What is the current state of green farming? Logics of diversification and implications for transition

Stéphane Bellon, Guillaume Ollivier

Stéphane Bellon & G. Ollivier
stephane.bellon@ Inrae.fr
Researchers
INRAE / France

Agroecology Scientific Days 2024
Workshop 2, Session 1

What is the current state of green farming? Logics of diversification and implications for transition

More than 10 years ago, we highlighted the paradigmatic and institutional dynamics of the emergence and development of various proposals for ecologised agriculture in academia and beyond (Ollivier and Bellon, 2013). Since then, agroecology, 'climate-smart agriculture', regenerative agriculture and digital agriculture have all been added to the already rich landscape of these proposals (sustainable agriculture, organic agriculture, precision agriculture, etc.).

Our aim is to show and understand the diversification dynamics of ecological farming. On the one hand, what is it the product of? We will show that the social mechanisms of appropriation, redifferentiation and even capture (Giraldo and Rosset, 2017; Lamine *et al.*, 2019) continually generate new proposals and reclassifications of existing forms, announcing environmental or social improvements (Bellon and Ollivier, 2018). These ecologised agricultures refer to differentiated framings of problems and solutions (Therond *et al.*, 2017). For example, the 'soil is the key to everything' narrative or investment in robotics obscures certain compartments of the socio-eco-technological system, favours different associated environments (Simondon, 1989) and builds new path dependencies. The diversity of forms of ecologised agriculture thus reveals preferential attachments to social actors, strategies of distinction (Ollivier and Bellon, 2013) and distinct values (Plumecocq *et al.*, 2018).

Finally, we would like to discuss the implications of this diversity for the ecological transition of agriculture. Firstly, we are witnessing competition and controversy between forms, for example in terms of access to public support, to the market through product labelling, or to agricultural advice and expertise. This profusion also generates polysemy and even confusion among citizens, consumers, researchers and professionals, obscuring dialogue and consensus-building on the transition paths to follow.

Finally, under these conditions, the ongoing diversification of forms of agriculture forces us to devote a great deal of energy to legitimisation tests (Montenegro de Wit and Iles, 2016), and to constantly redefine the perimeter of these forms. Finally, although the *status quo* in favour of unsustainable forms of agriculture predominates, ecologised forms of agriculture have the burden of proof as to whether they are really better.

Beyond a conflicting vision, we could also think of this diversification of forms as the fruit of a co-evolution between them that leads to hybridisation allowing collective progress, as is the case for Organic Conservation Farming (ABC), for example. However, it would appear that forms of agriculture have ontological and systemic coherences that make such hybridisation difficult beyond the transfer of a few isolated practices and techniques.

References

- Bellon, S. and Ollivier, G., 2018. Institutionalizing Agroecology in France: Social Circulation Changes the Meaning of an Idea. Sustainability, 10, 1380.
- Duru, M., Sarthou, J.-P. and Therond, O., 2022. Regenerative agriculture: the height of agroecology or greenwashing? Cah. Agric. 31, 17.
- Giraldo, O.F. and Rosset, P., 2017. Agroecology as a territory in dispute: between institutionality and social movements. Journal of Peasant Studies, 48.
- Lamine, C., Niederle, P. and Ollivier, G., 2019. Alliances and controversies in the politicisation of agroecology in Brazil and France. Nature, Sciences Sociétés, 27, 6-19.
- Montenegro de Wit, M. and Iles, A., 2016. Toward thick legitimacy: Creating a web of legitimacy for agroecology. Elementa: Science of the Anthropocene, 4.
- Ollivier, G. and Bellon, S., 2013. Paradigmatic dynamics of greened agricultures in international scientific communities. Natures Sciences Sociétés, 21, 2, 166-181.
- Plumecocq, G., Debril, T., Duru, M., Magrini, M.B., Sarthou, J.P. and Therond, O., 2018. The Plurality of Values in Sustainable Agriculture Models: Diverse Lock-in and Co-Evolution Patterns. Ecology and Society, 23, 1.
- Simondon, G., 1989. Du mode d'existence des objets techniques Aubier.
- Therond, O., Duru, M., Roger-Estrade, J. and Richard, G., 2017. A new analytical framework of farming system and agriculture model diversities. A review.Agronomy for Sustainable Development, 37, 3, 21.