⁻¹ (Li et al., 2009). The manure was a thermal-composted cattle 169 dung, which was provided by the Nanjing Institute of Vegetable and Flower Sciences, 170 China. The manure contained 205.14 g kg^{-1} total organic carbon (C), 14.25 g kg^{-1} total 171 nitrogen (N), 17.02 g kg⁻¹ total phosphorus (P), 27.04 g kg⁻¹ total potassium (K), 293.28 172 mg kg⁻¹ ammonium nitrogen (NH₄⁺-N) and 31.43 mg kg⁻¹ nitrate nitrogen (NO₃⁻⁻-N) 173 and had a pH of 7.4 and an electrical conductivity (EC) of 2.09 ms cm⁻¹. All mesocosms 174 were then incubated at 25°C under sterile conditions and maintained at 60% of their 175 water holding capacity in the dark for 180 days. All mesocosms were non-destructively 176 sampled to a depth of 20 cm using a ∞ 5-cm soil corer after 60 and 180 days (i.e., 60 days after the first and last fertilization treatment) to avoid transient effects of manure application on microbial communities. Each soil sample as well as the manure sample were split into two subsamples. The first subsample was stored at 4°C and used to determine soil physico-chemical properties, and the second was stored at -80°C and used for soil DNA extraction.

2.3 Soil and manure physico-chemical analyses

 pH and EC were measured using a digital pH meter. Total C and total N were measured by combustion using a Sercon SL C/N elemental analyser. Total P and total K were quantified by the molybdenum blue method and by using a flame photometer, 187 respectively (Jackson, 1973). NH₄⁺-N and NO₃⁻-N were measured using a continuous- flow stream autoanalyzer (SEAL-AA3, Norderstedt, Germany). Soil basal respiration 189 was estimated by determining the $CO₂$ release using gas chromatography after soil incubation (equivalent to 5 g dry soil) at 25°C for 12 h. Soil texture was assessed according to the protocol provided by Gee and Bauder (1986). Soil microbial biomass C, N, and P were determined using the chloroform fumigation extraction method (Brookes et al., 1982; Brookes et al., 1985; Vance et al., 1987).

2.4 DNA extraction, PCR amplification and sequencing

DNA was extracted from 250 mg of soil or of manure from the 273 collected samples

197 using the E.Z.N.A.[®] Soil DNA Isolation Kit (Omega Bio-Tek, Inc., Norcross, GA, USA)

according to the manufacturer's instructions. Amplicon libraries of all 273 DNA

 sequences, as well as the metagenomic analysis, are described in Supplemental Methods.

 16S rRNA gene sequences have been deposited in the NCBI SRA database under the BioProject PRJNA784282. ITS rRNA gene sequences have been deposited in the NCBI SRA database under the BioProject PRJNA784364. Metagenome- assemble genome sequences have been deposited in the NCBI SRA database under the BioProject PRJNA868803.

2.5 Statistical analysis

 Statistical analyses were conducted using R statistical software version 3.6.1 (R Core Team, 2019). Principal coordinates analysis was performed to evaluate the differences in microbial taxonomic composition based on the Bray–Curtis dissimilarity matrix. The effect of soil type, land use history, manure application amount and frequency were tested using a multiple–way permutational multivariate analysis of variance (PERMANOVA) with 999 permutations using the *vegan* R package (Anderson, 2001). Differences in microbial diversity indices, proportion of manure-borne microorganisms, and Mean Nearest Taxon Distance (MNTD) between microbial communities in the manure treatments and those in the added manure across soils were tested by ANOVA followed by Tukey's honestly significant difference (HSD) test. Spearman's rank correlation was calculated to assess the relationships between the proportion of manure- borne microorganisms in the different treatments after 180 days of incubation and each biodiversity index estimated in the control soils. All *P* values were subsequently adjusted by false-discovery rate (FDR) (Benjamini and Yekutieli, 2001). Normality and

 homogeneity of the residuals were tested, and log-transformations were performed when necessary.

 To estimate the proportion of soil- and manure-borne bacteria and fungi in the coalesced community at days 60 and 180, the Bayesian algorithm-based program SourceTracker (version 0.9.1) was used with default parameters (Knights et al., 2011). Using mineral fertilization treatments (performed in parallel to the manure treatments on the same soils; data not shown), as negative controls for the source tracking analysis, we found average false positive rates of 0.08% and 0.01% for the bacterial and fungal community, respectively. Differential abundance analysis was performed between each treatment and the control soil after 180 days of incubation using the negative binomial generalized linear model in the *DESeq2* R package, with FDR adjusted *P* values < 0.01 (Love et al., 2014). As zero counts in sequencing datasets may inflate the number of false positives, low-abundance operational taxonomic units (OTUs) among manure treatments were filtered out before DESeq2 analysis, keeping OTUs representing over 0.05% (Romdhane et al., 2022; Huet et al., 2023). Maximum likelihood-based phylogenetic trees of significantly increased OTUs relative to the control soils were built using the GTR model with default parameters in FastTree (version 2.1.11) (Price et al., 2010) and visualized using Interactive Tree of Life (iTOL) (Letunic and Bork, 2007). Metagenome-assemble genomes corresponding to the OTUs that were significantly increased in most soils after manure addition were identified using the 263 BLASTn algorithm.

To determine the drivers of both bacterial and fungal community coalescence

 after 180 days of incubation, variance partitioning was performed based on partial regression analysis. We used the estimated proportion of manure-borne bacteria or fungi as a proxy for the outcome of community coalescence. Before analysis, all predictors were standardized to Z scores, with a mean of 0 and a standard deviation of 1 (Gelman, 2009). To limit the potential problems caused by multicollinearity and overfitting on model performance, the numbers of abiotic (i.e., climate conditions – mean annual temperature and precipitation as well as precipitation seasonality, soil textural composition, differences in pH, in EC, in C:N ratio, and in nutrients between the control soil and the added manure) and biotic (i.e., soil microbial basal respiration, biomass, diversity indices and the phylogenetic relatedness between microbial communities in the control soil and the added manure) variables were reduced by principal components analysis (PCA), respectively (Jolliffe and Cadima, 2016). A fivefold cross-validated elastic net regression model with 999 replicates was then conducted to assess the pure and interacting effects of the abiotic and biotic factors (Hans, 2011).

3. Results

3.1 Changes in soil microbial communities under different manure treatments

We identified 77,038 OTUs assigned to 42 phyla for bacterial communities and 8,413

OTUs assigned to 7 phyla for fungal communities. After 180 days, the bacterial

- communities in the manure-amended soils were dominated by Proteobacteria (35.66%)
- and Actinobacteria (18.58%), while the dominant phylum in the fungal community was
- Ascomycota (75.81%) (Fig. 1A and 1B). In contrast, Chloroflexi (34.28%) and

 Actinobacteria (29.69%) were the main bacterial phyla in the manure, while the fungal community was also dominated by Ascomycota (85.35%) (Figs. 1C). The amount or frequency of manure application had weak or no effects on bacterial diversity but all 290 indices were significantly affected by the interaction among soil type \times amount \times frequency of manure application (Table S2). Thus, most bacterial diversity indices were higher in the manure treatments for the desert saline soils, the red soils, and the coastal saline soils (Tukey's HSD test, *P* < 0.05). For example, bacterial richness increased from 9.61% to 27.43% across soils after manure applications (Fig. S1). In contrast, a considerable decrease in fungal diversity was observed in the uncultivated desert saline 296 soil for the 3M3 treatment (Tukey's HSD test, $P < 0.05$) (Figs. S2). Manure amount, 297 rather than application frequency, also affected fungal α -diversity indices, except for inverse Simpson's index after 180 days (Table S2).

 As expected, the largest differences in microbial community composition after 180 days were explained by the soil type alone and by the soil type in interaction with the land use (Fig. 2; Table S3). A lower but significant effect of manure amount and, to a lesser extent, manure frequency, was also observed on both the bacterial and the fungal community composition (Fig. 2; Table S3). However, manure applications caused greater shifts in the composition of the bacterial community (PERMANOVA, $R^2 = 0.04$, $P = 0.02$) than in that of the fungal community (PERMANOVA, $R^2 = 0.03$, $P = 0.65$) across nine soils (Fig. 2; Table S3). MNTD calculations showed that the microbial communities in the manure-amended soils were more phylogenetically related to the manure-borne communities than to the control soil communities, and stronger effects were observed in uncultivated soils than in cultivated soils (ANOVA, *F* = 785.28, *P* < 0.001 for bacteria; *F* = 175.28, *P* < 0.001 for fungi) (Table S4). In six of nine soil types, lower MNTD values were observed between bacterial communities in the manure-amended soils and in the manure for the high-manure amount treatments (3M1 and 3M3) compared to the low-manure amount treatments (1M1 and 1M3) (ANOVA, *F* = 434.61, *P* < 0.001 for bacteria) (Fig. S3; Table S4).

3.2 Proportion of manure-borne microorganisms in fertilized soils

 Large differences in the estimated proportions of bacteria and fungi originating from soil or manure were observed in the manure-amended soils. Estimates of the proportions of manure-borne bacterial and fungal populations were 0.35–30.94% (7.33% on average) and 0.01–57.27% (2.95% on average), respectively, across soils and manure applications (Fig. 3). Overall, the highest proportions of manure-borne bacteria and fungi were observed in the uncultivated desert saline soil and coastal saline soil, respectively, regardless of the manure treatment (Fig. 3).

 Both manure application regimes had a significant effect on the proportion of manure-borne bacteria and fungi. However, manure amount had a stronger effect than application frequency on the bacterial community (ANOVA, *F* = 662.36, *P* < 0.001 and $F = 38.33$, $P < 0.001$, respectively) and, to a lesser extent, on the fungal community (ANOVA, *F* = 63.62, *P* < 0.001 and *F* = 59.23, *P* < 0.001, respectively) (Table S5). Venn diagrams validated the strong effect of manure amount on the bacterial community, with the applied manure sharing double the number of OTUs with the 3M1 and 3M3

 treatments (234 and 253 OTUs, respectively) than with the 1M1 and 1M3 treatments (119 and 113 OTUs, respectively) after 180 days(Fig. S4A). In contrast, no clear pattern was observed for the fungal community (Fig. S4B).

 3.3 Identification of OTUs increasing in relative abundance after manure application Overall, a significant effect of manure amount (ANOVA, *F* = 5.49, *P* = 0.03) but not of application frequency was observed with the application of a high amount of manure resulting in increased relative abundances of more bacterial OTUs in the uncultivated than in the cultivated soils after 180 days (Table S6; Table S7). We found a lower proportion of OTUs increasing in relative abundance after manure fertilization for the fungal communities (6.21% on average) than for the bacterial communities (18.71% on average) in most soil types, which also reflects the larger shifts in bacterial than in fungal communities after manure application (Table S7). Unlike the bacterial community, the number of increasing fungal OTUs after manure application was not affected by the amount and frequency of manure applications across soils (ANOVA, *F* 346 = 0.75, *P* = 0.39 for the amount, and $F = 0.05$, $P = 0.82$ for the frequency) (Table S6). The iTOLs showed the phylogenetic relationships and distribution of the OTUs present in the soil or in the added manure that exhibited significantly higher relative abundance in manure amended soils (Fig. 4). The bacterial OTUs that significant increases in relative abundance were dominated by Proteobacteria (39.28%), Actinobacteria (13.78%), and Chloroflexi (9.05%) (Fig. 4A), while the fungal OTUs

were dominated by Ascomycota (67.02%) (Fig. 4B). The relative abundances of 11

 bacterial and 1 fungal OTUs increased significantly in at least seven different soils after application of a high amount of manure while 10 of these OTUs were not detected in 70% of the control soils (Fig. 4; Fig. S5).

 For further insights into the genetic traits of these OTUs, we performed a metagenomic analysis of the manure samples in which their relative abundance was up to 6%. We identified 1 of the 46 metagenome-assembled genomes affiliated to the *Cytophaga*, which exhibited 100% identity to OTU 128 (Fig. S6). Analysis of the functional potential of this metagenome-assembled genome revealed not less than 8 antibiotic-resistance genes such as daptomycin, tetracycline, fluoroquinolone (Table 1).

3.4 Drivers of coalescence asymmetry

 The proportion of manure-borne microorganisms in the amended soils was used as a proxy for coalescence asymmetry. First, we explored the relationships between the estimated proportion of manure-borne microorganisms in the different manure treatments and the diversity of the resident soil microbial community. After 180 days, the proportion of manure-borne bacteria was significantly negatively correlated with richness, the Shannon index, the inverse Simpson index, and Faith's phylogenetic diversity of the control soil regardless of the manure treatment (Fig. 5A and S7A). In contrast, the proportion of manure-borne fungi was not correlated with soil fungal diversity indices, except for the richness in the 1M1 and 1M3 treatments (Fig. 5B and S7B). An effect of manure application frequency was also observed for the relationships between the proportions of manure-borne fungi and, to a lesser extent, of manure-borne bacteria and the MNTD of microbial communities in the control soils and in the added manure (*P* < 0.05) (Fig. 5).

in the 1M1 and 1M3 treatments, respectively (Fig. 6A).

4. Discussion

 Overall, manure fertilization resulted in shifts in the diversity and composition of the soil microbiome, depending on the soil type and land use history. Thus, we observed that manure application had a greater effect on the coalescence outcome in uncultivated soils than in the cultivated ones (Figs. 3 and S3). This difference could be due to lower resource availability in uncultivated soils, given that the addition of nutrient-rich manure can both facilitate the invasion success of the manure-borne microorganisms and stimulate the native soil microbial community (Feng et al., 2015; Mallon et al., 2015a). We also found that manure application affects the bacterial communities more than the fungal communities (Fig. 2). This finding supports previous studies showing that bacterial communities are more affected by organic fertilizers, whereas fungal communities exhibit stronger responses to mineral fertilizers (Pan et al., 2020).

 4.1 The amount and frequency of manure application both influence microbial community coalescence

 Supporting our hypothesis, the coalescence outcome depended on both the mixing ratio and frequency of application with the bacterial communitiesin the manure- amended soils and in the added manure being more similar under high manure amounts and application frequencies(Figs. 2 and S3). This finding was consistent with the higher proportions of manure-borne microorganisms in two-thirds of the soils fertilized with a high amount of manure (Fig 3). These higher proportions of manure-borne microorganisms were likely due to a mass effect, wherein a large number of microorganisms was transferred along with the manure, their "home" habitat, which favored their survival (Fukami, 2015; Svoboda et al., 2018). While most previous studies addressing the impact of microbial invaders on soil communities were conducted within 3 months (Mawarda et al., 2020), our findings indicate that the effect of manure addition on the soil microbial community can last longer with manure-borne bacteria and fungi being capable of surviving at least 6 months in soil. Furthermore, the estimated proportions of manure-borne bacteria were greater than 10% in half of the tested soils, suggesting that their survival might be more widespread and ecologically important for the spread of pathogens and antibiotic-resistance genes than previously thought (Yang et al., 2022).

 Differential abundance analysis enabled the identification of OTUs with higher relative abundances in the coalesced microbial communities compared to control soils (Fig. 4). Due to limitations related to the sequencing depth and the use of partial 16S rRNA gene sequences to identify OTUs in the different treatments, it is difficult to decipher whether these OTUs corresponded to resident soil microorganisms whose relative abundances increased due to shifts in biotic and abiotic factors or to manure- borne microorganisms that survived in soil. However, we identified ten OTUs detected in the manure but not in most soils that were significantly increasing in relative abundances after the addition of a high amount of manure in seven different soils. This result suggests that these ten OTUs not only originated from the added manure but also had a high invasiveness capacity allowing them to survive in disparate soils. Elucidating the exact mechanisms driving higher invasiveness is difficult, as microbiologists are only beginning to understand the myriad of interactions occurring between microorganisms in complex environments (Hibbing et al., 2010; Romdhane et al., 2022). However, analyzing the genetic potential of a metagenome-assembled genome that was taxonomically related to one of these ten OTUs revealed the presence of several antibiotic-resistance genes (Table 1; Fig. S6). As antibiotics are naturally produced by soil bacteria as a competitive mechanism and are also present at high concentrations in cattle manure (Xie et al., 2016), antibiotic resistance may confer a competitive advantage to manure-borne bacteria therefore contributing to their invasiveness (Hibbing et al., 2010). Moreover, the presence of several antibiotic-resistance genes in the metagenome-assembled genome supports previous studies highlighting the role of manure fertilizer in the spread of antibiotic-resistant bacteria in the environment (Larsson and Flach, 2022).

 4.2 Coalescence asymmetry is driven by both biotic and abiotic factors for bacteria, but primarily by abiotic factor for fungi

 Ecological theory predicts that resident microbial diversity is a key factor controlling the extent to which invaders can establish (Mallon et al., 2015b; Van Elsas et al., 2012). Accordingly, we found that both the richness and phylogenetic diversity of soil bacteria were negatively correlated with the estimated proportions of manure- borne bacteria in the different treatments (Fig. 5 and S7). Our findings therefore support the diversity resistance hypothesis, which proposes that more diverse communities act as a biological barrier to invasion due to higher interference and resource competition (Tilman, 2004; Van Elsas et al., 2012). The phylogenetic relatedness between invaders and the resident community was shown either to hamper invasion due to niche overlap or to facilitate invasion due to pre-adaption (Gravuer and Scow, 2021). Here we identified weak but significant positive correlations between the phylogenetic distance of the added manure and resident fungal communities and the percentage of manure- borne fungi only at a high manure application frequency (Fig. 5B). This finding suggests that niche overlap might be important for manure-borne fungi survival only when manure application occurs frequently.

 Using the estimated proportion of manure-borne microorganisms in a variance partitioning analysis, we provide insights into coalescence asymmetry. To our knowledge, this is the first study to comprehensively assess the relative importance of abiotic and biotic soil factors in driving the coalescence outcome after manure application across different soil types, land use history and microbial domains. We found that abiotic and biotic factors explained between 56% and 82% of the variability in coalescence asymmetry between manure-borne and resident microorganisms (Fig. 6). Abiotic and biotic factors were both important in modulating bacterial community coalescence, whereas abiotic factors were more important for fungal community coalescence. Accordingly, recent studies have revealed the key role of biotic interactions between soil bacteria, but studies focusing on fungal communities remain limited (Huet et al. 2023; Kehe et al. 2021; Palmer et al. 2022). The asymmetric outcome of microbial community coalescence was affected by changes in the manure amount with increased importance of the interaction effects between biotic and abiotic

 factors under application of high manure amount. However, our analysis also showed that increasing the manure amount had the opposite effect on the contribution of abiotic factors to the proportion of manure-borne bacteria and fungi (Fig 6). This result adds support to previous studies highlighting the role of resource availability in modulating the interactions between invaders and resident communities (Mallon et al., 2015a; Yang et al., 2017). Moreover, manure application frequency strongly influenced the proportion of manure-borne bacteria, with the interaction between biotic and abiotic factors becoming increasingly important with higher mixing frequency. Accordingly, a previous study showed that frequent invasion events can create a legacy in the niche structure of the resident bacterial community that facilitates the survival of the subsequent bacterial invaders (Mallon, et al., 2018). Therefore, our results suggest that legacy effects caused by invaders and by habitat disturbances due to the repeated addition of resources and antibiotics might act synergistically on the survival of manure-borne microorganisms.

5. Conclusions

 Our findings provide new insights into the role of abiotic and biotic factors in modulating the outcome of coalescence events between manure-borne and resident soil microbial communities under different manure fertilization regimes. We demonstrated that the outcome of coalescence was more affected by the manure fertilization regime for the bacterial than for the fungal community. Differences in the survival of manure-borne microorganisms were better explained by both abiotic and biotic factors for

- microbial biomass nitrogen in soil. Soil Biol. Biochem. 17, 837-842. https://doi.org/10.1016/0038-0717(85)90144-0
- Chen, Q.L., An, X.L., Li, H., Zhu, Y.G., Su, J.Q., Cui, L., 2017. Do manure-borne or
- indigenous soil microorganisms influence the spread of antibiotic resistance
- genes in manured soil? Soil Biol. Biochem. 114, 229–237. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2017.07.022
- Darwin, C., 1895. On the Origin of Species*.* John Murray Press, London. https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511694295
- Elton, C.S., 1958*.* The ecology of invasions by animals and plants. Springer Press, New York. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4899-7214-9
- FAO, 2019. FAOSTAT*.* [http://www.fao.org/faostat/en/#data/EMN/.](http://www.fao.org/faostat/en/#data/EMN/)
- Feng, Y., Chen, R., Hu, J., Zhao, F., Wang, J., Chu, H., Zhang, J., Dolfing, J., Lin, X., 2015. *Bacillus asahii* comes to the fore in organic manure fertilized alkaline soils. Soil Biol. Biochem. 81, 186-194.
- https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2014.11.021
- Feng, Y., Delgado-Baquerizo, M., Zhu, Y., Han, X., Han, X., Xin, X., Li, W., Guo, Z.,
- Dang, T., Li, C., Zhu, B., Cai, Z., Li, D., Zhang, J., 2022. Responses of Soil
- Bacterial Diversity to Fertilization are Driven by Local Environmental Context
- 591 Across China. Engineering 12, 164-170. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eng.2021.09.012
- Fierer, N., Bradford, M.A., Jackson, R.B., 2007. Toward an ecological classification of soil bacteria. Ecology 88, 1354–1364. https://doi.org/10.1890/05-1839

- Environment 1, 54. www.scholink.org/ojs/index.php/se
- Hibbing, M.E., Fuqua, C., Parsek, M.R., Peterson, S.B., 2010. Bacterial competition:
- surviving and thriving in the microbial jungle. Nat. Rev. Microbiol. 8, 15-25. https://doi.org/10.1038/nrmicro2259
- Huet, S., Romdhane, S., Breuil, M., Bru, D., Mounier, A., Spor, A., Philippot, L., 2023.
- Experimental community coalescence sheds light on microbial interactions in soil and restores impaired functions. Microbiome 11, 42. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40168-023-01480-7
- Jackson, M.L., 1973. Soil chemical analysis. Prentice Hall Press, New Delhi. https://www.scirp.org/reference/ReferencesPapers?ReferenceID=1453838
- Johansson, M., Emmoth, E., Salomonsson, A.C., Albihn, A., 2005. Potential risks when spreading anaerobic digestion residues on grass silage crops – survival of bacteria, moulds and viruses. Grass Forage Sci. 60, 175–185. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2494.2005.00466.x
- Jolliffe, I.T., Cadima, J., 2016. Principal component analysis: a review and recent developments. Philos. Trans. Royal Soc. A 374, 20150202. https://doi.org/10.1098/rsta.2015.0202
- Karami, A., Homaee, M., Afzalinia, S., Ruhipour, H., Basirat, S., 2012. Organic resource management: Impacts on soil aggregate stability and other soil physico-chemical properties. Agric. Ecosyst. Environ. 148, 22–28. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2011.10.021
- Kehe, J., Ortiz, A., Kulesa, A., Gore, J., Blainey, P.C., Friedman, J., 2021. Positive
- interactions are common among culturable bacteria. Sci. Adv. 7, eabi7159. https://doi.org/10.1126/sciadv.abi7159
- Klindworth, A., Pruesse, E., Schweer, T., Peplies, J., Quast, C., Horn, M., Glöckner,
- F.O., 2013. Evaluation of general 16S ribosomal RNA gene PCR primers for classical and next-generation sequencing-based diversity studies. Nucleic Acids
- Res. 41, e1. https://doi.org/10.1093/nar/gks808
- Knights, D., Kuczynski, J., Charlson, E.S., Zaneveld, J., Mozer, M.C., Collman, R.G.,
- Bushman, F.D., Knight, R., Kelley, S.T., 2011. Bayesian community-wide
- culture-independent microbial source tracking. Nat. Methods 8, 761–763. https://doi.org/10.1038/nmeth.1650
- Larsson, D.G.J., Flach, C.F., 2022. Antibiotic resistence in the environment. Nat. Rev. Microbiol. 20, 257-269. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41579-021-00649-x
- Letunic, I., Bork, P., 2007. Interactive Tree Of Life (iTOL): an online tool for phylogenetic tree display and annotation. Bioinformatics 23, 127–128. https://doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btl529
- Li, S.P., Jia, P., Fan, S.Y., Wu, Y., Liu, X., Meng, Y., Li, Y., Shu, W.S., Li, J.T., Jiang,
- L., 2022. Functional traits explain the consistent resistance of biodiversity to plant invasion under nitrogen enrichment. Ecol. Lett. 25, 778-789. https://doi.org/10.1111/ele.13951
- Li, S.X., Wang, Z.H., Hu, T.T., Gao, Y.J., Stewart, B.A., 2009. Chapter 3 Nitrogen in dryland soils of China and its management. Adv. Agron. 101, 123-181. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0065-2113(08)00803-1

- Lourenco, K.S., Suleiman, A.K.A., Pijl, A., Van Veen, J.A., Cantarella, H., Kuramae, E.E., 2018. Resilience of the resident soil microbiome to organic and inorganic
- amendment disturbances and to temporary bacterial invasion. Microbiome 6, 142. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40168-018-0525-1
- Love, M.I., Huber, W., Anders, S., 2014. Moderated estimation of fold change and dispersion for RNA-seq data with DESeq2. Genome Biol. 15, 550. https://doi.org/10.1186/s13059-014-0550-8
- Ma, C., Liu, M., Wang, H., Chen, C., Fan, W., Griffiths, B., Li, H., 2015. Resource utilization capability of bacteria predicts their invasion potential in soil. Soil Biol. Biochem. 81, 287-290. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2014.11.025
- Maillard, E., Angers, D.A., 2014. Animal manure application and soil organic carbon
- stocks: a meta-analysis. Global Change Biol. 20, 666–79. https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12438
- Mallon, C.A., Poly, F., Le Roux, X., Marring, I., Van Elsas, J.D., Salles, J.F., 2015a. Resource pulses can alleviate the biodiversity-invasion relationship in soil microbial communities. Ecology 96, 915–926. https://doi.org/10.1890/14- 1001.1
- Mallon, C.A., Elsas, J.D.V., Salles, J.F., 2015b. Microbial invasions: the process, patterns, and mechanisms. Trends Microbiol. 23, 719–729.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tim.2015.07.013

- Mallon, C.A., Le Roux, X., van Doorn, G.S., Dini-Andreote, F., Poly, F., Salles J.F.,
- 2018. The impact of failure: unsuccessful bacterial invasions steer the soil microbial community away from the invader's niche. ISME J. 12, 728–741. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41396-017-0003-y
- Mawarda, P.C., Le Roux, X., Van Elsas, J.D., Salles, J.F., 2020. Deliberate introduction of invisible invaders: A critical appraisal of the impact of microbial inoculants on soil microbial communities. Soil Biol. Biochem. 148, 107874. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2020.107874
- Palmer, J.D., Foster, K.R., 2022. Bacterial species rarely work together. Science 376, 581-582. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abn5093
- Pan, H., Chen, M., Feng, H., Wei, M., Song, F., Lou, Y., Cui, X., Wang, H., Zhuge Y.,
- 2020. Organic and inorganic fertilizers respectively drive bacterial and fungal community compositions in a fluvo-aquic soil in northern China. Soil Till. Res. 198, 104540. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.still.2019.104540
- Pettay, D.T., Wham, D.C., Smith, R.T., Iglesias-Prieto, R., LaJeunesse, T.C., 2015.
- Microbial invasion of the Caribbean by an Indo-Pacific coral zooxanthella. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 112, 7513-7518. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1502283112
- Pérez-Valera, E., Kyselková, M., Ahmed, E., Sladecek, F.X.J., Goberna, M., Elhottová, D., 2019. Native soil microorganisms hinder the soil enrichment with antibiotic resistance genes following manure applications. Sci. Rep. 9, 6760.

https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-019-42734-5

Price, M.N., Dehal, P.S., Arkin, A.P., 2010. FastTree 2–approximately maximum-

likelihood trees for large alignments. PLoS One 5, e9490. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0009490

- R Core Team, 2019. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R
- Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna. [https://www.R-project.org.](https://www.r-project.org/)
- Ramoneda, J., Le Roux, J., Stadelmann, S., Frossard, E., Frey, B., Gamper, H.A., 2021.
- Soil microbial community coalescence and fertilization interact to drive the
- functioning of the legume-rhizobium symbiosis. J. Appl. Ecol. 58, 2590-2602.
- https://doi.org/10.1111/1365-2664.13995
- Ren, F., Sun, N., Xu, M., Zhang, X., Wu, L., Xu, M., 2019. Changes in soil microbial
- biomass with manure application in cropping systems: A meta-analysis. Soil Till.

Res. 194, 104291. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.still.2019.06.008

- Rillig, M.C., Antonovics, J., Caruso, T., Lehmann, A., Powell, J.R., Veresoglou, S.D.,
- Verbruggen, E., 2015. Interchange of entire communities: microbial community
- coalescence. Trends Ecol. Evol. 30, 470–476. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tree.2015.06.004
-
- Rillig, M.C., Lehmann, A., Aguilar-Trigueros, C.A., Antonovics, J., Caruso, T., Hempel,
- S., Lehmann, J., Valyi, K., Verbruggen, E., Veresoglou, S.D., Powell, J.R., 2016.
- Soil microbes and community coalescence. Pedobiologia 59, 37–40. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pedobi.2016.01.001
- Romdhane, S., Spor, A., Aubert, J., Bru, D., Breuil, M.C., Hallin, S., Mounier, A.,

- https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2016.10.044
- Yang, T., Wei, Z., Friman, V.P., Xu, Y., Shen, Q., Kowalchuk, G.A., Jousset, A., 2017.
- Resource availability modulates biodiversity-invasion relationships by altering competitive interactions. Environ. Microbiol. 19, 2984–2991. https://doi.org/10.1111/1462-2920.13708
- Yang, Y., Li, G., Min, K., Liu, T., Li, C., Xu, J., Hu, F., Li, H., 2022. The potential role of fertilizer-derived exogenous bacteria on soil bacterial community assemblage and network formation. Chemosphere 287, 132338. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2021.132338
- Zhang, Y., Hao, X., Alexander, T.W., Thomas, B.W., Shi, X., Lupwayi, N.Z., 2017.
- Long-term and legacy effects of manure application on soil microbial community composition. Biol. Fertil. Soils 54, 269–283. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00374-017-1257-2
-

785 **Table**

786 **Table 1** Descriptions of key antibiotic resistance gene types identified in MAG.86.

787

Figure legends

 Figure 1 Phylum-level bacterial and fungal community composition. Mean relative 791 abundances of (A) bacterial and (B) fungal phyla for each treatment ($n = 3$) in nine 792 types of soils at day 180, and (C) the added manure $(n = 3)$ at day 0. CS refers to control soil; 1M1 and 1M3 refer to soils with a lower amount of manure in one application and in three equal applications, respectively; 3M1 and 3M3 refer to soils with a higher amount of manure in one application and in three equal applications, respectively.

 Fig. 2. Shifts in the composition of the microbial community related to manure application. Principal coordinates analysis of (A) bacterial and (B) fungal communities based on Bray-Curtis distance matrices showing differences in the microbial composition among treatments in nine types of soils after 60 (unfilled symbols) and 180 days (filled symbols) of incubation, as well as in the added manure. Each dot represents the geometric center of the three replicates. The different treatments and soils are represented by different shapes and colours, respectively, as specified in the legend. (C) Bray-Curtis distance between each treatment and the added manure. Different letters indicate significant differences among treatments in each panel (Tukey's HSD 806 test, $P < 0.05$). n.s. indicates no significant difference among treatments (Tukey's HSD 807 test, $P > 0.05$). The error bar in each column represents variability of corresponding dataset.

Fig. 3. Proportion of manure-borne microorganisms in the different manure-

 amended soils. Proportions of the microbial sources in the different soils after manure application as predicted by SourceTracker. Stack bar plots represent the proportions of 813 each source (added manure = red, soil = brown, and unknown = grey) for (A) bacterial and (B) fungal communities at days 60 and 180 of incubation. Values are represented 815 as the mean $(n = 3)$. Different letters indicate proportions significantly different among 816 soil types (Tukey's HSD test, $P < 0.05$).

 Fig. 4. Phylogenetic relationships and distribution of the OTUs positively affected by manure addition. Distribution of the (A) 718 bacterial OTUs and (B) 188 fungal OTUs with a significant increase in relative abundance in the manure treatments 821 compared to the control soil as calculated by DESeq2 analysis in all treatments at day 822 180 of incubation. The colours of each OTU in the inner ring represent the sources in which the OTUs are detected. The affiliation of OTUs at the phylum level is indicated by different colours on the second ring. The outer rings around the tree represent different treatments. Node size represents the number of soils in which the OTUs are exhibiting significantly higher relative abundances after manure applications. Venn diagram showing the shared and unique OTUs among treatments in each iTOL are included in each panel.

 Fig. 5. Relationships between manure-borne microbial proportions and soil microbial diversity as well as Mean Nearest Taxon Distance (MNTD) of the soil and manure communities. The relationships between the proportions of (A) manure-

 borne bacteria or (B) manure-borne fungi and Shannon index or the MNTD of control 834 soil (CS) and the added manure. $n = 27$ for each treatment. Statistical analysis was 835 performed using Spearman's rank correlation; the adjusted R^2 values and false-discovery rate adjusted *P* values are also inserted in each panel.

 Fig. 6. Variance partitioning analysis showing the effects of abiotic and biotic factors on the outcomes of microbial community coalescence. The proportions of manure-borne bacteria and fungi are used as proxies of the coalescence outcomes for (A) bacteria and (B) fungal communities. The abiotic factors include three principal components explaining of climate variables; soil textural composition; and the 843 differences in EC, in pH, in nutrients, and in C:N ratio between each control soil and the added manure. The biotic factors include three principal components of soil 845 microbial respiration, microbial biomass C, N, and P, biodiversity indices, and the Mean Nearest Taxon Distance of each control soil and the added manure. Numbers indicate the percentage of variations in the community coalescence. The proportion of variance of each principal component is also inserted in each panel. The relationship between the coalescence outcome and each principal component is performed by ordinary least squares linear regression, and the *P* values were adjusted by false-discovery rate. * 851 significant at 5% level of significance; ** significant at 1% level of significance; *** significant at 0.1% level of significance.

Fig. 3

Fig. 5

